

Utah State University

DigitalCommons@USU

Arrington Annual Lecture

Leonard J. Arrington Mormon History Lectures

9-25-2008

Predicting the Past: The Utah War's Twenty-First Century Future

William P. MacKinnon

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.usu.edu/arrington_lecture



Part of the [History Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

MacKinnon, William P., "Predicting the Past: The Utah War's Twenty-First Century Future" (2008). *Arrington Annual Lecture*. Paper 13.

https://digitalcommons.usu.edu/arrington_lecture/13

This Lecture is brought to you for free and open access by the Leonard J. Arrington Mormon History Lectures at DigitalCommons@USU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Arrington Annual Lecture by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@USU. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@usu.edu.



LEONARD J. ARRINGTON
MORMON HISTORY LECTURE SERIES
No. 14

PREDICTING THE PAST
THE UTAH WAR'S TWENTY-FIRST
CENTURY FUTURE

by
William P. MacKinnon

September 25, 2008

Sponsored by

Special Collections & Archives
Merrill-Cazier Library
Utah State University
Logan, Utah

ARRINGTON LECTURE SERIES
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

F. Ross Peterson, Chair
Gary Anderson
Harriet Arrington
Jonathan Bullen
Richard “Skip” Christenson
Bradford Cole
Wayne Dymock
Kenneth W. Godfrey
Jill Mulvay Derr
Philip Barlow

Copyright © 2009 William P. MacKinnon

ISBN 978-0-87421-752-0 (paper)
ISBN 978-0-87421-753-7 (e-book)

Distributed by
Utah State University Press
Logan, Utah 84322-7800

Introduction

F. Ross Peterson

The establishment of a lecture series honoring a library's special collections and a donor to that collection is unique. Utah State University's Merrill-Cazier Library houses the personal and historical collection of Leonard J. Arrington, a renowned scholar of the American West. As part of Arrington's gift to the university, he requested that the university's historical collection become the focus for an annual lecture on an aspect of Mormon history. Utah State agreed to the request and in 1995 inaugurated the annual Leonard J. Arrington Mormon History Lecture.

Utah State University's Special Collections and Archives is ideally suited as the host for the lecture series. The state's land grant university began collecting records very early, and in the 1960s became a major depository for Utah and Mormon records. Leonard and his wife Grace joined the USU faculty and family in 1946, and the Arringtons and their colleagues worked to collect original diaries, journals, letters, and photographs.

Although trained as an economist at the University of North Carolina, Arrington became a Mormon historian of international repute. Working with numerous colleagues, the Twin Falls, Idaho, native produced the classic *Great Basin Kingdom: An Economic History of the Latter-day Saints* in 1958. Utilizing available collections at USU, Arrington embarked on a prolific publishing and editing career. He and his close ally, Dr. S. George Ellsworth, helped organize the Western History Association, and they created the *Western Historical Quarterly* as the scholarly voice of the WHA. While serving with Ellsworth as editor of the new journal, Arrington also helped both the Mormon History Association and the independent journal *Dialogue* get established.

One of Arrington's great talents was to encourage and inspire other scholars or writers. While he worked on biographies or institutional

histories, he employed many young scholars as researchers. He fostered many careers as well as arranged for the publication of numerous books and articles.

In 1973, Arrington accepted appointments as the official historian of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints and the Lemuel Redd Chair of Western History at Brigham Young University. More and more Arrington focused on Mormon, rather than economic, historical topics. His own career flourished with the publication of *The Mormon Experience*, co-authored with Davis Bitton, and *American Moses: A Biography of Brigham Young*. He and his staff produced many research papers and position papers for the LDS Church as well. Nevertheless, tension developed over the historical process, and Arrington chose to move full time to BYU with his entire staff. The Joseph Fielding Smith Institute of History was established, and Leonard continued to mentor new scholars as well as publish biographies. He also produced a very significant two-volume study, *The History of Idaho*.

After Grace Arrington passed away, Leonard married Harriet Horne of Salt Lake City. They made the decision to deposit the vast Arrington collection of research documents, letters, files, books, and journals at Utah State University. The Leonard J. Arrington Historical Archives is part of the university's Special Collections. The Arrington Lecture Committee works with Special Collections to sponsor the annual lecture.

About the Author

William P. MacKinnon is a historian, management consultant, and community volunteer who grew up in Schenectady, New York, and Fort Wayne, Indiana. He lives in the village of Montecito, California, in Santa Barbara County.

MacKinnon is an alumnus of the Mount Hermon (Massachusetts) School and in 1960 earned a B.A. degree magna cum laude from Yale University, where he was elected to Phi Beta Kappa. He is a past chairman of the Yale Library Associates and an associate fellow of Yale's Davenport College. In 1962 MacKinnon received an M.B.A. degree from the Harvard Graduate School of Business Administration.

As an independent historian, MacKinnon has published articles, essays, and book reviews on the American West in more than thirty journals and encyclopedias since 1963. The first volume of his two-volume study of the Utah War of 1857–1858 (*At Sword's Point*) was published in 2008 by the Arthur H. Clark Company, an imprint of the University of Oklahoma Press. MacKinnon is an honorary life member of the Utah State Historical Society and the recipient of its Dale L. Morgan Award. He is also a member of the Western History Association, the Organization of American Historians, and the Oregon-California Trails Association. MacKinnon is the president-elect of the Mormon History Association, which has honored him with its Thomas L. Kane, J. Talmage Jones, and Smith-Pettit Foundation awards.

Since 1988 MacKinnon has been president and founder of MacKinnon Associates, a strategy consulting firm providing counsel on organizational and management issues to boards, CEOs, and other senior officers. Prior to that he was a financial and human resources executive with General Motors Corporation in New York and Detroit for twenty-five years. During 1982–1987 he was vice president in charge of GM's corporate personnel administration and development staff. As a management consultant, MacKinnon has served more than seventy public and

privately-held client companies in a wide range of industries while serving on the board of several such organizations.

As a community volunteer he has been chairman of the board of Children's Hospital of Michigan and a trustee of the Detroit Medical Center as well as serving in similar capacities such educational institutions as the Birmingham, Michigan, School Board; Kettering University; the University of Virginia's Darden School; and the U.S. State Department's Overseas Schools Advisory Council.

MacKinnon served during 1962–1968 in squadrons of the New York Air National Guard following active duty with the U.S. Air Force.

PREDICTING THE PAST: The Utah War's Twenty-First Century Future

“We will pass by, for the present, the injustice, inhumanity, and exterminating spirit which gave birth to the Utah Expedition and animated it during the whole campaign. Let the past be buried, and nothing remembered in this article, excepting as it refers to the future, or embodies itself in the present.”

—Editorial, *The Latter-day Saints' Millennial Star* (Liverpool),
August 21, 1858

“The past is never dead. It's not even past.”

—Gavin Stevens in William Faulkner's *Requiem
for a Nun*, 1951

Introduction

Many of the people attending this lecture have a far greater claim to intimacy with Leonard Arrington than do I. After all, he lived in Cache Valley and taught at Utah State University for decades. Perhaps more than anywhere other than his family farm in Idaho, it was from here that our honoree drew insight and inspiration into the mysteries of Utah, Mormonism, and western agriculture. For most of my life I have been deeply immersed in some of these same subjects but at substantial geographical distance from Utah and therefore from Leonard.

On the other hand, I do claim a connection to Leonard Arrington that no other person has. The scene was thirty-six years ago late on an October night in 1972 on the nearly deserted twenty-fourth floor of a Manhattan office tower overlooking Central Park. There, in the midst of General Motors' corporate headquarters, I traded my well-worn but beloved first car—a 1961 VW Beetle—to a GM co-worker, for a prize that I coveted even more than that mustard-colored sedan: a first-edition

copy of *Great Basin Kingdom* with dust jacket, in mint condition.¹ Do you know anyone else who would do such a thing? The car, of course, is long gone, but Leonard's book is still with me—a little "tired" but nonetheless a survivor of my relocations from New York to Michigan and then to California. If that Beetle—and perhaps even General Motors itself—have not stood the test of time very well, Leonard Arrington and his reputation surely have done so. It is why we are gathered here this evening in his honor. With that thought, I proceed to my topic: "Predicting the Past: The Utah War's Twenty-First Century Future." I am going to begin with one definitional matter and then discuss briefly the state of Utah War studies today before moving on to some predictive thoughts about the future.

Terminology and Labels Matter

In terms of definitions, I want you to think about the label "Utah War." To me this phrase means the armed confrontation over power and authority during 1857–1858 between the civil-religious leadership of Utah Territory, led by Governor Brigham Young, and the administration of President James Buchanan—a conflict that pitted perhaps the nation's largest, most experienced territorial militia (the Nauvoo Legion) against an expeditionary force that ultimately grew to involve almost one-third of the U.S. Army. It was the nation's most extensive and expensive military undertaking during the period between the Mexican and Civil wars.

