Utah State University
DigitalCommons@USU

All Graduate Plan B and other Reports | Graduate Studies, School of

5-1-2014

# "Everybody has the be Someplace": Twentieth-Centure Pedagogies of Place and Curricular Possibilities for the Intermountain West

Jacob Sheetz-Willard
*Utah State University*

Recommended Citation
Sheetz-Willard, Jacob, ""Everybody has the be Someplace": Twentieth-Centure Pedagogies of Place and Curricular Possibilities for the Intermountain West" (2014). *All Graduate Plan B and other Reports.* Paper 392.
http://digitalcommons.usu.edu/gradreports/392

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate Studies, School of at DigitalCommons@USU. It has been accepted for inclusion in All Graduate Plan B and other Reports by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@USU. For more information, please contact becky.thoms@usu.edu.

# "EVERYBODY HAS TO BE SOMEPLACE": TWENTIETH-CENTURY PEDAGOGIES OF PLACE AND CURRICULAR POSSIBILITIES FOR THE INTERMOUNTAIN WEST

by

Jacob Sheetz-Willard

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree

of

MASTER OF SCIENCE

in

History

Approved:

| | |
|---|---|
| Dr. Victoria Grieve<br>Major Professor | Dr. Christopher Conte<br>Committee Member |
| Dr. Paul Crumbley<br>Committee Member | |

UTAH STATE UNIVERSITY
Logan, Utah

2014

In 1977, riding a wave of environmental enthusiasm that had crested in the United States over the course of the previous decade, Wendell Berry published his classic agricultural jeremiad, *The Unsettling of America*. Berry, a novelist, poet, essayist, and farmer decried the environmental and cultural consequences of the large-scale, commercial agriculture that had overtaken the American landscape in the postwar years. He characterized the shift away from a producerist economy of independent farmers to a society oriented around consumption and growth as a Faustian bargain, an agricultural "colonialism" that devalued the individual and ravaged the land in the name of Progress. "It is necessary to account for a new intensity of greed," he wrote, "a greed newly empowered, under no constraint to see itself as evil, allied (so it believes) with a manifest destiny and the way of the world."[1] Underlying the trend toward large-scale industrial production and its accompanying ecological degradation, according to the author, was a Cartesian split – an insidious psychological dualism with deep roots in the Western tradition. Berry argued that a disembodied rationalism concerning economic affairs prevented Americans from fully acknowledging the environmental and cultural costs of their destructive relationship to the land. The severance of mind from body – the separation of physical and metaphysical realities – contributed to a literal and metaphoric uprooting, destroying in the process a moral order founded on the intuitive understanding of ecological principles. Generational knowledge and respect for place had lost out to the ideology of technological optimism and unlimited economic growth. Americans no longer understood or cared about their relationship to the land. "Once we see our place, our part of the world, as *surrounding* us,"

[1] Wendell Berry, *The Unsettling of America: Culture and Agriculture*, Third Edition (San Francisco: Sierra Club Books, 1996), 56.

warned Berry, "we have already made a profound division between it and ourselves." He continued:

> We have given up the understanding – dropped it out of our language and so out of our thought – that we and our country create one another, depend on one another, are literally part of one another; that our land passes in and out of our bodies just as our bodies pass in and out of our land; that as we and our land are part of one another, so all who are living as neighbors here, human and plant and animal, are part of one another, and so cannot possibly flourish alone; that, therefore, our culture must be our response to our place...[2]

Berry's work was symptomatic of a broader current in American progressive discourse. For many writers, educators, and social critics, the cultural deracination of which he spoke contributed directly to the violence and cultural malaise that seemed to define Western civilization in the twentieth century. Although economic growth and technological progress had helped emancipate many in the United States from physical toil, food insecurity, and political exploitation, so too had it contributed to crises of identity, psychological insecurities, and a laissez-faire individualism devoid of ethical imperatives. Drawing on the insights of John Dewey, Kurt Hahn, Jane Addams, and others who saw education as the foundation of democratic projects and moral progress, educators in the United States began adopting curricula to address the socio-cultural void that emerged with globalization and the transition to consumer capitalism.[3]

"Place-based education" (PBE) was one such curricular project that gained traction in the last two decades of the twentieth century. With an emphasis on experiential modes of learning, place-based initiatives embrace a holistic approach to education in an increasingly fragmented and specialized world. David Gruenewald and Gregory Smith define this pedagogical model as a

---

[2] Berry, 22.
[3] Jay W. Roberts, *Beyond Learning by Doing: Theoretical Currents in Experiential Education* (New York: Routledge, 2012), 60-61.

"community-based effort to reconnect the process of education, enculturation, and human development to the well-being of community life."[4] Incorporating local histories, literatures, and environments is a hallmark of place-based curricula, as is a focus on the political and moral implications of acquired knowledge.[5] Place-based educators stress the interconnectedness of all life – both human and non-human – through close contact with natural environments and recognition of the narratives and historical events that shaped the human communities inhabiting those environments throughout history. Although still in its infancy as a pedagogical model, place-based education has grown remarkably over the past two decades, infiltrating state curricular standards and inspiring the creation of secondary schools dedicated to the knowledge of place.[6]

A relatively recent phenomenon in the history of American pedagogy, place-based learning emerged from a long tradition of educational discourse stretching all the way back to Jean-Jacques Rousseau's classic treatise on education, *Emile*.[7] It was a century and a half after Rousseau, however, before such alternative – or "progressive" – theories of education realized curricular implementation and gained acceptance in the West. Beginning with the great twentieth-century educational theorist John Dewey, American educators slowly adapted their curricula to draw on the experiences and innate capacities of their students.[8] Dewey's philosophical contributions and scholastic experimentation inaugurated a shift away from

---

[4] David A. Gruenewald and Gregory A. Smith, "Making Room for the Local," in Gruenewald and Smith, eds., *Place-Based Education in the Global Age* (New York: Lawrence Erlbaum, 2008), xvi.
[5] David Sobel, *Childhood and Nature: Design Principles for Educators* (Portland, ME: Stenhouse Publishers, 2008), 9-13.
[6] See, for example, the "core standards" and objectives in place for the teaching of "Utah History" at the secondary level: <http://www.uen.org/core/core.do?courseNum=6100>. Some of the myriad independent schools that have adopted a place-based pedagogical model include the Teton Science Schools in Jackson Hole, Wyoming, the Watershed School in Boulder, Colorado, the High Mountain Institute in Leadville, Colorado, the Conserve School in Land O'Lakes, Wisconsin, and the Mountain School in Vershire, Vermont.
[7] Jay W. Roberts, *Beyond Learning by Doing*, 31-2. See also: Amelie Oksenberg Rorty, "Rousseau's Educational Experiments," in Rorty, ed. *Philosophers on Education: New Historical Perspectives* (New York: Routledge, 1998). 237-51.
[8] Arthur Zilversmit, *Changing Schools: Progressive Education Theory and Practice, 1930-1960* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993), 1-18.

classicist educational models reliant on deductive reasoning and abstract logic, towards models rooted in student experience.[9] His philosophy of education provided the theoretical impetus for the adoption of progressive curricular models in American schools throughout the twentieth century, up to and including the most recent place-based iterations.

**John Dewey and the Roots of Experiential Education**

Born and educated in rural Vermont during the tumultuous decades of the 1860s and '70s, Dewey sought to address what he saw as the paralyzing disconnect between classroom activity and broader social processes. After earning a doctorate at Johns Hopkins, the young academic assumed a teaching post at the University of Chicago and there became associated with the nascent field of philosophic pragmatism.[10] Along with his most famous colleague in American pragmatism, the eminent psychologist William James, Dewey argued that philosophy should serve the interests of the American public; more than an immaterial pastime for a bourgeois class of dilettantes, he believed that philosophical knowledge could address the most pressing social questions of industrial society. Dewey, writes Richard Rorty, "viewed the United States as an opportunity to see ultimate significance in a finite, human, historical project, rather than in something eternal and nonhuman… [he] wanted the struggle for social justice to be the country's animating principle, the nation's soul."[11] At the heart of this project for Dewey was reinvigorating American democracy through the institution of public education.