Some people—especially those in the East and the institutional army itself—call this conflict the Utah Expedition, the term that I first started using in 1958 while researching in Connecticut. But my 1980s collaborator, the late Professor Richard D. Poll of Provo, taught me that that term is too one-sided; it overlooks the Mormon part of the equation. So now I only use Utah Expedition to mean the U.S. Army force commanded by Col. Albert Sidney Johnston. As I see it, the flip-side of this one-sidedness is the ethnocentric label that I frequently hear in Utah: Johnston's Army. I understand why people use it, but it strikes me as trivializing the army side by personalizing it or confining it to the name of one commander—a bit like the label Seward's Folly that was used for years to ridicule the U.S. government's purchase of Alaska in 1867. This label Johnston's Army, which is not really used anywhere else in the country, was not even used in Utah until decades after the conflict

ended. It appeared late in the nineteenth century for political and cultural reasons.²

Finally I would mention that the institutional army today has great difficulty using the term “war” for all this. The military historians much prefer “expedition” or “campaign.” Their view is that the conflict was not a war because it lacked a congressional declaration of one as well as pitched battles and massive bloodshed on the Civil War’s scale.³ I understand all that too, but I continue to think that “war” is an appropriate term—in the common-sense fashion that we talk about the Indian wars. After all, consider that for years Camp Floyd, Utah, was the nation’s largest army garrison; the confrontation virtually bankrupted the U.S. Treasury; its financing forced the resignation of Secretary of War John B. Floyd; the war’s Move South put thirty thousand Mormon refugees on the road to Provo; Brigham Young and scores of others were indicted by a federal grand jury for treason; and the Mountain Meadows massacre alone, the conflict’s greatest atrocity, was the nation’s worst incident of organized mass murder of unarmed civilians in the nation’s history until the 1995 Oklahoma City bombing. So for me Utah War is a good enough working descriptor.

Utah War Studies Today

In 1977 I published an article complaining that, with a renewed national interest in President Buchanan’s administration, there was no commensurate revival of interest in how Buchanan dealt with the first armed challenge to the federal government—the one in Utah.⁴ Earlier, at about the time of the war’s centennial, LeRoy R. and Ann W. Hafen and Norman F. Furniss had published two important books about the conflict, but then little else appeared on the subject.⁵ By the time of my 1977 lamentation, the Utah War seemed like a forgotten incident in American history.⁶ During the subsequent twenty years, though, study of the conflict picked up speed with the appearance of foundational work by an accomplished group of professionally trained, academically based Utah historians whose backgrounds resembled that of the Hafens and Furniss. Most of these scholars held Ph.D. degrees; many had studied after World War II at the University of California, Berkeley or at other demanding graduate schools outside of Utah. I have in mind Leonard J. Arrington, Juanita L. Brooks, Everett L. Cooley, Thomas J. Alexander, Harold D.

Langley, Glen M. Leonard, Brigham D. Madsen, Donald R. Moorman, Charles S. Peterson, Richard D. Poll, Gene A. Sessions, Harold Schindler, Melvin T. Smith, Clifford L. Stott, and Ronald W. Walker.

With the turn of the century and the beginning of a new millennium, the flow of scholarship accelerated by means of a phalanx of energetic, highly productive historians who also turned their attention to the Utah War. Many of these scholar-writers are connected to Utah by birth or family; nearly all have acquired a perspective that comes from working in other states or regions. With rare exception, historians of this new breed—like Juanita Brooks and Dale L. Morgan before them—work without doctoral degrees and are not resident on university faculties or among the staff of the state historical societies. Instead it is a group whose members are overwhelmingly independent in their sponsorship and point of view and as likely to be women as men. I refer primarily to Polly Aird, Curtis R. Allen, Will Bagley, David L. Bigler, Duane A. Bylund, the late Murray L. Carroll, Sally Denton, John D. Eldredge, Sherman L. Fleek, Audrey M. Godfrey, Brandon J. Metcalf, Roger B. Nielson, Ardis E. Parshall, Jesse G. Petersen, and Richard E. Turley Jr. The exceptions, as university-affiliated historians, are the still-productive Messrs. Alexander, Leonard, Sessions, and Walker as well as relative newcomers to Utah War studies Shannon A. Novak, who took her Ph.D. at the University of Utah but teaches at Syracuse University and works as a forensic anthropologist, and Michael S. Van Wagenen, who is a doctoral student at the University of Utah.

There have been multiple stimuli for this most recent productivity: the approach of the Utah War's sesquicentennial; a new openness at LDS Church Archives to the accessibility of its invaluable collections; the maturity of the efforts of individual researchers who had worked for decades to complete their work while balancing full-time commitments to quite different professions or fields; and a rediscovery of the conflict's most morbid but fascinating atrocity, the Mountain Meadows massacre. An unmistakably catalytic force at work during this period was the advent of the Arthur H. Clark Company's multi-volume, seminal series *Kingdom in the West: The Mormons and the American Frontier* for which Robert A. Clark and Will Bagley have been the publisher and series editor, respectively. The result has been, over the past ten years, an unprecedented, accelerating, substantial output, in multiple formats, on various aspects of the war. While not a phenomenon that one would call a tsunami of

output, the flow of groundbreaking studies is noteworthy, especially when one considers the comparative paucity of effort and interest during the decades that led up to and surrounded the war's centennial.⁷

For me, two very recent incidents emblematically brought home the fact of this sea change in Utah War studies. First, I would note that I asked Cache Valley's Audrey Godfrey, a long-time friend, to introduce this lecture because the person originally tapped for that duty, James Arrington (Leonard's son), was unexpectedly called out of town to attend one of the first performances of a new play that he has written: *March of the Salt Soldiers: The Utah War*. Think of it; we now have even a theatrical examination of the Utah War! The second incident was my involvement less than a week ago in the Buchanan National Symposium in Lancaster, Pennsylvania, James Buchanan's post-presidential retirement home. In the midst of all the papers delivered at this conference about the secession crisis of 1860–1861, the coming of the Civil War, the destruction of the Democratic Party, and the composition of the president's cabinet was my offering, a paper titled "James Buchanan and the Crisis in Utah: Scope and Impact." This was not an involvement that I stimulated or sought. Rather, I was approached to participate out of the blue because of a refreshing new awareness on the part of the conference's organizers—professors at three Pennsylvania colleges—that a complete view of Old Buck's administration needed to take his Utah experiences into account.⁸ My cup runneth over.

So I can now report that the world of Utah War studies is alive and thriving. With all of this investigation, research, and published output and the sesquicentennial commemoration of the Utah War closing at the end of 2008, is there anything more to be said or discovered? Are we straining for new material and interpretations? I would not have chosen the topic for this lecture if I thought such were not the case. As I mentioned in a newspaper interview earlier this year, I believe that we have been seeing just the tip of the iceberg and that a continuation of this renaissance awaits us.⁹

Let me draw a parallel. With all of the publications that have surrounded us for decades about Abraham Lincoln and the American Civil War—there has already been more published about Lincoln than any other human being except Jesus Christ—you will need to get ready for an avalanche of new material in 2009 for the bicentennial of Lincoln's birth and during 2011–2015, if not earlier, for the Civil War's

sesquicentennial. We have not seen anything yet, on these subjects. By extension, I believe that, on a surely more modest scale, we will see continuing interest in the Utah War between now and its bicentennial in 2057–2058. The fog of national amnesia that has for so long enveloped the Utah War is lifting. With this new awareness will come fascinating discoveries and new knowledge.

The Future Near Term

What form will Utah War studies take in future years? In the short run, that is, beginning tomorrow, there will be a continued outpouring of more narrative and documentary studies about Utah's territorial period during and immediately surrounding the Utah War. Much of this material involves either the Mountain Meadows massacre or the 1856 handcart experience; all of it involves the leadership of Brigham Young. We have just seen the long-awaited appearance of *Massacre at Mountain Meadows* by Ron Walker, Rick Turley, and Glen Leonard.¹⁰ Early reactions to the book, even among those who have not seen a copy, have ranged from adulation to vilification. It will be interesting to see how these emotional reactions play out as the present short supply is remedied by the publisher and more copies reach the public. We will also soon be hearing from the first of those book reviewers assigned to this volume who have specialized knowledge about the Utah War, the massacre itself, and frontier violence.

Against this background will soon come another highly relevant book, of which you are probably unaware, David L. Bigler's and Will Bagley's *Innocent Blood: Essential Narratives of the Mountain Meadows Massacre*, from the Arthur H. Clark Company.¹¹ This study will appear this fall, and it will be a very different book than that by Messrs. Walker, Turley, and Leonard, and not just because one is a narrative history and the other a documentary.

In between these two offerings will arrive David Roberts's *Devil's Gate: Brigham Young and the Great Mormon Handcart Tragedy*.¹² I mention this volume, which does not bear directly on Mountain Meadows, because it discusses Brigham Young's leadership of Mormon Utah on the virtual eve of the war while assessing his responsibility for the Willie and Martin handcart companies' disaster, the greatest loss of life in the entire American overland trails experience. Roberts's background differs from that of the

two groups of commentators described earlier. Although armed with a Ph.D., he is neither a faculty member nor a non-academic with a long-term immersion in Utah's territorial period. Instead, Roberts is a talented free-lance writer, and—like Sally Denton, a reporter who has written about Mountain Meadows—he has jump-started his lack of background through extensive consultation with the generous, vastly experienced Will Bagley. He also drew on the research help of Ardis E. Parshall.¹³

You may recall that last June Roberts produced an article for *Smithsonian Magazine* titled “The Brink of War” about the subject of this lecture.¹⁴ Roberts also has an article in the current issue of *American Heritage* titled “Patience Loader: The Awful March of the Saints.” In this piece he argues that one of the purposes of 1856 handcart migration was “to shore up his [Young’s] breakaway theocracy against an anticipated offensive by the U.S. army, which would, in fact, take place less than two years in the future.” With respect to the Willie-Martin catastrophe, Roberts places what he calls “the lion’s share of the blame” on Brigham Young, and accuses him of having “placed saving money over human lives.”¹⁵ In the winter, the *Journal of Mormon History* will publish an analysis by Will Bagley of Brigham Young’s responsibility for the handcart experience, including the Willie-Martin disaster.¹⁶ Fasten your seat belts; it will be a bumpy reputational ride for Brigham Young.