---

[9] John Dewey, *Experience and Education* (New York: Collier MacMillan, 1938), 17-9.
[10] See: Richard Rorty, *Achieving our Country: Leftist Thought in Twentieth-Century America* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1997), 18-30.
[11] Richard Rorty, *Achieving our Country*, 17-8.

Through his work at the University of Chicago's Laboratory School – an experimental primary school in Chicago's Hyde Park neighborhood – Dewey developed a theory of education that would become his seminal contribution to American progressive discourse. He began from the proposition that the transformation of American society over the course of the previous century challenged the epistemological assumptions of earlier epochs in human history. The emergence of industrial capitalism, along with Darwin's paradigmatic challenge to the Judeo-Christian worldview, necessitated a new approach to learning and the transmission of knowledge. Dewey contended that "the attempt to induce educators to return to the methods and ideals that arose centuries before [the] scientific method was developed… is so out of touch with all the conditions of modern life that I believe it is folly to seek salvation in this direction."[12] He rejected philosophic idealism and deductive logic for a temporally specific reasoning grounded in the scientific method: "the scientific method," he wrote, "is the only authentic means at our command for getting at the significance of our everyday experiences of the world in which we live."[13] Learning was no longer an end in itself, as in the classicist model, but a means through which to comprehend the vicissitudes of the modern order and propose concrete solutions to the problems plaguing American civil society.

Efforts at educational reform in the twentieth century reflected the confluence of social, political, economic, and demographic forces that radically transformed American society in the decades following the Civil War. It was in many ways the transition to modernity in America that lent Dewey's philosophy popular credence. Although there is considerable historiographical debate as to the definition and utility of *modernity* as a theoretical concept, it nonetheless

---

[12] Dewey, *Experience and Education*, 86.
[13] Dewey, *Experience in Education*, 88.

provides a helpful framework through which to understand and appreciate the philosophical milieu in which Dewey and his contemporaries operated.

Scholars have disagreed over whether to conceptualize modernity primarily as an historical epoch or as an intellectual framework.[14] Kristin Ross, for example, locates the emergence of modernity in the twentieth century (especially the postwar era in France), whereas Jurgen Habermas points to the eighteenth-century Enlightenment and Marshall Berman describes a process dating to the sixteenth century.[15] The uncertainty surrounding periodization suggests that, rather than binding modernity to a fixed set of dates, scholars should use it as an analytical tool, an indicator of historical attitudes accompanying economic, political, and social change. Towards this end, Anthony Giddens contends that doubt and reflexivity are hallmarks of modern institutions and patterns of thought.[16] So too does Berman locate modernity in the "atmosphere – of agitation and turbulence, psychic dizziness and drunkenness, expansion of experiential possibilities and destruction of personal boundaries and bonds, self-enlargement and self-derangement, phantoms in the street and in the soul."[17]

Even when early twentieth-century thinkers in the United States failed to reference "modernity" explicitly, their response to the profound socioeconomic transformations of the era embodied the reflexive and ambivalent attitude that many scholars have identified as distinctly modern. "Modern mankind," writes Marshall Berman, "found itself in the midst of a great

---

[14] Simon Gunn, *History and Cultural Theory* (Harlow, England: Pearson-Longman, 2006), 109. Because my historical subjects were all Americans, the debate over singular or multiple modernities is largely irrelevant, but that is another crucial debate in the scholarship of modernity: S.N Eisenstadt argues that we should reevaluate the center-periphery dynamics of modern society and recognize that, though the West always "constituted the crucial (and usually ambivalent) reference point" for modernization programs in non-Western nations, these nations developed their own coherent modernities that diverged significantly from the Western blueprint (2); see Eisenstadt, "Multiple Modernities," *Daedalus* 129 (Winter, 2000):1-29. Peter van der Veer counters Eisenstadt's claim by yoking modernity to the nation-state; see van der Veer, "The Global History of 'Modernity,'" *The Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient* 41/3 (1998): 285-94.

[15] Kristin Ross, *Fast Cars, Clean Bodies: Decolonization and the Reordering of French Culture* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 1995), 3; Jurgen Habermas, "Modernity versus Postmodernity," *New German Critique* 22 (Winter, 1981): 9; Marshall Berman, *All That is Solid Melts into Air: The Experience of Modernity* (New York: Penguin Books, 1982), 16-7.

[16] Anthony Giddens, *Modernity and Self-Identity: Self and Society in the Late Modern Age* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1991), 2-3.

[17] Berman, 18.

absence and emptiness of values, and yet, at the same time, a remarkable abundance of possibilities."[18] Progressive reformers responded to the perceived "absence" of value wrought by the political and economic upheavals of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries in a variety of ways. While some put their faith in the Social Gospel and capitalist development, others sought the reinvigoration of community and democratic institutions through education. They advanced new moral possibilities through traditional value systems, national and global understanding through local knowledge, the flourishing of democracy through individual choice, and a new collective identity fashioned from the inherited myths and symbols of the past. Their constructed identity was inherently paradoxical; though they rejected the deleterious aspects of modernity associated with industrial production, socioeconomic dependency, and psychological fragmentation, their revisionary and self-reflexive vision for society relied on inherently modern forms of knowledge and ways of knowing. They engaged in the "reflexive project of the self," which Anthony Giddens argues "consists in the sustaining of coherent, yet continuously revised, biological narratives, [and] takes place in the context of multiple choice as filtered through abstract systems."[19] By wielding the tools of modernity, John Dewey and other progressive educators sought to reconcile traditional American values with contemporary political, social, and economic realities; central to that project was an emphasis on community, local knowledge, individual possibility, and the incorporation of the scientific method in the classroom.

According to Dewey, one could truly utilize the scientific method only through direct contact – or "experience" – with one's local environment. Indeed, experience proved the defining trait of Dewey's new scholastic model, the unifying concept that pervaded his writings

[18] Berman, 21.
[19] Giddens, 5.

and animated his theory of education.[20] As Dewey conceded after several decades of classroom experimentation, however, not all experiences were created equal. He suggested that the inherent danger in all progressive educational initiatives was the desire to reject all the methods and aims of traditional education in favor of student-directed experiential learning – to proceed from the conviction that, because classicist pedagogy had become ineffective, the total embrace of student experiences should be valued as a *sine qua non* for pedagogical competency. "There is always the danger in a new movement," he wrote, "that in rejecting the aims and methods of that which it would supplant, it may develop its principles negatively rather than positively and constructively."[21] To this end, he suggested conceptualizing experience as a continuum on which "every experience is a moving force" to be judged "on the ground of what it moves toward or into."[22] The role of teachers, therefore, was not to serve as repositories of accumulated knowledge, but to enliven and direct within their students an intrinsic capacity for learning through the conscious control of external stimuli. The educator was to carefully modify learning environments in order to facilitate internal development with a discernable outcome in mind. Experiences should draw on the subjective capacities of each individual learner and "prepare a person for experiences of a deeper and more expansive quality."[23] Such distinctions proceeded from Dewey's epistemological assumption that the primary value of education should be the development of innate capacities, not vocational preparedness or the imposition of an extrinsic body of knowledge.

---

[20] See: Roberts, *Beyond Learning by Doing*, 48-61. In *Experience and Education*, Dewey himself argued that the "fundamental unity of the newer philosophy is found in the idea that there is an intimate and necessary relation between the processes of actual experience and education." (19) Opportunities for experience within the classroom was how he demarcated progressive, inductive forms of education oriented around the scientific method, from older, top-down forms of learning.
[21] Dewey, *Experience and Education*, 20.
[22] Dewey, *Experience and Education*, 38.
[23] Dewey, Experience and Education, 47.

Dewey imagined the school community as the lynchpin of American democracy. Not only a profoundly social institution that mirrored the relationships of broader society, the nation's educational system also shaped the citizens that would bear the burden of democracy in the future. For a society in flux like the United States at the turn of the century, education could no longer be modeled under the assumptions of a discernible past. According to Dewey, the primary role of educators in the twentieth century was to prepare students to meet the challenges of a society in which the future was uncertain. Bound to the procrustean bed of inherited knowledge, students lacked the ability to make sense of reality and navigate their present circumstances. Dewey's philosophy of education was thus profoundly temporal. "We always live at the time we live and not at some other time," he wrote, "and only by extracting at each present time the full meaning of each present experience are we prepared for doing the same thing in the future. This is the only preparation which in the long run amounts to anything."[24] As he sought to temporalize education, so too did Dewey attempt to localize it. Teachers, argued Dewey, "should become intimately acquainted with the conditions of the local community, physical, historical, economic, occupational, etc., in order to utilize them as education resources."[25] Educators who integrated the broader community into their lesson plans would not only make learning relevant, they would acquaint students with the rights and responsibilities of American citizenship. Like other Progressive contemporaries, Dewey stressed the moral and civic imperatives that accompanied the acquisition of knowledge.

One particularly salient manifestation of Dewey's ideology – and an important precursor to place-based education – came in the form of the so-called "nature study" movement, which gained traction in the States around the turn of the century. Nature study advocates decried the

---

[24] Dewey, *Experience and Education*, 49.
[25] Dewey, *Experience and Education*, 40.

artificiality of classroom education and the stultifying effects of excessive rationalization. Inspired by their romantic and transcendental predecessors, nature study enthusiasts like Dewey, Colonel Francis Wayland Parker, Liberty Hyde Bailey, Anna Botsford Comstock, and Wilbur Jackman sought to immerse students in the local environment to both cultivate the inborn curiosity of youth and provide tangible subject matter for students to explore, observe, and analyze.[26] Not only would direct contact with the natural world facilitate an understanding of environmental processes and promote inquisitiveness, proponents also cited the moral, civic, and aesthetic benefits of nature study. Nature study combated the atomizing tendency of modern life by enlivening within the student an appreciation for the interconnectedness of the biological community and a sympathy for other sentient beings; in short, nature study promoted a holistic approach to education. Writing in 1907, the Columbia engineer L.H. Baekeland decried the "lack of broad-mindedness" that caused humans to "fall short of our theories." "We eagerly forget," he wrote, "that other living creatures enjoy life and suffer, feel and think as we ourselves, if not exactly in the same way. Some of us claim to be civilized and yet find high pleasure and recreation in hunting, killing, maiming and torturing defenseless animals."[27] For Baekeland, a proper reverence for the natural world separated civilized peoples from their barbarous ancestors. For nature study advocates, the outdoors classroom was a microcosm of the broader society and a humane regard for the natural world prefigured ethical citizenship.

As with progressive educational initiatives more broadly, nature study exemplified the paradoxes inherent in the transition to modernity. On the one hand, the methods and techniques of scientific investigation that provided nature study a semblance of disciplinary merit were products of modern science. As such, nature study had its corollary in contemporary efforts at

---

[26] See: Kevin C. Armitage, *The Nature Study Movement in America: The Forgotten Populizer of America's Conservation Ethic* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2009), 42-71.
[27] L.H. Baekeland, "The Danger of Overspecialization," *Science* 25 (May 1907): 853-4.

industrial Taylorism, Social Darwinism, and the proliferation of manufacturing technology. On the other hand, however, nature study represented a profound critique of the dehumanizing effects of industrial capitalism, urbanization, social reorganization, and the decline of religious enthusiasm in American life. "Progressive science education," writes Kevin Armitage, "emanated from the contradictions inherent to the rationalizing imperatives of the scientific method and the moral commitment to pedagogy built on the holistic and natural development of the child."[28] Nature study thus occupied a tenuous but dynamic terrain in American intellectual life at the turn of the century. A society irrevocably transformed by new technologies and the burgeoning industrial economy, progressive reformers still clung to the morality and civic values of an earlier era. The reconciliation of past and present thus proved the crux of educational initiatives at the turn of the century. Like their progressive colleagues in the settlement houses, the country-life movement, and conservation, Dewey, Parker, Comstock, and other educational reformers sought to alleviate the most egregious abuses of industrial capitalism through a nature-based pedagogy that promoted moral development, civic engagement, and the cultivation of a spiritual and aesthetic sensibility.

Recently, scholars and critics have pointed out that Dewey's democratic proclivities in fact belied an insidious authoritarianism that tended to police the boundaries of class, race, and gender within the classroom. Maxine Greene, for example, has argued that "the effects of environment, class membership, economic status, physical limitations, as well as the impacts of exclusion and ideology" are all implicated and reinforced in the selection of criteria to direct experiential learning.[29] However implicit, the biases and assumptions of the educator are made manifest in curricular choices and often reflect a particular set of values and ideals. Critical

---

[28] Armitage, *The Nature Study Movement in America*, 61.
[29] Maxine Greene, *The Dialectic of Freedom* (New York: Teacher's College Press of Columbia University, 1988), 8-9.

theorists such as Theodor Adorno, Herbert Marcuse, and Paulo Friere, for example, have explored how classroom pedagogy tends to define – or "distort" – perceptual possibilities and institutionalize inequality.[30] Critical theorists argue that experiential education has not so much dismantled the power structures of traditional pedagogy as it has given those structures new form; in such interpretations, the hegemony of the dominant culture remains intact under the guise of progressive education.

Despite the recent challenge of critical theory, Dewey's ghost continues to haunt progressive educational projects well into the twentieth-first century. Educational reform was inseparable from the transition to modernity throughout the twentieth century. The cultural milieu from which place-based education emerged was both a reaction to, and a product of, the profound economic transformations and social upheavals that drastically altered the landscape of American society in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Dewey recognized the growing obsolescence of traditional epistemologies and the need for new forms of knowledge to address the realities of industrial society. At the same time, his philosophy reflected a visceral longing for older forms of social organization. In particular, the ubiquitous invocation of the concept of "community" throughout the history of progressive education suggests this fundamental paradox.[31] The rise of place-based education, therefore, much like its earlier Deweyan iterations, cannot be understood apart from the paradoxes inherent in the socioeconomic upheavals wrought by globalization.

---

[30] Roberts, *Beyond Learning by Doing*, 71. See also: Michael W. Apple, *Ideology and Curriculum* (New York: Routledge, 2004), 17-25. Apple suggests that "a good deal of curricular and more general educational theory has acted as a set of ideological blinders that prevents a more serious and searching inquiry into both the unequal institutional structures of American society and the relationship between the school and these structures." (18)

[31] "The key feature of a notion of community in addressing… educational issues," writes Barry Franklin, "is its imprecise meaning, which allows proponents of an array of political and ideological persuasions to make use of it" (4). See: Barry Franklin, *Curriculum, Community, and Urban School Reform* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010).