My prediction is that each of these books and articles will play off the others as the media commentators, reviewers, internet bloggers, and others come to the fore to discuss all of this unprecedented and irresistible loss of life and violence. My hope is that there will be enough civility so that the light generated will balance the heat. In that connection we should all hope for the emergence of Lyndia Carter’s long-awaited monograph on the handcart experience as part of the Clark Company’s *Kingdom in the West* series, a study which has the potential to be the definitive exploration of this subject.

Not all of the Utah War-related material that will appear in the very near term is as volatile as these books and articles. For example, in a few more months Yale University Press will bring out “*Liberty to the Downtrodden*”: *Thomas L. Kane, Romantic Reformer* by Matthew J. Grow, a very able Utah native and Parley P. Pratt descendant who took his doctorate at Notre Dame and began his academic teaching career this year as an assistant professor at the University of Southern Indiana.¹⁷ The chapters of Grow’s book dealing with Kane’s 1858

mission to first the White House and then Salt Lake City and Camp Scott will be the most complete account yet published of his Utah War mediating effort. As the fall and coming winter unfold, you will hear more about this aspect of Kane's adventures through the monthly lectures to be delivered at Brigham Young University's Harold B. Lee Library as an adjunct to the spectacular exhibition at L. Tom Perry Special Collections of BYU's gigantic collection of Kane family papers.¹⁸ This November I will publish a long article in the *Journal of Mormon History* titled "Buchanan's Thrust from the Pacific: The Utah Expedition's Ill-Fated Second Front."¹⁹ This piece will be filled with a number of revelations such as General Winfield Scott's maneuvering to supersede Colonel Albert Sidney Johnston as the Utah Expedition's supreme leader, deliberations to double the size of the U.S. Army to deal with "the Mormon problem," and massive plans to invade Utah from the west—California and Oregon—while Johnston was in winter quarters near Fort Bridger.

The Future Medium Term

Moving from the immediate future to the medium-term outlook, I see several things happening. First, coming on stream during 2009 to 2011 will be several more books in the Clark Company's *Kingdom in the West* series that have been in the research and writing process for several years. Among them will be the second and concluding part of my documentary history of the Utah War, *At Sword's Point*,²⁰ as well as others not bearing exclusively on that conflict but that touch on it through such overlapping or complementary subjects as Mormon-Indian relations and the travails of apostates and dissenters.

In 2009 the Clark Company will also publish Polly Aird's biography of her Scottish ancestor, Peter McAuslan, a Nauvoo Legionnaire who fled Utah for California after being appalled by the violence that he experienced around Spanish Fork and Springville just before and during the Utah War.²¹ Aside from these studies, for which there are firm publishing plans, several more await us that are now in manuscript form. For example, Sherman L. Fleek, a retired army officer and military historian, has been working on a narrative study of the Utah Expedition from the army's perspective, so perhaps we will see that before long, as well as a narrative history of the war that is being drafted by Messrs. Bagley and

Bigler. I also have hopes that Curtis E. Allen of Centerville will publish his encyclopedic research on which soldiers, by name and unit, served on the federal side of the Utah War. Allen's is an interesting activity for a man descended from Private Andrew Jackson Allen, a Nauvoo Legion cavalryman ahorse during Lot Smith's famous October 1857 raid on the Utah Expedition's supply wagons. Also under way is Ronald W. Walker's projected biography of Brigham Young, a study intended to go beyond Leonard Arrington's decades-old *Brigham Young: American Moses*.²² Surely Walker's biography will deal at length with Governor Young's crucial Utah War role and responsibilities.

I would also predict that starting in 2009 you will see Utahns becoming involved in the planning for the sesquicentennial commemoration of the American Civil War, and that this focus on what went on during 1861 to 1865 will draw upon the work stimulated by the Utah War's commemoration. If so, the result could be a bridging of the two conflicts for the first time. For example, I can see Civil War-related conference papers, journal articles, or books on such unexplored topics as how the Utah War impacted Buchanan's willingness to confront southern secession firmly, the nature of Lot Smith's company-level military leadership role in both wars, an exploration of commonalities between the Bear River massacre of 1863 and the Mountain Meadows massacre less than six years earlier, and the extent to which President Buchanan's Utah War experience inhibited President Lincoln's willingness to request any significant number of troops for the Union Army from Utah Territory. To the extent that commemoration of the Civil War in Utah is linked to the conflict immediately preceding it, there could well be a strengthening rather than a fading of the public's interest in the earlier confrontation. Local planning for the Civil War commemoration will be spearheaded by Col. Robert S. Voyles, director of the Fort Douglas Museum, and I predict that Bob will draw extensively on the lessons learned from his current role as an active member of the Utah War Sesquicentennial Committee. By the way, in 2009 or 2010 that latter group will publish through the University of Utah Press a compilation of the best articles and essays about the Utah War that have surfaced during the past several years at the annual conferences of the Western History Association, the Mormon History Association, the Utah State Historical Society, and several military history organizations located across the country.

The Future Long-Term

Even more helpful to nurturing the viability of Utah War studies than linkage to the Civil War commemoration will be what I will call the serendipitous discovery of new primary source materials, the stuff from which new knowledge and interpretations will come. In a way, these are really blue-sky comments, since I do not know today what these discoveries will be. But I am confident from my own fifty years of research that indeed they will surface and will do so in quantity, character, and circumstance that will be astonishing. The 1928 publication of Captain Jesse A. Gove's letters to his wife and the 1945 publication of Captain Albert Tracy's Utah War journal and some of his pencil sketches were strong stimuli to an earlier generation's interest in and understanding of the Utah War, as were the Hafens' 1958 compilation of documents and Norman Furniss's 1960 narrative history.²³ I foresee that the very recent research and publications that I have just been describing will have a similar downstream impact on creativity, motivation, and discovery.

How specifically will these future discoveries take place? What is the process by which they will unfold? A minute ago I used the word *serendipitous*. I believe that that phenomenon is largely the key. By serendipity I mean not dumb luck or passive waiting for good fortune, but rather the prepared mind linked to a spirit of energetic inquisitiveness and tuned to spot and pursue promising leads or fruitful interconnections, in the spirit of the hunt. As with my old Air Force squadron's radar gear at work controlling traffic in the Berlin air corridors, it is a matter of having the equipment on, properly calibrated, and perpetually monitored. If your mental equipment is "on" and your hunting instincts are active, the results will come. I suppose that sounds a bit like building the baseball stadium in *Field of Dreams*, but it is a methodology that works, like hunting where the deer are, instead of thrashing through the woods looking for white tails at random. I describe a number of my own documentary finds in the early sections of *At Sword's Point* and in a 2007 article for *Dialogue*, so I will not rehash those stories here.²⁴ What I will say, though, is that it is a rare day that I am not pursuing the possibility of unexploited material through some combination of internet searches, correspondence, scrutiny of other authors' footnotes and bibliographies, scanning the catalogues of antiquarian booksellers, or simply chatting with other historians about their thoughts and projects. One thing leads to another.

One way to illustrate what I mean by the role of serendipity in the discovery of new knowledge is to describe briefly a chain of events that took place in Utah at Mountain Meadows on August 3, 1999. As part of the LDS Church's effort to complete the landscaping for the site of a new memorial cairn, a contractor's backhoe was working in an area that ground-penetrating radar and archaeologists had indicated did not contain human remains. Nonetheless, the equipment unexpectedly uncovered what turned out to be thousands of bones from twenty-six of the 1857 massacre's 120 victims. What followed in the next month was a feverish race against time to examine these remains before their reburial and the rededication of the site and memorial scheduled for September 11, 1999. Fortuitously the state archaeologist asked a locally available resource, Dr. Shannon A. Novak, with extensive experience as a forensic anthropologist examining Balkan atrocity sites, to conduct the examination. Novak agreed to do this daunting assignment and worked rapidly under extreme pressure and the glare of unwelcome publicity. The result has been several articles as well as her book, published this year, titled *House of Mourning: A Biocultural History of the Mountain Meadows Massacre*. This study contains extensive new information about who the victims were, what their lives were like, and how they fit into the picture of other Americans on the road as emigrants at that time. Because of the story that bones "tell," Novak was also able to discuss the age of the victims (including children), the weapons used to kill them, and at what range. She also was able to put the lie to the traditional, demeaning canard that the victims were syphilitic, while supporting the now-emerging belief that the Paiutes on the scene probably played only a relatively minor role in the carnage. That the bones were uncovered was wholly unexpected; that Novak was available, vastly experienced, understood the opportunity implicit in this upset, was asked to pitch in, and did so with energy and perception was serendipitous. The result is remarkable new knowledge stemming from a unique and very narrow window of opportunity.²⁵

One more example of serendipity comes to mind. A few years ago I telephoned Rick Turley, now the LDS Church's assistant historian, to compare notes on the Utah War experiences of James Henry Martineau, a well-known Cache Valley surveyor in the late nineteenth century. During the Utah War, Martineau lived around Springville, and, as a young Nauvoo Legion second lieutenant, he was involved in a number of adventures: the aftermath of Mountain Meadows and the subsequent