**Place-Based Education in a Globalized World**

Although grounded in Dewey's theory of experiential education and sharing nature study's emphasis on local bioregions, place-based education (PBE) matured into a coherent pedagogy only within the past two decades. Coming together under the aegis of the Orion Society, particularly within the work of Laurie Lane-Zucker, John Elder, and David Sobel, place-based education came to describe an ideology of education that utilized the local community as a vehicle for understanding global phenomenon and broad historical processes.[32] At the heart of place-based education is an attempt to counter the deracinating tendencies of modern life by reconnecting students with their local environment and emphasizing the fundamental linkages that unify human and natural communities. Lane-Zucker has referred to place-based education as "the pedagogy of community, the reintegration of the individual into her homeground and the restoration of the essential links between a person and her place."[33] A comparatively decentralized impulse in educational reform, several discernable themes have nonetheless joined place-based educators across time and space. Most importantly, such pedagogy places experience in the local community at the forefront of curricular development. So too do place-based educators encourage the active creation of knowledge by students rather than passive consumption of predigested information. Additionally, pedagogies of place rely on some measure of student input and the preexisting resources of the local environment to determine the content of education; through community-based projects and initiatives, in particular, place-

[32] See in particular: David Sobel, *Place-Based Education: Connecting Communities and Classrooms* (Great Barrington, MA: The Orion Society, 2004); David Sobel, *Beyond Ecophobia: Reclaiming the Heart in Nature Education* (Great Barrington, MA: The Orion Society, 1999); *Stories in the Land: A Place-Based Education Anthology*, John Elder, ed. (Great Barrington, MA: The Orion Society, 1998); Gregory A. Smith, "Place-Based Education: Learning to Be Where We Are," *Phi Delta Kappan* 83 (April 2002): 584-94; Clifford E. Knapp, "The 'I – Thou' Relationship, Place-Based Education, and Aldo Leopold," *Journal of Experiential Education* 27 (2005): 277-85.
[33] Laurie Lane-Zucker, "Forward," in Sobel, *Place-Based Education*," ii.

based educators work to dissolve the boundaries between classroom and community. Finally, teachers assume an alternative role in place-based classrooms. As in Dewey's experimental schools, teachers function less as repositories of accumulated knowledge and more as "experienced guides, co-learners, and brokers of community resources and learning possibilities."[34]

Though united in methodological approach and curricular goals, place-based educators are more essentially bound by their assumptions about the function of education in contemporary American society. Like Dewey, who viewed education as the catalyst through which to reinvigorate American civil society in the face of social and economic upheaval, place-based education has emerged as a counterforce to the perceived cultural malaise brought on by globalization. Termed the "new localism" by David Gruenewald and Gregory Smith, educators working within this paradigm attempt to combat the atomizing and destructive tendencies of the global economy – especially in terms of human relations, ecological degradation, and market exploitation – through enculturation within a local context.[35]

Partly an expansion of the market forces that facilitated modernization in the early twentieth century, globalization describes a process of spatial and temporal consolidation through new technologies and new economic relations. Though expansive trade networks and economic interdependence existed well before the twentieth century, globalization reflects the unique scope and accelerated pace of such transformations in the postwar era; according to this theory, transnational corporations have begun to replace nation-states as the loci of global power. As with earlier theoretical constructs such as modernity, there is considerable scholarly debate concerning how best to conceptualize the process of globalization. Lisa Lowe links this term to

---

[34] Gregory A. Smith, "Place-Based Education: Learning to Be Where We Are," 592-3.
[35] David A. Gruenewald and Gregory A. Smith, "Making Room for the Local," xii, in Gruenewald and Smith, eds., *Place-Based Education in the Global Age* (New York: Lawrence Erlbaum, 2008).

the "unprecedented expansion of capitalism on a global scale." "Globalization is a phenomenon that exceeds existing means of explanation and representation," she continues, "[it] involves processes and transformations that bring pressure upon the paradigms formerly used to study their privileged objects – whether society, the sovereign nation-state, national economy, history, or culture – the meanings of which have shifted and changed."[36] The paradigm shifts wrought by globalization have posed a challenge for educators, politicians, scholars, and citizens alike. The new economic order has necessitated the reevaluation or abandonment of older cosmologies. The process of secularization and bureaucratization Max Weber described a century earlier as the "disenchantment of the world" has continued unabated into the twenty-first century, leaving in its wake generations of disaffected and disillusioned individuals no longer conscious of their place in a broader order.[37]

The psychological dislocations and apparent deterioration of the social fabric exacerbated (somewhat paradoxically) by information technologies and an economic system intended to facilitate connection across geographical boundaries has given the "new localism" in education its sense of urgency. According to educators, young people who lack a tangible sense of purpose within their local community are prone to see themselves as spectators rather than agents in larger historical processes and their own autobiographies. "Alienation is often the consequence of the absence of experiences that confirm our value to the people with whom we share our lives," writes Smith. Indeed, the "primary value of place-based education lies in the way that it

---

[36] Lisa Lowe, "Globalization," in *Keywords for American Cultural Studies* (New York: New York University Press, 2007), <http://dist.lib.usu.edu/login?qurl=http%3A%2F%2Fsearch.credoreference.com%2Fcontent%2Fentry%2Fnyupacs%2Fglobalization%2F0>.

[37] Max Weber quoted in Kristina Karin Shull, "Is the Magic Gone? Weber's 'Disenchantment of the World' and its Implications for Art in Today's World," *Anamesa* 11 (Fall 2005): 61-73. Though Weber's historical purview was the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, the trajectories he described in *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism* have continued to influence the perception of life for many individuals in the modern world. "The fate of our times," he wrote, "is characterized by rationalization and intellectualization, and above all, by the 'disenchantment of the world." His prescient analysis articulates a sense of deracination and uprootedness that has largely informed progressive educational initiatives in the latter half of the twentieth century. See: Max Weber, *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism, with Other Writings on the Rise of the West*, Stephen Kalberg, trans. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009).

serves to strengthen children's connections to others and to the regions in which they live… it helps overcome the alienation and isolation of individuals," which Smith refers to as the "hallmarks of modernity."[38] Clifford E. Knapp likewise suggests that "place-based education is a response to feeling alienated from nature and human nature."[39] In the very first paragraph of her foreword to David Sobel's *Place-Based Education: Connecting Classrooms and Communities*, Laurie Lane-Zucker makes explicit the link between globalization and curricular reform. "In an increasingly globalized world," she writes,

> there are often pressures for communities and regions to subordinate themselves to the dominant economic models and to devalue their local cultural identity, traditions, and history in preference to a flashily marketed homogeneity… A process of disintegration occurs as basic connections to the land fray and communities become less resilient and less able to deal with the dislocations that globalization and ecological deterioration bring about. A community's health – human and more-than-human – suffers.[40]

For place-based educational theorists, globalization represents a twofold threat. On the one hand, individuals lack a basic sense of rootedness and purpose that connects them to a human community; on the other hand, uninhibited economic growth also threatens the stability of the ecological community on which humans depend for the necessities of life. Just as nature study proved inexplicable from the nascent conservation impulse at the turn of the century, so too does place-based education reflect an environmental consciousness at odds with the dominant capitalist ethos of the era.

The emphasis on environmental stewardship, however, also highlights some important ambiguities at the heart of place-based education. Connecting students to local (especially rural) communities often means grappling with economic realities that clash with the overarching

---

[38] Smith, "Place-Based Education: Learning to Be Where We Are," 593, 594.
[39] Knapp, "The 'I – Thou' Relationship, Place-Based Education, and Aldo Leopold," 278.
[40] Laurie Lane-Zucker, "Forward," in Sobel, *Place-Based Education*," i.

environmentalist telos of place-based learning. Extractive industries in particular, such as mining and logging, often represent the lifeblood of rural communities, and finding a balance between environmental responsibility and economic vitality within such communities remains an unresolved tension. One educator working in the heart of northern New Hampshire's logging region suggested the lukewarm reception awaiting environmental educators: community members "assumed we wanted to teach children that cutting down trees was bad and that by extension, people that cut down trees (their parents) were also bad."[41] For an educational philosophy founded on the ostensible rejection of knowledge as predetermined end – "a finished project" – overt political agendas threaten the epistemological value of student experience as a guide to learning.[42]

Nonetheless, many scholars and theorists acknowledge that "the education of individuals is an intensely political endeavor."[43] Whereas the format of traditional pedagogy hides its political assumptions behind a façade of objectivity, thus facilitating an insidious form of authoritarianism in regards to legitimate knowledge, progressive educators tout political agency as an explicit goal of classroom experience. The inherently subjective nature of curriculum development and experiential outcomes make the depoliticization of knowledge both impossible and, ultimately, undesirable. Rather than sanitize classroom experience to eliminate or downplay the ethical and political imperatives of education, place-based educators promote critical thinking in order to make possible the conscientious application of knowledge and learning within the

---

[41] Quoted in Sobel, *Place-Based Education*, 60.
[42] Dewey, *Experience and Education*, 19.
[43] D. Brent Edwards Jr., "Critical Pedagogy and Democratic Education: Possibilities for Cross-Pollination," *Urban Review* 42 (2010), 222. See also: Tony Knight and Arthur Pearl, "Democratic Education and Critical Pedagogy," *Urban Review* 32 (2000): 197-226.

broader community; in the words of one institution, students should learn "how to think, not what to think."[44]

**A Framework for Place-Based Education in the Intermountain West**

In a 1975 forum on regional identity in literature, the poet Kenneth Hanson wrote that, "Regionalism is as dead as the [passenger] pigeon. It ended as a possibility at latest with World War II… Regionalism is an anachronism, and its reflection in literature is sentimentalism, an exercise in wishful thinking or nostalgia."[45] Given the criticisms from scholars like Hanson, and the ambiguities and tensions at the heart of progressive, place-based pedagogy, what value might a curriculum that privileges regional history and local identity have for twenty-first-century students living in the Intermountain West? Why stress local experiences and local histories when the trajectory of political and economic life so clearly favors global processes, cultural homogenization, and spatial leveling? As place-based educators, do we risk inculcating within our students a narrow parochialism, an intellectually malignant form of "sentimentalism" unable to seriously meet the demands of the globalized world order to which we are inextricably bound? Although Hanson's voice is indicative of a broader critique of scholarly regionalism and place-based learning, his object of derision is essentially a straw man. What he categorizes as a nostalgic celebration of the past at the expense of the present has never represented a serious current within contemporary theories of place and place-based education. The eminent geographer and theorist of place Yi-Fu Tuan asserts that, what Hanson characterizes as a shallow

---

[44] "Five Core Values Govern Teaching and Learning at the High Mountain Institute," <http://www.hminet.org/semester-and-summer-term/academics/why-hmi-academics>.
[45] Kenneth O. Hanson, "The Writer's Sense of Place: A Symposium and Commentaries," *South Dakota Review* 13 (Fall 1975): 21.

"[t]raditionalism, a return to some sentimentalized, unspecified past," is not only undesirable, but "in our global village, it is in any case impossible."[46] Rather than glorifying the past or viewing regional knowledge as an end in itself, place-based educators use the local community and environment as a means to shed light on global historical processes.

Place-based education serves a twofold purpose in contemporary American society. It is at once a pragmatic pedagogy designed to empower students towards agency within their own communities – Dewey's legacy – and, at the same time, it represents a countervailent against the deracinating tendencies of global capitalism and technological innovation. The latter rationale has in fact provided place-based education its enormous psychosocial appeal. "The uprooting, leveling nature of American experience evokes a counterdesire for stability and more intimate places of identity," write Michael Steiner and David Wrobel, "The sheer immensity of the United States engenders the need for subnational places of belonging, and regional loyalty often emerges as a conscious response to the emptiness of mass culture and the nation-state."[47] Though scholars are (justifiably) quick to dismiss the chest-thumping essentialist discourses of Lost Cause regionalism, they must nonetheless grapple with the reality that regional identification remains a vital force in American civic life. The constructed-ness of such regional identities in no way abrogates their usefulness as objects of critical inquiry. And perhaps no region provides as much historical fodder for an investigation of place, myth, and identity as the American West.

From Thomas Jefferson to Frederick Jackson Turner, John Wayne to Chief Washakie, Brigham Young to Bernard DeVoto, the landscapes of the American West have been imbued with symbolic potency by generations of Americans. What was a once spiritual space charged with cosmic significance for the original inhabitants became a site of religious refuge for the

---

[46] Yi-Fu Tuan, *Cosmos and Hearth: A Cosmopolite's Viewpoint* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1996), 8.
[47] Michael C. Steiner and David M. Wrobel, "Many Wests: Discovering a Dynamic Western Regionalism," in David M. Wrobel and Michael C. Steiner eds. *Many Wests: Place, Culture, and Regional Identity,* 1-30.

Mormon pioneers, a landscape of pecuniary possibility for railroad men and miners, and an aesthetic playground for vertically-inclined recreationists. Often mythologized beyond the point of recognition, the American West has occupied a tenuous middle ground between perception and reality, human possibility and environmental limitation, sacred aspiration and profane desecration. To begin to appreciate the myriad and often competing visions of what the West represents, it is necessary to think holistically about tangible historical and environmental processes as well as the more abstract narratives that have concurrently influenced the way people talk, write, and think about this arid, mountainous, and generally inhospitable region. I have designed the following outline to help place-based educators navigate the crucial components that have shaped the discourse of place in the Intermountain West over the previous two centuries.[48] These key topics include: place, frontiers, people, water, and resources. In order to emphasize key questions about place, identity, and history, I have privileged thematic cohesion over chronological linearity. Though each section exhibits a centripetal focus on a single key issue, the themes are mutually referential; each individual stratum builds on the others in a process of intellectual aggradation. After beginning each section with a brief historiographical overview, I pose some key questions and suggest a brief bibliography of primary and secondary sources to inform classroom discussions and activities. Through my incorporation of outside materials, I have sought to balance historical perspectives with contemporary voices, academic articles with popular essays in order to make the material as relevant and compelling as possible.

---

[48] Delineating what one means by "West" is a geographical conundrum that has serious social, political, and environmental implications. For the purposes of this essay, I define the Intermountain West as the region bounded by the Rocky Mountains on the east and the Sierras and Cascades on the west, the Snake River watershed to the north, and the Mogollon Rim to the south, generally incorporating Utah, western Colorado, Nevada, western Wyoming, southern Idaho, Nevada, northwestern New Mexico, parts of southwestern Montana, eastern Oregon and Washington, and northern Arizona. Although encompassing a wide range of cultures and ecological conditions, this region is united fundamentally by climatic aridity. See: Wallace Stegner, "Living Dry," *Where the Bluebird Sings to the Lemonade Springs: Living and Writing in the West* (New York: Modern Library, 2002), 57-75.

One of the primary strengths of place-based education is its methodological openness and pedagogical decentralization; my intention, therefore, has not been to present a comprehensive overview of curricular material or lay out day-to-day lesson plans. Instead, I hope that this outline will help provide a philosophical framework for place-based educational initiatives across the Intermountain West. Though many of my resources are specific to Utah, the broader themes are ubiquitous throughout the arid West.

**Place**

The eponymous concept of place-based education, place emerged as a coherent theoretical construct in the 1970s through the work of geographers such as Yi-Fu Tuan.[49] Tuan sought to expand the perceptual purview of geographers by delineating the humanistic dimensions of space from the more conceptually circumscribed notion of "location," which had been the traditional focus of geography. "Place," argued Tuan, "has a history and meaning. [It] incarnates the experiences and aspirations of a people. Place is not only a fact to be explained in the broader frame of space, but it is also a reality to be clarified and understood from the perspective of the people who have given it meaning."[50] Tuan incorporates biology, cultural anthropology, literature, and history to consider how humans perceive literal space, how individuals create specific and definitive "places" from abstract and undifferentiated "spaces," and how men and women experience and describe places empirically, emotionally, and

[49] Yi-Fu Tuan is one of the most cited geographers in the literature of place-based education. See: Tuan, *Space and Place: The Perspective of Experience* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1977); Tuan, "Space and Place: Humanistic Perspective," in Stephen Gale and Gunnar Olsson, eds., *Philosophy in Geography* (Dordrecht, Holland: D. Reidel Publishing Company, 1979), 387-427; Tuan, *Cosmos and Hearth: A Cosmopolite's Viewpoint* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1996).
[50] Tuan, "Space and Place: Humanistic Perspective," 387.

conceptually.[51] He notes that there are three principal types of space: "mythic," "pragmatic," and "theoretical."[52] Perhaps the most pervasive of these three – and certainly the most relevant to place-based education – is "mythic" space. Tuan asserts that the conceptualization of mythic space is central to the human quest for identity and the desire to make sense of our physical surroundings. Through experience and thinking, we imbue abstract spaces with symbolic value and turn them into tangible places.[53] By projecting our hopes, desires, ideals, and ambitions onto the physical landscape, we create a mythic topography that has profound implications for all humans interacting with that environment.[54] Tuan suggests that the creation and valuation of space is both a reflection of particular cultural circumstances and an expression of innate human longings.