White Mountain Expedition in the spring of 1858, an arduous sort of wild goose chase to pursue Brigham Young's misguided belief that large, hidden oases existed in the deserts of what is now central Nevada to which the Latter-day Saints could conduct a fighting retreat as the Utah Expedition advanced on northern Utah. I mentioned to Turley that in my last conversation with the late Everett L. Cooley, I had asked him what missing document more than any other from the Utah War he wished he had found. Wracked with pain from the back problem that plagued him at the end, Ev leaned toward me in the old officer's club at Fort Douglas and quietly replied without hesitation, "the Martineau diary," a document that he believed was sequestered in a family lawyer's Los Angeles bank vault.²⁶ There was a pause on the line, and then Turley responded to my little story with the news that not only was he by coincidence a Martineau descendant but the Martineau family had just granted access to this document—all 1,200 pages of it. Knowing of Noel A. Carmack's long-time interest in Martineau and having read his *Utah Historical Quarterly* article about Martineau's surveying work in Cache Valley, I immediately called Noel, who was then working at USU's Merrill-Cazier Library. Within a few days he was on a plane to California, and within the next year the result should be a first-rate edited publication from USU Press of James Henry Martineau's journal, including his activities during the Utah War. Even before Carmack's Martineau book comes out, one on the same subject will emerge from BYU. I bet that there is a story of serendipity there too.²⁷

My belief in the importance of serendipity was reinforced in just the past several weeks as I came across two collections of wholly unexploited letters written by army officers serving in Utah to their family members in the East. One collection, now located in a large Atlantic Coast city, was generated by a military surgeon of whom I had never heard. It came up on my radar screen as the result of my phone conversation with a young historian about a wholly unrelated project in which I was proposing that he consider joining me as collaborator. He had no interest in the letters himself—the Utah War is not his field—and he only mentioned them as a throw-away comment in describing a library that he had recently visited—one by sheer coincidence heavily endowed by a classmate of mine from both college and graduate school. The other documents surfaced separately as a result of one of my daily Internet searches through the Library of Congress's fabulous OCLC search engine. What I saw there sent me

on a subsequent search through a fading iron mining town in Michigan's Upper Peninsula, a research library in Wyoming, a family of descendants in Denver, the Detroit Public Library, and eventually to BYU. The prize here was a collection of unexploited letters written to his wife by a lonely artillery officer detailed to guard an isolated mountain pass.

Sometimes these finds are literally under our nose. I mentioned that I was in Lancaster last week to deliver a paper on President Buchanan and the Utah War. There—in a library one hundred yards from the conference site—I found and read the letters of Maj. John Fulton Reynolds, Third U.S. Infantry, the West Pointer-son of Buchanan's dearest friend. Reynolds, whose letters to his family are unpublished, served in Utah twice: during the winter of 1854–1855 with the Steptoe Expedition and during 1858–1859 with the Utah Expedition.²⁸ For that matter just this afternoon at USU's special collections I read the unpublished military correspondence of yet another obscure officer involved with the Utah War—Capt. Marcus de Lafayette Simpson—whose letters Brad Cole pointed out to me in a display case at Merrill-Cazier Library.²⁹

Is there any predictability as to where such material is to be found? I think there is, and I hope that in the future someone will begin to exploit these high-yield possibilities in a systematic way. Two likely hunting grounds come readily to mind as examples. The first place to look, I think, should be the hometown newspapers of Utah War participants on both sides of the conflict. In many cases families receiving correspondence from soldier-relatives in the West would pass their letters to the editor of the local newspaper, who often printed them because of their freshness, color, and hometown appeal. In other cases the soldier wrote directly to the editor himself with the same result. Awareness of this behavior prompted me to search the back issues of the Buffalo, New York, *Commercial Advertiser*. There I found the 1857 letters written by the Tenth U.S. Infantry's Capt. Albert Tracy to a friend in his hometown, who passed them on to that newspaper's editor.³⁰ Tracy's diaries have, of course, been published for decades, but until now none of the captain's correspondence has surfaced. The digitization of nineteenth-century newspapers and their accessibility via the Internet—as has recently been done for Utah's newspapers of that period—should help this discovery process enormously. But this new tool will yield results only if historians in search of fresh material are energetic enough to ferret out the homes of Utah War participants and link them to that town's newspapers. In

which newspapers would I look next? Those published in Salem and Boston, Massachusetts.³¹

Another productive hunting ground should be Europe, principally Ireland, Great Britain, Denmark, and Germany—the original homes of many soldiers on both sides of the war. Half of the 1857 Utah Expedition's soldiers were born outside of the U.S., and the proportion of foreign-born Nauvoo Legionnaires may have been even higher. Surely, to the extent they were literate, these soldiers were sending letters and perhaps even photographs across the Atlantic. Where are these documents? I know of only two cases in which the letters of Utah War participants were sent to Europe, returned to the U.S., translated, and published in the United States.³² But it has been seventy years since even this small amount of source material became available to American students of the Utah War. Who will discover what must be dozens of other such troves of soldier-generated letters and photographs languishing unexploited in the trunks, cupboards, and attics of European descendants, if not in the columns of their newspapers or the collections of their historical societies?

I suppose a third place to which I might direct those in search of documentary discoveries are the research files of the late Harold Schindler, an independent historian and long-time Salt Lake City newspaper reporter-columnist. For decades Hal spoke opaquely to me and others of his striking discoveries about the Utah War. When pressed for details, he would enigmatically refer questioners to the Utah War study that he unfortunately never published. Hal Schindler died in 1999, and since then no one has seen his files except his family. Whether the Schindler family basement holds great discoveries about the Utah War or something else remains to be seen. Just when all will be revealed from this source—in the short-, medium-, or long-term future—continues to be a tantalizing mystery.

Other Predictions

Aside from my confidence that the future promises exciting discoveries of important documents and that sustained interest in the Civil War is a rising tide that may float the boat of the Nauvoo Legion and Utah Expedition as well as that of the Union and Confederate armies, what lies ahead? Longer-term, what do I see happening in Utah War studies

between now and 2057–2058, the conflict’s bicentennial? A few predictions follow, based in part on my hopes, which are fed by an awareness of what more needs to unfold. Consider these eight notions to be more educated guesses than just wishful thinking:

One

The overarching field of Mormon studies will continue to thrive and grow. Inevitably, such vigor will contribute in some way to the examination of one of the seminal events in the Mormon–federal relationship, the Utah War. The creation of the Arrington Chair at Utah State University held by Philip A. Barlow and the Hunter Professorship at Claremont College held by Richard L. Bushman are what economists call a leading, if not coincident, indicator of things to come. These very significant pioneering appointments will inspire donor support for still more high-profile endowed professorships and institutes focusing on Mormon studies. Jan Shippo and Richard Bushman have recently written on the future of Mormon studies in *The Journal of American History*, a publication of the Organization of American Historians, so there is no need for me to belabor this point, except to note that continuing interest in Mormon studies will have as its byproduct a sustained curiosity about the Utah War.³³ For example, an interest in the historical significance of George Wilcken Romney’s and Mitt Romney’s presidential candidacies in 1968 and 2008, respectively, may lead to a broader awareness that one of their ancestors, Charles Henry Wilcken, was a Utah Expedition artillery private until he deserted near Fort Bridger in October 1857, crossed into the Legion’s lines, converted, and became the bodyguard, driver, nurse, and pallbearer for Presidents John Taylor and Wilford Woodruff as well as a religiously adopted son of Apostle George Q. Cannon.³⁴ Not only Private Wilcken’s descendants have run for the White House; so too did his battery commander, Capt. John W. Phelps, who in 1880 ran against another Utah Expedition participant, Winfield Scott Hancock.³⁵

Two

The intense interest in the Mountain Meadows aspect of the Utah War will continue to burn in the short and perhaps even medium term. But as the bicentennial of that tragedy approaches, there will be a rise in the civility of the discourse with a commensurate diminishment of accusatory and defensive behavior by the commentators involved. Some

of this change will take place because of participants' mellowing, as they at long last have had a chance to make their case and to present their research in published form. Because of its complexity, I would expect relatively few future entrants to a detailed analysis of this subject. It will be a long time before any individual historian or team takes on the daunting task of replotting the field worked in such herculean fashion by Juanita L. Brooks and Shannon A. Novak, as well as Messrs. Bagley, Bigler, Walker, Turley, and Leonard. But then who would have predicted the nature of their work and impact ten years ago? I am re-checking my historiographical seatbelt, if not seer stone, for slippage.

Three

One or more full-scale narrative histories of the Utah War will emerge. At least one first-rate such study is badly needed, since it has been nearly fifty years since the appearance of what remains the standard narrative history, Norman F. Furniss's *The Mormon Conflict, 1850–1859*. Such a monograph needs to synthesize the substantial amount of scholarship and material that has surfaced in the half-century since Furniss published, especially since he had only limited access to Mormon sources during the 1950s. I would think that the work-in-progress by Messrs. Bagley and Bigler is most likely to be the next such narrative history.

Four

There is a similar need for a first-rate film about the Utah War. Just because *September Dawn* failed in 2007 does not mean that really talented and committed filmmakers could not produce a highly successful film on the subject of not the Mountain Meadows massacre but rather the broader armed confrontation that spawned it. In the acknowledgments section of my book, I called the Utah War “as colorful, complex, fascinating, and neglected a tale of the American West as I know.”³⁶ For those who join me in this belief, an adventure on both sides of the camera beckons, and a latter-day *Red Badge of Courage* or first-rate documentary film hopefully awaits an interested audience at a movie theater near you (or your grandchildren). Ken Burns and Florentine Films, take note.³⁷

Five

Just as Furniss's narrative history will be superseded and the Hafens' documentary history is already being updated and augmented by *At*

Sword's Point, there will be a readdressing of two of the iconic primary sources from the federal side of the war, the Gove letters and Tracy journal, volumes eighty and sixty-three years old, respectively, at this point. Such an effort needs to be made. The 1928 edition of Capt. Gove's letters lacks a biographical sketch of both him and his wife (their recipient); the only photo of Gove in the book depicts him as he appeared ten years before the war—a curly haired lieutenant—rather than as the mature colonel-hero of 1862 whose portrait now hangs in the rotunda of the New Hampshire State Capitol; and his dispatches to the *New York Herald* are mixed indiscriminately in the book with those generated by the newspaper's several other unidentified war correspondents. The Tracy book—produced during a period of publishing and travel restrictions peculiar to World War II—lacks any image of Tracy and, of course, does not include his newly discovered 1857 letters, the unpublished transcript of his 1858 court-martial, the fresh Fort Bridger sketches and poetry recently acquired by Yale's Beinecke Library, and the magnificent paintings created by Tracy during the Mexican War—a treat for those who know him only as a field sketch artist rather than as an accomplished art student of New York's Professor Samuel F. B. Morse.

Even more badly needed than an updating of the published Gove and Tracy materials is one or more volumes of Captain John W. Phelps's invaluable diaries and correspondence housed in the New York Public Library and Princeton's Firestone Library. Thus far contiguous segments of the Phelps diaries have appeared in the Hafens' book and in my own, but the entire body of Phelps material needs to be edited and published. As a West Pointer who campaigned in Florida and Mexico as well as on the frontiers of Texas, Kansas, and Utah, Phelps's written record provides a sweep of the army's entire antebellum experience as well as a record of the early Civil War years.

Six

Talented, productive independent historians will continue to labor in this field, but I predict that they will be rejoined in the fray by academically based historians of the type who contributed so much during the last quarter of the twentieth century. The considerable activity and ferment that I have been describing is bound to stimulate energetic graduate students in search of dissertation topics working under the direction of younger faculty members such as W. Paul Reeve at the University of

Utah, Matthew J. Grow at Southern Indiana, and Shannon A. Novak at Syracuse. The seeds are being sown now, with a crop of illuminating articles and books, if not films, to be harvested in the future from the history and other departments of universities. An example of such probable studies may be found in the doctoral work just beginning at the University of Nebraska's department of history through Brent M. Rogers, a Ph.D. candidate who seeks to shed light on the Utah War and its important connection to the history of both the United States and the West through what he describes as "the tools and techniques of digital history." Rogers's work was originally stimulated by a chance encounter with Bagley's *Blood of the Prophets* and was reinforced by the provocative, vexing comment made by one of his professors that "the Utah Expedition is only significant in Mormon history, and insignificant otherwise."³⁸

Seven

Technology—alongside the low-tech process of serendipity—will yield astonishing discoveries. When I started down this trail a half-century ago, my tools of choice were the fountain pen, typewriter, carbon paper, index cards, train travel, the microfilm reader, and long-distance telephone. I have mentioned today's wonderful use of the Internet and its search engines and e-mail. Future students of the Utah War will benefit from technological innovations that we cannot even imagine, but they will indeed take place. Just in the past year we have benefited from Google Book, a wonderful new Internet search engine for printed volumes. Think of what awaits us when holograph manuscripts become computer available and searchable in similar fashion. I barely understand what Nebraska's Brent Rogers is doing with his textual analysis tools like Wordle and TokenX, but then the Nauvoo Legion's General D. H. Wells did not know what to make of Ogden gunsmith Jonathan Browning's proffer of a new weapons design for an aerial torpedo in December 1857.³⁹

Eight

Finally, I foresee that aspects of the war heretofore neglected, or at least underdeveloped, will receive the attention they deserve. In somewhat random order these include ten such issues:

Use of Unconventional Forces. The Utah Expedition's employment of volunteer troops alongside regulars has only recently begun to emerge as

part of our understanding of how Albert Sidney Johnston prosecuted the campaign and compensated for massive desertions. A full-length unit history of Barnard E. Bee's Battalion of U.S. Volunteers should and will emerge in the next fifty years.⁴⁰ So also for an understanding of Brigham Young's establishment of the Standing Army, a short-lived cavalry force of 2,000 men created in early 1858 to augment the Nauvoo Legion's militia in Young's anticipated spring campaign to take the war to Fort Bridger and perhaps beyond to Fort Laramie.⁴¹

Role of Women. Audrey M. Godfrey's pioneering master's degree thesis for Utah State University and her *Utah Historical Quarterly* article explored the presence and experiences of women at Camp Floyd and Camp Scott.⁴² But I am pretty sure that she would agree that much more needs to be done on both sides of the conflict. Natural topics for exploration are the Move South and the home burdens carried by wives and lovers left behind by Nauvoo Legionnaires afield in the Wasatch Range as well as by ladies to the east attached to the Utah Expedition's troops. Thanks to the persistent research of a nonacademically based historian in Idaho, we now know this year the ultimate fate of Jenny Goodale, the Shoshone woman who accompanied her guide-husband on Captain Marcy's arduous trek from Fort Bridger to northern New Mexico and back during the winter of 1857–1858—the most arduous cold weather march in American military history.⁴³

How many more colorful stories are there as yet untold about the women involved with both sides? One such—the story of Utah women who married Utah Expedition deserters or discharged veterans—is being pursued actively by at least four independent researchers, three of whom live in Utah with the fourth resident in Washington, D.C.: Audrey M. Godfrey, Val Holley, Joan Nay, and Ardis E. Parshall. If seen through to publication, such work would complement Sandra Ailey Petree's recent edition of the reminiscences of Patience Loader, a handcart disaster survivor who subsequently married John Rozsa, a soldier of the Utah Expedition's Tenth U.S. Infantry whom she accompanied east to the Civil War battlefields, only to see him die before they returned home to Utah.⁴⁴

War Reporters. The identities and contributions of the approximately ten correspondents traveling with the Utah Expedition and generating dispatches to newspapers in New York, Cincinnati, Philadelphia,

London, New Orleans, and San Francisco await us. Who were the men who signed their dispatches “A.B.C.,” “S.,” “Q.,” Kenton,” “Kenton, Jr.,” “Utah,” “W.P.F.,” or not at all? Which two of them engaged in a June 1858 knife-fight in a Provo hotel, to the amusement of Mormon leaders as they attempted to settle their own differences with the federal government?⁴⁵

The Move South. This is a neglected subject worthy of a study in its own right. With thirty thousand Latter-day Saints on the road from northern Utah to Provo (and perhaps beyond) in the spring of 1858 to evade the Utah Expedition, the Move South was the greatest mass movement of refugees in North America since the Acadian diaspora from Nova Scotia after the French and Indian War and the dislocations of British Loyalists accompanying the American Revolution.⁴⁶ There would be nothing like it in American history except perhaps the Union Army’s forced evacuation of three western Missouri counties under Order No. 11 to meet the depredations of Confederate guerrilla William C. Quantrill, a former Utah Expedition teamster and camp cook.⁴⁷ While considering the Move South, future historians should also examine whether it was preceded by Brigham Young’s serious contemplation of what I will call a Move North—a rumored mass exodus to the Pacific Coast via Fort Limhi, Oregon Territory, and perhaps Montana, with Russian America (Alaska) and Great Britain’s Vancouver Island as possible destinations.

Treasure as Well as Blood. The cost and financing of the Utah War is another underdeveloped story. Leonard Arrington probably did more work on this subject than anyone, but his efforts were tentative and somewhat fragmentary.⁴⁸ Here is an arena in which economists like Leonard as well as historians should be able to contribute mightily. Not having researched this issue myself, I have had to discuss this subject over the years by relying on sketchy cost estimates done by others. For the federal side alone these cost estimates range widely from \$14 million to \$40 million.⁴⁹ When President Lincoln took office three years after the Utah War, he had no troops—the biggest army garrison in the country was at Camp Floyd—and he had no money, as the U.S. Treasury had literally been drained. The two circumstances were not unrelated. The Utah campaign entailed costs for which the financing brought about the collapse of the nation’s greatest freighting company, Russell, Majors,

and Waddell, and drove Secretary of War John B. Floyd to resignation. Litigation associated with the costs and financing of the war plagued the courts well into the 1880s. The common belief is that army cash flowing into Utah to build, sustain, and then decommission Camp Floyd more than made up the Utah War–related blow to Utah’s economy. I do not believe it, but someone needs to examine this subject analytically and quantify it.