The West has always proved a morally charged topography in the American imagination. By setting the theoretical stage with a discussion of place as a "mythic" category, students will begin to delineate the moral and psychological elements of place from the biophysical components of landscape. Students will consider the parallels between early Mormon descriptions of Utah as an Intermountain Zion and earlier Native and European conceptions of the American landscape.[55] In addition, the juxtaposition of two contemporary essays will help shed light on the twin impulses that have to a great extent shaped the American discourse of place over the past centuries: rootedness and mobility. Wallace Stegner once referred to those

---

[51] Tuan, *Space and Place: The Perspective of Experience*, 6.
[52] *Ibid*., 17.
[53] *Ibid*., 136.
[54] *Ibid*., 88.
[55] Jared Farmer offers a compelling case study in this process. Examining the cultural evolution of Mt. Timpanogos from the days of the Utes through Mormon settlement in Utah Valley to the present, he argues that, "the senses of place that make present-day Americans feel at home would not exist without past displacements" (16). See: Farmer, *On Zion's Mount: Mormons, Indians, and the American Landscape* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2008);
Frederick S. Buchanon, "Imperial Zion: The British Occupation," *Utah History To Go*: <http://historytogo.utah.gov/people/ethnic_cultures/the_peoples_of_utah/imperialzion.html>; Leo Marx, *The Machine in the Garden: Technology and the Pastoral Ideal in America*, Thirty-fifth Anniversary Edition (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000). Marx's discussion of the pastoral ideal in American history remains a definitive source for exploring the intersections between cultural ideals and material reality as it played out in European ideas about the American landscape.

who embody such impulses as "boomers" and "stickers"; we might also imagine these competing traditions as Kerouac versus Faulkner, the automobile versus the village green.[56] The spokesperson for the latter mentality over the past fifty years, without a doubt, has been Wendell Berry. In "The Regional Motive," Berry argues that an "ethic and a way of life based upon devotion to a place and devotion to the land… hold[s] the only possibility, not just for a decent life, but for survival."[57] In a recent *High Country News* essay, however, John Daniel offers a provocative counterpoint to Berry's partisanship to place: "[If] shifting around disconnected from land and community is our national disease, I would argue—perversely perhaps, or perhaps just homeopathically—that it is also an element of our national health."[58] Daniel argues that humans – and by extension Americans – are by nature rootless, that we possess an instinctive desire for movement; he suggests that we learn and perceive more by moving around than by staying put. Students will use these two essays as a foundation from which to consider the broader movements, migrations, and dislocations within and throughout the Intermountain region.[59] Some questions to consider throughout this unit include: what are the benefits and limitations of local knowledge? What are some places we care about, and why? How have various groups of settlers thought of and talked about Utah? What do the landscapes of the

---

[56] Wallace Stegner quoted in Wendell Berry, *It All Turns on Affection: The Jefferson Lecture and Other Essays* (Berkeley: Counterpoint, 2012), 10. For a scholarly perspective on this dichotomy, see: Anne Hyde, "Transients and Stickers: The Problem of Community in the American West," in William Deverell, ed., *A Companion to the American West* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2004), 304-28.

[57] Wendell Berry, "The Regional Motive," *A Continuous Harmony: Essays Cultural and Agricultural* (San Diego: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1972), 70.

[58] John Daniel, "A Word in Favor of Rootlessness: The Joys and Perhaps Necessary Virtues of Not Settling Down," *High Country News* (December 2008) <http://www.hcn.org/articles/a-word-in-favor-of-rootlessness/article_view?searchterm=Place&b_start:int=0>.

[59] For more on these competing discourses, see: Barry Lopez, "We Are Shaped by the Sound of Wind, the Slant of Sunlight," *High Country News* (September 1998): <http://www.hcn.org/issues/138/4431>; Gretel Ehrlich, *The Solace of Open Spaces* (New York: Penguin Books, 1986), 1-15; C.L. Rawlins, "Everybody Has to Be Someplace," *High Country News* 14 (December 1982): 8-9. "One of America's greatest afflictions," writes Rawlins, "is a feeling of homelessness, estrangement, anomie. We accept these as modern axioms… [Yet,] the bedrock on which our view of the land and human affairs should rest is that the conduct of our lives should be shaped and vitalized by the land as a starting place."

Intermountain West symbolize, if anything? How do we define home?[60] How does one become native to a particular place or region? How do we delineate myth from reality when thinking and speaking about the American West?

**Frontier(s)**

"Up to our own day," wrote the historian Frederick Jackson Turner in 1893, "American history has been in a large degree the history of the colonization of the Great West. The existence of an area of free land, its continuous recession, and the advance of American settlement westward, explain American development."[61] Perhaps no historian has exerted a greater influence on both the scholarly and popular discourse of American history – for better or for worse – than Frederick Jackson Turner. His famous and infamous "Frontier Thesis" has spawned generations of proponents and critics in the hundred plus years since it was penned. Most significantly, the failure of Turner's pseudo-Weberian frontier types to adequately address the much more complex and contested realities of life in the West provided the impetus for the emergence of a "New Western History" in the 1980s.[62] Historians working within this new paradigm sought to reconceptualize the frontier and give voice to those marginalized groups on the periphery of Turner's historical narrative. Rather than viewing the frontier in Western history as a "process" with a discernible endpoint and teleological undertones, historians such as Patricia Nelson Limerick advocated instead the study of the West as a "place" with shifting boundaries

---

[60] "Home," writes Stegner, "is what you can take away with you" (169). Wallace Stegner, "At Home in the Fields of the Lord," in *The Sound of Mountain Water: The Changing American West* (New York: Penguin Books, 1980), 157-69.

[61] Frederick Jackson Turner, "The Significance of the Frontier in American History," *Proceedings of the Forty-First Annual Meeting of the State Historical Society of Wisconsin* (Madison, WI.) 79-112, reprinted in Clyde A Milner, ed., *Major Problems in the History of the American West* (Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989), 2-21.

[62] William Cronon offers one of the most lucid and balanced critiques of Turner's scholarship. See: Cronon, "Revisiting Turner's Vanishing Frontier," in Clyde A Milner, ed., *Major Problems in the History of the American West* (Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989), 668-81.

defined by ongoing conflict and conquest.[63] Like Limerick, William Cronon acknowledged the analytical shortcomings and limited explanatory value of Turner's theory. In contrast to the frontier, Cronon suggested thinking of the West in terms of abundance and scarcity, and, crucially, how the perception of those values has influenced the ongoing narrative of Western development. The definition of abundance and scarcity, wrote Cronon, "shifts always according to natural and artificial constraints on systems of human activity, and according to people's *beliefs* about whether they are experiencing economic and environmental stasis, progress, or decline."[64] Western history, in the new formulation, became less an institutional unfolding than a conflict of cultures, more a product of perception and ideology than a linear historical process.