Indians. The role of Native Americans in the Utah War is even more neglected than that of women. Whether the future *Kingdom in the West* series volume to be edited by Floyd A. O’Neil, Gregory C. Thompson, Will Bagley, and David L. Bigler will fill this historiographic gap I do not know. There is a need to probe this subject, and the growing discussion of what the Southern Paiute role at Mountain Meadows was or was not is emblematic of this past neglect. At last week’s Buchanan National Symposium in Pennsylvania I commented that “The Native Americans involved were viewed as Israelite Lamanites by one side and as savages by the other. These Utes, Paiutes, Bannocks, Delawares, Mojaves, Flatheads, Uintahs, and Northern Shoshones moved ghost-like and largely unchronicled through and around both armed factions, each of which struggled to neutralize if not manipulate them. In the midst of this fray stood Washakie, a handsome, dignified Shoshone warrior-statesman whose incredibly long life spanned the presidential administrations of Thomas Jefferson and Theodore Roosevelt.”⁵⁰ Upon reflection I should also have mentioned the involvement in one way or another of Cherokees, Cheyennes, and Arapahoes—a total of at least eleven tribes, if not more. Do I sense another movie opportunity?

Semper Fidelis. The U.S. Marine Corps’ one-man contribution to the Utah Expedition, traditionally viewed as an all-army campaign, warrants examination. What is the connection between the story of Marine 2d Lt. Robert L. Browning, Utah’s deserts, and the famous Civil War novella, *The Man Without a Country*?⁵¹

A Broader, Regional Context. There needs to be more linkage of the Utah War to broader themes of westward expansion following the Mexican War and the contemporaneous turmoil in Utah’s eastern neighbor, “Bleeding Kansas.” California-based historian Kenneth N. Owens has

done a lot of thinking about both themes. After Owens finishes his current examination of nineteenth-century Russian involvement in North America, I hope he publishes his views on the Utah War's broader connections. As we think about Owens's study of the Utah War within the context of Manifest Destiny and the western thrust launched by the Polk administration, another historian resident in California, David L. Bigler, urges us not to lose sight of what he sees as the Rosetta Stone for understanding the war—Mormon millennialism and theology, a subject on which he has and will continue to write.⁵²

Art of the Utah War. A historian of art could have a wonderful time while performing a real service by collecting and publishing all of the known and soon-to-be-discovered visual representations of the war: photographs, sketches, paintings, posters, cartoons, elaborately engraved sheet music covers, maps, and even the design of commemorative quilts and works of needlepoint. Such material has been used episodically in small quantity to illustrate articles and monographs. But, alas, historians have traditionally tended to give short shrift to the value of their colleagues in the allied fields of visual representation, material culture, and folk art, so no comprehensive exhibition or publication of the type I seek has yet appeared. I predict that at least one such study will emerge in the next half-century. Perhaps Noel Carmack, a talented artist and conservator as well as historian, will pursue this subject after he has completed his mammoth Martineau project.

The same holds true for the neglected fields of music, fiction, folklore, poetry, and drama. When the Utah War Sesquicentennial Committee was trying to determine just which activities it would try to stimulate and support during 2007–2008, it had no trouble thinking about the traditional format of the academic conference at which historians present formal papers. More difficult was its ability to grapple with the challenge of how to engage the broader, non-academic community and other allied disciplines in commemorating the Utah War while honoring the participants on both sides. Last year's Utah War poster and essay contest for Utah's school children and the commissioning of James Arrington's stage play were modest first steps by the committee in that direction. I have high hopes that the creative urges of talented people in and outside the academy as well as beyond the walls of the history department will produce even more exciting work as this century unfolds.

Put another way, when one considers that the flow of music and satire about the Utah War literally sprang up spontaneously in Big Cottonwood Canyon at the 1857 Pioneer Day celebration at which most Utahns first heard of the Utah Expedition's westward march and that in 1858 the New York stage was awash with overheated, cartoonish dramatic productions about the Utah War, does it make sense that today and in the future the study of such behavior should be confined to a single format—historians reading papers to one another in a hotel conference room?⁵³ Is there an awareness among students of the Utah War that one of John Updike's novels and his only stage play dealt with President James Buchanan?⁵⁴

Finding "The Lost." For fifty years, since Yale's curator of Western Americana first steered me to it as a source, I have tried unsuccessfully to identify the author of *Mormoniad*, a one-hundred-page mock epic poem published anonymously in Boston during 1858 to lampoon both Brigham Young and James Buchanan. Leonard Arrington kept a photocopy of the poem in his research files but made no apparent use of it. Hope Hilton included *Mormoniad* in the bibliography of her biography of Bill Hickman without comment. William Deverell and I have made published references to the poem but have had to confess a lack of success in discovering its origins.⁵⁵ While not one of the great foundational documents of the Utah War, the rare even-handedness of the poem's satire and the range of its commentary have intrigued me while fueling more research effort than I probably should admit. I predict that before 2057–2058, some enterprising, serendipitous researcher will identify *Mormoniad's* poet. My best assessment is that the author is likely to have been a well-educated, urbane New Englander with Republican Party political leanings and more than a passing familiarity with the landmarks and even statuary in Washington, D.C. I have ruled out dozens of possibilities, including James Russell Lowell, the editor-poet of Boston's new *Atlantic Monthly* and his most successful early contributor, Oliver Wendell Holmes, Sr., M.D.

Less earthshaking but equally intriguing are my efforts to determine the ultimate fate of a handful of the war's off-beat but more colorful participants. Because of the transient character of the federal side, many people belonging to the group I have dubbed "the missing" were civilian camp followers attached to the Utah Expedition. In character their

backgrounds ranged between those of the rough-hewn frontiersman and the gentleman. They seem to have simply vanished into the American West and dropped from historical notice after a cameo appearance in the Utah War.

So what became of Hiram F. Morrell, Salt Lake City's mountaineer-postmaster and perhaps the most hated non-Mormon in Utah? He was last seen in an 1863 gold camp in Montana Territory.⁵⁶ What happened to William Porter Finlay, the Volunteer Battalion's peripatetic, homicidal sergeant-major, after his April 1858 military discharge at Camp Scott? Having joined the Utah Expedition after cutting a swath through five continents, where did he go next? Although Finlay's later years are a mystery, at least we know about his pre-army life. In the case of Capt. Daniel McLaughlin, commander of the Volunteer Battalion's Company B, even this information is missing. We know only McLaughlin's name, rank, and nine-month term of service as well as the fact that he was older than his nineteen-year-old first lieutenant, James F. Bennett, who exchanged ranks with him out of deference to their relative age. Because of the general composition of this unit, I surmise that in civilian life Daniel McLaughlin may have been a Russell, Majors and Waddell teamster or even wagon master, but this conjecture is unconfirmed. Accordingly, far less is known about Captain McLaughlin than about the three other volunteer company commanders and four regular army staff officers of his battalion.⁵⁷ We now know that John M. Hockaday, Utah's U.S. attorney and episodic mail contractor, died in 1865, but where and under what circumstances? Based on the trajectory of his life by 1860, I would guess that alcohol played a role in Hockaday's fate and that he died in Missouri. But there are so many intertwined Hockaday families in that region—the equivalent of a genealogical thicket—that finding records for this particular John Hockaday remains elusive.⁵⁸ Where did Lafayette Shaw (Fay) Worthen go after peeling off from Thomas L. Kane's east-bound escort at the Missouri River in June 1858? Worthen, the young non-Mormon son of Amos Henry Worthen, the Illinois state geologist, had spent 1856–1857 visiting Kimball relatives in Salt Lake City and the winter of 1857–1858 acting as a courier between Salt Lake City and Camp Scott. What became of him after migrating to Denver in the 1860s, and—even more intriguing—what happened to the letters he must have written to his Illinois family while in Utah? A good starting place to hunt might be the newspapers of Warsaw and Springfield,

Illinois, where his parents lived during the late 1850s.⁵⁹ Perhaps most shadowy of all the gentlemen camp followers lounging about Fort Bridger was Charles Maurice Smith, a young Port Royal Virginian with experience as a Washington newspaperman and lawyer. How and why Smith gravitated to the Utah Expedition is unknown, but after Nauvoo Legion Lt. William R. R. Stowell was captured on October 16, 1857 with Maj. Joseph Taylor, Smith undertook Stowell's legal defense following his indictment for treason. That Stowell was released in the spring of 1858 is known; what became of Charles Maurice Smith and any record of his Utah experiences is not.⁶⁰

If Morrell, Finlay, McLaughlin, Hockaday, Worthen, and Smith were minor players among the Utah War's *dramatis personae*, their activities were nonetheless interesting enough to catch and hold my attention. What potentially accompanies discovery of their ultimate fate are clues to the location of any correspondence, diaries, or reminiscences about the Utah War that have survived them—source material as tantalizing as it is elusive. As Sherlock Holmes, whose first murder case involved Mormonism run amok in Victorian London, so frequently advised Dr. Watson, “the game is afoot.”⁶¹

Conclusion

I close by reminding you that there is an old saying about the histories of wars being written by the victors. I suppose this aphorism is largely true. But since, in my view, the Utah War had no victor—there were only losses on both sides—this outcome frees us all to contribute to the war's still-emerging story. That is precisely what I see continuing to unfold over the next fifty years with new openness and sustained creativity producing astonishing discoveries. And so, as that great Utah War historian Lee Iacocca reputedly said in a college commencement address of an earlier decade, “Ladies and gentlemen, start your engines.”