Reading Turner's original 1893 "frontier thesis" will help students discern the rhetorical antecedents for the way in which the West has been conceptualized, imagined, and advertised throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Using Turner as a springboard, students will consider whether Western history adhered to, or diverged from, the Anglo-American, individualistic, and democratic assumptions of his "frontier thesis." In particular, the history of "other" frontier groups – Mormons, Native Americans, African Americans, and women – will help illuminate the myriad (and often discrepant) experiences of those settling in the Western states.[65] Students will also have the opportunity to interrogate the myth of the Western frontier through a 1988 issue of the *High Country News* dedicated to "The Reopening of the Western

---

[63] Patricia Nelson Limerick, *The Legacy of Conquest: The Unbroken Past of the American West* (New York: W.W. Norton and Company, 1987), 26.
[64] Cronon, "Revisiting Turner's Vanishing Frontier," 678.
[65] In *Sagwitch: Shoshone Chieftain, Mormon Elder, 1822-1887*, Scott Christensen examines the hybridity of Western culture in Northern Utah during the expansion of Mormon empire. His account of the Bear River Massacre and analysis of U.S. Army priorities in the region, along with his description of life on the Washakie Reservation and in the gentile stronghold of Corrine, illuminates many of the inherent tensions and paradoxes of frontier life and contests Turner's ideal of unabated frontier progress. See: Christensen, *Sagwitch: Shoshone Chieftain, Mormon Elder, 1822-1887* (Logan: Utah State University Press, 1999). In addition, John Ravage's *Black Pioneers: Images of the Black Experience on the North American Frontier* (Salt Lake: University of Utah Press, 2008) provides a photographic panorama of African-American life on the Western frontiers, helping to debunk the Anglo-centric imagery of the early West.

Frontier."[66] This particular issue features maps, graphs, images, statistics, biographical vignettes, and analyses of the various "frontiers" that have shaped Western life and history over time; the pages offer an engaging and succinct portrait of the "legal, economic[,] and cultural" aspects of the Western frontier.[67] Some questions to guide students through this unit include: how useful is Turner's notion of a frontier as primarily a demographic and geographical phenomenon? What other "frontiers" have shaped Western history? Did the Western frontier really "close" in 1890, or does that date belie an ongoing process of expansion, settlement, and conquest? How important was "individualism" to the various groups who have settled in the West throughout history? Does the idea of the "frontier" obscure more important historical signifiers of Western life?

**People**

In the opening credits to George Stevens's archetypal 1953 film *Shane*, a lone rider without a past, clad in buckskin, a six-shooter at his hip, descends onto an open and apparently uninhabited expanse of Wyoming to start anew. The initial mise-en-scène, set to the theme of Victor Young's "The Call of the Faraway Hills," evokes a Turnerian trope that by that time had become a standard in commercial depictions of the American West.[68] The mythic image of a solitary, generally white frontiersman searching out an opportunity for settlement on the vast landscape of the American West obfuscates the more nuanced legacy of nineteenth-century

---

[66] See: "The Reopening of the Western Frontier," *High Country News* 20 (September 1988): 1-24, <http://s3.amazonaws.com/hcn-media/archive-pdf/1988_09_12_rfs.pdf>.
[67] Ed Marston, "The Reopening of the Western Frontier," *High Country News* 20 (September 1988), 7.
[68] *Shane*, directed by George Stevens, (Hollywood, CA: Paramount Pictures, 1953).

settlement and conquest.[69] By incorporating the narratives and acknowledging the histories of marginalized demographics – Women, American Indians, Asians, African Americans, and other peoples of color – scholars of Western history in the postwar era have worked to challenge the hegemony of Eurocentric imagery in popular portrayals of westward expansion. "One skill essential to the writing of Western American history," wrote Patricia Nelson Limerick in 1987, "is a capacity to deal with multiple points of view."[70] And indeed, bringing peripheral voices to the center and restoring some of the original dynamism that typified the clash of values and cultures in the West has proved a crucial component of contemporary scholarship. This trend has also meant conceptualizing borders, boundaries, and frontiers as fluid, not fixed.[71] From providing a platform for native viewpoints to enlivening the often violent and racist history of cultural encounters in the West, the historiographical discourse has broadened in the past four decades to encompass a variety of voices and narratives.

Students will explore several challenges to the popular caricatures of the American West that survive in cinematic Westerns and the novels of Louis L'Amour. The history of Mormon settlement in the State of Deseret offers a particularly intriguing foil for the mythic individualism embodied in the protagonist of *Shane*. The history of Orderville, for example, a settlement in southern Utah organized around the collectivist economic principles of Joseph Smith's United Order, will help complicate the rugged individualist ethos of mainstream Western narratives.[72]

---

[69] Indeed, Marsden and Nachbar have argued that the "American Western story has fulfilled more social and cultural functions for its audience than has any other American story form… the Western can [therefore] be seen as a record of America's national self-awareness." See: Michael T. Marsden and Jack Nachbar, "The Modern Popular Western," in Clyde A Milner, ed., *Major Problems in the History of the American West* (Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989), 481-6.
[70] Patricia Nelson Limerick, *The Legacy of Conquest*, 39.
[71] See the introduction to: Shephen Aron, *American Confluence: The Missouri Frontier from Borderland to Border State* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2009).
[72] See: Wallace Stegner, "Arcadian Village," in *Mormon Country* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1970), 108-127. The history of slavery in Utah territory also adds compelling depth to the history of Mormon settlement and challenges the perceived homogeneity of Utah society. See, for example: James B. Christensen, "Negro Slavery in the Utah Territory," *The Phylon Quarterly* 18 (Fall 1957): 298-305; Ronald G. Coleman, *A History of Blacks in Utah, 1825-1910*, Doctoral Dissertation (Salt Lake: University of Utah, 1980).

The Bear River Massacre offers another focal point through which to interrogate the clash of native and settler cultures and the contested process of historical remembrance.[73] Finally, students will investigate the historical ramifications of Executive Order 9066 and Japanese internment during WWII, particularly the ways in which the "relocation centers" at Topaz and throughout the West enforced a narrow and exclusionary definition of citizenship that remains a salient and problematic legacy of American history.[74] Throughout this unit, students will consider how citizenship functions as a legal, cultural, economic, and racial category in the history of the West. Some questions to direct discussion include: what sort of barriers to citizenship did non-white settlers face in the West? How did religion influence patterns of settlement in Utah and elsewhere? Whose story does public commemoration of the Bear River Massacre and other historical events highlight? Which narratives remain untold or marginalized? How have various migrants adapted to environmental limits and the vicissitudes of climate? Do westerners embody a coherent set of cultural characteristics or are do many distinct cultures coexist within the West? How has literature and cinema shaped our notion of the West? Are these portrayals accurate? How does migration continue to shape the cultural and demographic landscape of the Intermountain West?

---

[73] David Rich Lewis illustrates how memories of particular events evolve over time depending on whose voice dominates the historical conversation. He shows how the Battle of Bear River memorialized by the Daughters of the Utah Pioneers became the Bear River Massacre through a process of historical revision and reinterpretation. See: David Rich Lewis, "Native Americans in the Nineteenth-Century West," in William Deverell, ed., *A Companion to the American West* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2004), 143-61; Brigham D. Madsen, *The Shoshoni Frontier and the Bear River Massacre* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1985).

[74] Three excellent primary sources that highlight the Japanese experience in World War II include: "Executive Order 9066," (February 19, 1942), reprinted in Christine Compston and Rachel Filene Seidman, eds., *Our Documents: 100 Milestone Documents from the National Archives* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2003), 178-9; Yoshiko Uchida, "Desert Exile," (1942), reprinted in T.H. Breen, ed., *The Power of Words: Documents in American History, Volume II: From 1865*, (New York: HarperCollins College Publishers, 1996), 178-80; Yuri Kochiyama, "Then Came the War," (1991), reprinted in Howard Zinn and Anthony Arnove, eds., *Voices of a People's History of the United States* (New York: Seven Stories Press, 2009), 358-63. "I'm a totally different person than I was back then," writes Kochiyama, "I was naïve about so many things. The more I think about, the more I realize how littler you learn about American history. It's just what they want you to know" (361). See also: Connie Y. Chiang, "Imprisoned Nature: Toward an Environmental History of the World War II Japanese Incarceration," *Environmental History* 15 (April 2010): 236-267. A recent PBS documentary also highlights the experiences of the interred Japanese-Americans: *Children of the Camps*, directed by Stephen Holsapple (Arlington, VA: PBS, 1999).