NOTES

1. Leonard J. Arrington, *Great Basin Kingdom: An Economic History of the Latter-day Saints, 1830–1900* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1958). For the author's years with GM at its New York corporate headquarters, see MacKinnon, "Developing General Motors' Chairmen: The Extraordinary Role of GM's New York Treasurer's Office Since World War I," *Automotive History* 33 (Fall 1998): 9–18 and "Loose in the Stacks: A Half-Century with the Utah War and Its Legacy," *Dialogue: A Journal of Mormon Thought* 40 (Spring 2007): 45.
2. Gene A. Sessions, "The Legend of 'Johnston's Army': Myth and Reality among the Mormons," paper presented at the Mormon History Association annual conference, Salt Lake City, May 26, 2007.
3. For other reasons why the institutional army has traditionally chosen not to embrace the study of the Utah conflict—what I have called the "heartburn factor"—see MacKinnon, "Loose in the Stacks," 52–53.
4. MacKinnon, "The Gap in the Buchanan Revival: The Utah Expedition of 1857–58," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 45 (Winter 1977): 36–46.
5. LeRoy R. and Ann W. Hafen, eds., *The Utah Expedition, 1857–1858: A Documentary History of the United States Military Movement under Colonel Albert Sidney Johnston, and the Resistance by Brigham Young and the Mormon Nauvoo Legion* (1958; rpt., Glendale, Calif.: The Arthur H. Clark Co., 1982), later reprinted as *Mormon Resistance: A Documentary Account of the Utah Expedition, 1857–1858* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2005). Norman F. Furniss, *The Mormon Conflict, 1850–1859* (1960; rpt., New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 1966). LeRoy and Ann Hafen compiled their study while he was on the faculty of BYU following service as state historian of Colorado; Furniss's book was published while he was teaching at Colorado State University after taking a Ph.D. at Yale.
6. A significant Utah War article appeared alongside my essay, "The Gap in the Buchanan Revival." See Gene A. Sessions and Stephen W. Stathis, "The Mormon Invasion of Russian America: Dynamics of a Potent Myth," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 45 (Winter 1977): 22–35.
7. For an example of the relatively meager discussion of the conflict at its one hundredth anniversary, see "Johnston's Army Triggered 'Utah War,'" *Church News* (Salt Lake City), July 20, 1957, 3, 15, which was essentially a chronology compiled at the turn of the twentieth century by Andrew Jensen, then assistant historian of the LDS Church. Copy in author's possession, courtesy of Curtis R. Allen of Centerville, Utah.
8. One byproduct of this symposium will be the University of Florida Press's publication during 2009–2010 of an edited collection of conference papers under the title *Disrupted Democracy: James Buchanan and the Coming of the Civil War*. This volume is to include my essay "Precursor to Armageddon: James Buchanan, Brigham Young and a President's Initiation to Bloodshed."
9. Lee Davidson, "Author Takes on 'Utah War,'" *Deseret News* (Salt Lake City), April 13, 2008, accessible at <http://deseretnews.com/article/1,5143.695269543,00.html> (accessed February 16, 2009).
10. Ronald W. Walker, Richard E. Turley Jr., and Glen M. Leonard, *Massacre at Mountain Meadows* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008).
11. David L. Bigler and Will Bagley, eds., *Innocent Blood: Essential Narratives of the Mountain Meadows Massacre* (Norman, Okla.: The Arthur H. Clark Co., 2008).

12. David Roberts, *Devil's Gate: Brigham Young and the Great Mormon Handcart Tragedy* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 2008).
13. Sally Denton, *American Massacre: The Tragedy at Mountain Meadows, September 1857* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2003). Parshall played no role in the development of this book.
14. David Roberts, "The Brink of War," *Smithsonian Magazine* 39 (June 2008): 44–51.
15. David Roberts, "Patience Loader: The Awful March of the Saints," *American Heritage* 58 (Fall 2008): 28–31.
16. Will Bagley, "'One Long Funeral March': A Revisionist's View of the Mormon Handcart Disasters," *Journal of Mormon History* 35 (Winter 2009): 50–115.
17. Matthew J. Grow, *"Liberty to the Downtrodden": Thomas L. Kane, Romantic Reformer* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2009).
18. My contribution to this series is MacKinnon, "Thomas L. Kane and the Utah War: B.Y.U.'s Kane Collection as Lodestone," lecture, November 12, 2008, L. Tom Perry Special Collections, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah.
19. MacKinnon, "Buchanan's Thrust from the Pacific: The Utah Expedition's Ill-Fated Second Front," *Journal of Mormon History* 34 (Fall 2008): 226–60.
20. MacKinnon, *At Sword's Point, Part 1: A Documentary History of the Utah War to 1858* (Norman, Okla.: The Arthur H. Clark Co., 2008) and *At Sword's Point, Part 2: A Documentary History of the Utah War, 1858 and Beyond* (forthcoming).
21. Polly Aird, *Mormon Convert, Mormon Defector: A Scottish Emigrant in the American West, 1848–1861* (Norman, Okla.: The Arthur H. Clark Co., 2009).
22. Leonard J. Arrington, *Brigham Young: American Moses* (Champaign-Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1986).
23. Otis G. Hammond, ed., *The Utah Expedition 1857–1858: Letters of Capt. Jesse A. Gove, 10th Inf., U.S.A., of Concord, N.H., to Mrs. Gove, and Special Correspondence of the New York Herald* (Concord: New Hampshire Historical Society, 1928); J. Cecil Alter and Robert J. Dwyer, eds., "The Utah War: Journal of Captain Albert Tracy, 1858–1860," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 13 (1945): 1–128.
24. MacKinnon, *At Sword's Point, Part 1*, 21, 39–40 and "Loose in the Stacks," 62–65.
25. Shannon A. Novak, *House of Mourning: A Biocultural History of the Mountain Meadows Massacre* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2008).
26. My conversation with Everett L. Cooley took place on October 26, 2002 following a paper that I delivered ("The Utah War's Impact: A Military Campaign's Legacy for Both Utah and the Nation") at a conference commemorating the 140th anniversary of the establishment of Fort Douglas. After service as a naval officer in World War II, Cooley had taken his Ph.D. at Cal.-Berkeley following study at the University of Utah, for which he produced a M.A. thesis on the Utah War. For the story of how he published my first article in 1963 as editor of *Utah Historical Quarterly*, see MacKinnon, "Loose in the Stacks," 45.
27. My communications with Messrs. Turley and Carmack were on August 2, 2006. Carmack now teaches at the College of Eastern Utah in Price. See his "Running the Line: James Henry Martineau's Surveys in Northern Utah," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 68 (Fall 2000): 292–312. His forthcoming study is Noel A. Carmack and Charles M. Hatch, eds., *With a Transit, a Mule, and a Prayer: The Diary of James Henry Martineau, Mormon Patriarch and Surveyor* (Logan: Utah State University Press, forthcoming). The first and recently published use of this material is Donald G. Godfrey and Rebecca S. Martineau-McCarty, eds., *An Uncommon Common Pioneer: The Journals of James Henry Martineau 1828–1918* (Provo, Ut.: Religious Studies Center, Brigham Young University, 2008).
28. Reynolds Family Papers, Series X (John Fulton Reynolds), Sadek-Fackenthal Library, Franklin and Marshall College, Lancaster, Pennsylvania.
29. Marcus de Lafayette Simpson Correspondence, Caine Coll. Mss 32, Special Collections and Archives, Merrill-Cazier Library, Utah State University, Logan. An even more recent find was Vern DeLong's discovery in a Pennsylvania closet of First Lieut. Joseph C. Clark's letters to his wife written from the Utah Expedition's Fourth U.S. Artillery. See Amy Joi O'Donoghue, "History Stirs in Camp Floyd Letters," *Deseret News* (Salt Lake City), April 10, 2009.

30. Capt. Albert Tracy, letter to friend, September 23–28, 1857, “From the Utah Expedition,” *Commercial Advertiser* (Buffalo, N.Y.), November 20, 1857, 2: 2; Tracy, Letter to “N.,” December 10, 1857, “A Letter from the Utah Army,” *ibid.*, February 3, 1858, 2: 1–2.
31. A number of Utah War participants on both sides hailed from these Massachusetts communities, including Nathaniel H. Felt (Salt Lake City municipal leader), Howard Egan (Nauvoo Legion major), Albert G. Browne Jr. (war correspondent for the *New York Tribune*), and Samuel P. Spear (sergeant-major of the Second U.S. Dragoons). Other Utah Expedition officers from elsewhere in New England, such as New Hampshire’s Capt. Jesse A. Gove, had strong social and political connections to Boston.
32. The case of Sergeant Eugene Bandel, a Prussian-born soldier serving five years in the Utah Expedition’s Sixth U.S. Infantry, is a model of what I have in mind. Bandel’s letters, written in German, were translated by an American descendant when they gravitated to the U.S. during the twentieth century and may be found in Ralph P. Bieber, ed., Olga Bandel and Richard Jente, trans., *Frontier Life in the Army, 1854–1861* (Glendale, Calif.: The Arthur H. Clark Co., 1932).
33. Jan Shipp, “Richard Lyman Bushman, the Story of Joseph Smith and Mormonism, and the New Mormon History,” and Richard Lyman Bushman, “What’s New in Mormon History: A Response to Jan Shipp,” *The Journal of American History* 94 (September 2007): 498–516 and 517–21.
34. William C. Seifrit, “Charles Henry Wilcken, An Undervalued Saint,” *Utah Historical Quarterly* 55 (Fall 1987): 308–21.
35. John McClaughry, “John Wolcott Phelps: The Civil War General Who Became a Forgotten Presidential Candidate in 1880,” *Vermont History* 38 (Autumn 1970): 263–90.
36. MacKinnon, *At Sword’s Point, Part 1*, 27.
37. I refer to the classic 1951 film *The Red Badge of Courage* directed by John Huston and based on Stephen Crane’s 1895 Civil War novel of the same title. The Ken Burns documentary film which should inspire similar treatment of the Utah War is his multi-part series *The Civil War* produced in 1990 for PBS.
38. E-mail correspondence between MacKinnon and Rogers, December 29, 2008 and January 8, 2009, copy in author’s possession.
39. Jonathan Browning, letter to Lt. Gen. D.H. Wells, December 20, 1857, Yale Collection of Western Americana, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University, New Haven, Conn.
40. The most extensive description and discussion to date of Bee’s battalion appears in three publications by MacKinnon: *At Sword’s Point, Part 1*, 459–66; “*Too Fond of Fighting*”: *Selected Excerpts from Sergeant-Major William Porter Finlay’s Dispatches to the Saint Louis Leader from the Utah Expedition’s Battalion of U.S. Volunteers* (Norman, Okla.: The Arthur H. Clark Co., 2008); “‘Between Volunteerin’ and Starvin’”: Finding the Utah War’s Lost Battalion,” *The Vedette, Newsletter of the Fort Douglas Military Museum Association* (Winter 2008–2009): 4–6. See also Roger B. Nielson, *Roll Call at Old Camp Floyd, Utah Territory: Soldiers of Johnston’s Army at the Upper Camp 8 July to 8 September 1858* (Springville, Utah: n.p., 2006), 199–216.
41. David L. Bigler, *Forgotten Kingdom: The Mormon Theocracy in the American West, 1847–1896* (Spokane, Wash.: The Arthur H. Clark Co., 1998), 183–84.
42. Audrey M. Godfrey, “A Social History of Camp Floyd, Utah Territory, 1858–1861” (M.S. thesis, Utah State University, 1989); “Housewives, Hussies, and Heroines: The Women with Johnston’s Army,” *Utah Historical Quarterly* 54 (Spring 1986): 157–78. See also MacKinnon, “Epilogue to the Utah War: Impact and Legacy,” *Journal of Mormon History* 29 (Fall 2003): 227–34.
43. James W. McGill, *Rediscovered Frontiersman: Timothy Goodale* (Independence, Mo.: Oregon-California Trails Association, 2009).
44. Sandra Ailey Petree, ed., *Recollections of Past Days: The Autobiography of Patience Loader Rozsa Archer* (Logan: Utah State University Press, 2006).

45. MacKinnon, "Epilogue to the Utah War," 224–27, 234 and "Vita: Albert Gallatin Browne Jr., Brief Life of an Early War Correspondent: 1832–1891," *Harvard Magazine* 111 (November/December 2008): 48–49.
46. Richard D. Poll, "The Move South," *BYU Studies* 29 (Fall 1989): 65–88.
47. Susan Bohl, "A War on Civilians: Order Number 11 and the Evacuation of Western Missouri," *Prologue: The Journal of the National Archives* 36 (Spring 2004): 44–51.
48. Leonard J. Arrington, *Great Basin Kingdom*, 161–203 and "Mormon Finance and the Utah War," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 20 (July 1952): 219–38.
49. MacKinnon, "125 Years of Conspiracy Theories: Origins of the Utah Expedition of 1857–58," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 52 (Summer 1984): 219–22.
50. MacKinnon, "James Buchanan and the Crisis in Utah: Scope and Impact," paper for Buchanan National Symposium, September 20, 2008, Lancaster, Pa.
51. MacKinnon, "Epilogue to the Utah War," 219.
52. Kenneth N. Owens, e-mail message to MacKinnon, December 20, 2007, copy in author's possession. David L. Bigler, "Sources of Conflict: Mormons and Their Neighbors, 1830–90," lecture delivered to the Salt Lake Theological Seminary, July 25, 2003, copy in author's possession; "Theocracy Versus Republic: 'The Irrepressible Conflict,'" paper delivered at the Mormon History Association annual meeting, May 2006, Casper, Wyoming; "A Lion in the Path: Genesis of the Utah War, 1857–1858," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 76 (Winter 2008): 4–21.
53. "Do-Dah," an anti-federal folk song set to the music of Stephen A. Foster's popular "Camptown Races," allegedly sprang from the pen of Nauvoo Legion Lt. Isaac Bartlett Nash at the Pioneer Day celebration at Silver Lake on July 24, 1857. The song soon swept through Utah, acquired endless verses, and for the Mormon side took on the same role that "Yankee Doodle" served during the American Revolution. Nash, "The Life Story of Isaac B. Nash," L. Tom Perry Special Collections, Brigham Young University Library.
54. See John Updike, *Buchanan Dying: A Play* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1974) and *Memories of the Ford Administration: A Novel* (New York: Knopf, 1992). The latter, notwithstanding its title, was indeed a novel about a college professor beset by angst as he tries to complete a study of James Buchanan's presidency. Updike once explained to the author that his admittedly off-beat fascination ("fetish") with Buchanan sprang from his realization decades ago that Old Buck was the only president from Updike's native state, if one excludes Dwight Eisenhower's post-White House residence in Gettysburg, Pennsylvania.
55. Anonymous, *Mormoniad* (Boston: A. Williams & Co., 1858); Leonard J. Arrington Papers (Box 147, Fd 7), Special Collections and Archives, Merrill-Cazier Library, Utah State University; Hope A. Hilton, "Wild Bill" Hickman and the Mormon Frontier (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 1988), 150. Professor William Deverell's longstanding interest in *Mormoniad* sprang from our early 1980s discussion of Utah War sources for a seminar paper that he was writing at Princeton's graduate school, a fascination that resurfaced in the text of his Tanner Lecture at the Mormon History Association's May 2007 annual conference in Salt Lake City; for the lecture's text see Deverell, "Thoughts from the Farther West: Mormons, California, and the Civil War," *Journal of Mormon History* 34 (Spring 2008): 1–19. For a few excerpted verses from the poem, see MacKinnon, "125 Years of Conspiracy Theories: Origins of the Utah Expedition of 1857–58," *Utah Historical Quarterly* 52 (Summer 1984): 226. More recently, Col. Kenneth L. Alford, U.S. Army (retired), has joined the search for *Mormoniad*'s author.
56. For Mormon views of Morrell during the late 1850s see MacKinnon, "'Lonely Bones': Leadership and Utah War Violence," *Journal of Mormon History* 33 (Spring 2007): 154–55. In the early 1860s he migrated from Salt Lake City to Montana Territory in pursuit of gold along with several other adventuresome civilian veterans of the Utah War, including Washington Jay McCormick, Utah's former interim U.S. attorney and a subsequent founder of Missoula, and John S. (Jack) Mendenhall, who became a prominent Montana merchant.
57. What is known of Finlay's colorful and sometimes sordid adventures in Ireland, England, South Africa, India, Australia, and the U.S. is summarized in MacKinnon, *At Sword's Point*,

- Part 1*, 196–208, 459–63, and “Too Fond of Fighting.” An account of Bennett’s December 1857 decision to defer to McLaughlin by ceding to him the captaincy of Company B, to which Bennett’s peers had just elected him, appears in his unpublished reminiscences, copy in author’s possession courtesy of the late George R. Bennett, a descendant.
58. See MacKinnon, “The Buchanan Spoils System and the Utah Expedition: Careers of W. M. F. Magraw and John M. Hockaday,” *Utah Historical Quarterly* 31 (Spring 1963): 127–50. Hockaday’s year of death (1865) appears in a memorial sent to Congress by his heirs in 1874, Petition, December 26, 1874, Records of the U.S. Senate (RG 46), SEN 43A-H11.3, National Archives, Washington. Attempting to track John M. Hockaday’s later life through that of his brother and Salt Lake City business partner, Isaac (Ike) Hockaday, also runs into a confusing plethora of men bearing the same name in a variety of Missouri counties.
 59. Brigham Young’s gubernatorial successor, Alfred Cumming, made frequent use of young Worthen as a courier and commended him and one of his Kimball relatives to Albert Sidney Johnston as “gentlemen of the highest respectability. They have no connection with the church.” Cumming, letter to Johnston, April 15, 1858, Hafen and Hafen, *The Utah Expedition*, 288. Nonetheless there are signs that Fay Worthen had perhaps unwittingly been coopted by his Mormon associates, revealing to them names of people in Salt Lake City who visited the new governor in confidence to seek federal protection for their out-migration and spreading to newspaper editors along the Kansas-Missouri frontier the myth concocted by Thomas L. Kane of a serious war/peace factional split among Utah’s leaders, with Brigham Young leading those seeking to prevent conflict.
 60. The only known record of Smith’s presence at Fort Bridger during the winter of 1857–1858 appears in correspondent A.G. Browne Jr.’s brief description of Stowell’s legal defense. Browne, dispatch, January 5, 1858, “Mormon Prisoner—His Trial,” *New York Daily Tribune*, March 1, 1858.
 61. See Arthur Conan Doyle’s 1887 tale *A Study in Scarlet*. For that story’s place in the Sherlock Holmes canon and Doyle’s fascinating but often inaccurate discussion of Mormonism, see Michael W. Homer, “‘Recent Psychic Evidence’: The Visit of Sir Arthur Conan Doyle to Utah in 1923,” *Utah Historical Quarterly* 52 (Summer 1984): 264–74.