**Water**

"In the West," wrote Marc Reisner in *Cadillac Desert*, "lack of water is the central fact of existence, and a whole culture and set of values have grown up around it."[75] Two parts hydrogen, one part oxygen – a simple compound, yet one with dramatic and far-reaching consequences for the history of American expansion and settlement in the arid West. "[H]istorians," wrote Bernard DeVoto in 1953, "have generally been ignorant of or incurious about natural conditions that determine life in the West, differentiate it from other sections, and have given it different orientations."[76] Postwar population explosion in the western states, facilitated by federal reclamation projects on an unprecedented scale, however, provided water its historiographical import. For many scholars, water came to challenge Turner's frontier as the centripetal element of Western history. In his seminal environmental history of the West, *Rivers of Empire*, Donald Worster became the first historian to systematically analyze the connection between control of hydraulic resources and the consolidation and exercise of power in the western states.[77] More recently, Donald J. Pisani has considered how the economic and social shortcomings of federal reclamation projects stemmed from a powerful set of ideological assumptions deeply embedded in the mythos of American expansion. He makes a case against an "imperial or hegemonic planning mentality that excludes the necessary role of local knowledge and know-how."[78] The

---

[75] Marc Reisner, *Cadillac Desert: The American West and Its Disappearing Water* (New York: Penguin Books, 1993), 12.
[76] Wallace Stegner, *Beyond the Hundredth Meridian: John Wesley Powell and the Second Opening of the American West* (New York: Penguin Books, 1992), xix
[77] Donald Worster, *Rivers of Empire: Water, Aridity, and the Growth of the American West* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985). Worster was interested in the fundamentl connections between resource use and human culture, arguing that water use – irrigation in particular – "has much to tell us about the social implications embedded in our various ways of dealing with nature" (21).
[78] Donald J. Pisani, *Water and American Government: The Reclamation Bureau, National Water Policy, and the West, 1902-1935* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), 295. See also: Donald J. Pisani, *To Reclaim a Divided West: Water, Law, and Public Policy, 1848-1902* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1992).

environmental, political, and economic consequences of irrigation, dam building, and fluvial appropriation in the West continue to shape the trajectory of human settlement to this day.[79]

In this unit, students should consider how water supply – both perceptions of abundance to actual scarcity – has shaped western development. Beginning with a discussion of the legal framework that governs water use, students will learn how "prior appropriation" in the western states differs from the doctrine of "riparian rights" that codifies water use in the comparatively abundant watersheds of the East.[80] They will read about popular nineteenth-century perceptions of fluvial abundance in the West, as well as early efforts to catalogue and manage the water supply. Students will contrast the much-publicized fallacy, "rain follows the plow," with John Wesley Powell's more sober analysis of the capacity of western watersheds to support human enterprise.[81] Students will also consider the ramifications of dam construction in the twentieth century and the Bureau of Reclamation's role in managing western watersheds.[82] Some questions

---

[79] See: Wallace Stegner, "Thoughts in a Dry Land," 45-57, and "Living Dry," 57-75 in *Where the Bluebird Sings to the Lemonade Springs* (New York: Modern Library, 2002).

[80] For historical background on these competing doctrines, their legal antecedents and comparative utility in the arid states, see Donald Worster, *Rivers of Empire*, 87-96. "Through court decisions," writes Worster, "…the riparian doctrine was drastically modified to allow the virtually unlimited private aggrandizement of wealth through appropriation. In that drive to replace the common law, a river became a mere instrumentality to satisfy entrepreneurial drives, a utility, a marketable commodity, to be bought and sold and made to earn money for whoever got their first" (90).

[81] Charles Dana Wilber helped popularize this idea. "God speed the plow," he wrote in 1880, "By this wonderful provision, which is only man's mastery over nature, the clouds are dispensing copious rains ... [the plow] is the instrument which separates civilization from savagery; and converts a desert into a farm or garden.... To be more concise, Rain follows the plow." Quoted in *The West: Geography of Hope, 1877-1887*, directed by Ken Burns and Stephen Ives (Bethesda, MD: *PBS*, 1996). See also: Wallace Stegner, *Beyond the Hundredth Meridian*, 1-8, 203-42; John Wesley Powell, "Report on the Lands of the Arid Region of the United States with a More Detailed Account of the Lands of Utah," 2nd ed. (Washington D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1879), vi-viii, 5-14, 89-98, <http://pubs.usgs.gov/unnumbered/70039240/report.pdf>. See also, Elizabeth Raymond, "When the Desert Won't Bloom: Environmental Limitation and the Great Basin," in David M. Wrobel and Michael C. Steiner eds. *Many Wests: Place, Culture, and Regional Identity,* 71-92; Howard Berkes, "The Vision of John Wesley Powell: Explorer Foresaw Water Issues That Would Plague the West," *NPR.org* (August 26, 2003), <http://www.npr.org/programs/atc/features/2003/aug/water/part1.html>; for a visually-stimulating panoply of Powell-inspired maps, see: <http://communitybuilders.net/the-united-watershed-states-of-america/> in which the author redraws state boundaries in accordance with major watersheds. For more on early legal impediments to water use and irrigational efforts, see Elwood Mead's reports contrasting irrigation initiatives in Utah and California: Elwood Mead, "Report of Irrigation Investigations in California," (Washington D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1901), 29-29 <https://ia600404.us.archive.org/10/items/reportofirrigati00unitrich/reportofirrigati00unitrich.pdf>, and Elwood Mead, "Report of Irrigation Investigations in Utah," (Washington D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1903), <http://books.google.com/books?id=9u4NAAAAYAAJ&printsec=frontcover&source=gbs_ge_summary_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false>. This latter report contains information on early dam, canal, and irrigation projects on the Logan River (see: 301-315).

[82] See: *Cadillac Desert: Water and the Transformation of Nature*, directed by Jon Else and Linda Harrar (San Jose, CA: KTEH, 1997); Julianne Couch, "Floyd Dominy, the Colossus of Dams, Dies at 100," *HCN.org* (April 23, 2010),

to consider regarding water include: in what ways did the realities of climatic aridity undercut the narratives of eastern boosters regarding western settlement? What sorts of demographic and economic challenges does fluvial over-appropriation pose for communities in the Southwestern United States? Does federal reclamation activity on western rivers represent a form of imperialism? What are the ecological consequences of dam construction and irrigation in the West?[83] How did John Wesley Powell's vision of western development contrast with political realities of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries?

**Resources**

"Our central privilege as Americans," wrote William Kittredge, "has always been our luck – the spectacular heritage of the great good places in which we live. Since the days of the Puritans, we have been defoliating that heritage, mining it in one sense or another, as if it were inexhaustible. As if there were no tomorrow."[84] The extractive thrust of western industry, premised on the chimera of material abundance, has facilitated extravagant booms and exorbitant busts. The episodic regularity of these highs and lows has molded western communities just as discernibly as climatic variables, the march of "civilization," or cultural conflict. For every city that endured, every Denver or Salt Lake, a dozen Leadvilles, Cripple Creeks, and Segos fell

---

<http://www.hcn.org/hcn/wotr/floyd-dominy-the-colossus-of-dams-dies-at-100>; James Powell, "Calamity on the Colorado," *Orion Magazine* (July/August 2010), <http://www.orionmagazine.org/index.php/articles/article/5617>. Powell considers how the "benefits of large hydropower dams are fated to fade and disappear, in some cases in spectacular fashion"; for a "spectacular" example of this phenomenon, consider the collapse of Teton Dam in 1976, <http://www.history.com/topics/us-states/idaho/videos/engineering-disasters-teton-dam>; see also Robert S. Devine, "The Trouble with Dams," *Atlantic Online* (August 1995), <http://www.theatlantic.com/past/politics/environ/dams.htm>. For a contemporary critique of the ongoing "restoration" and flood control on the Logan River, see: Brett Roper, "Logan River Project Not 'Emergency' or 'Restoration,'" *HJNews.com* (March 6, 2014), <http://news.hjnews.com/allaccess/article_ad2f4834-a553-11e3-86d2-001a4bcf887a.html>.

[83] So too might we ask, what are the aesthetic or spiritual consequences? None have answered this question more lucidly than Ed Abbey and Wallace Stegner. See: Edward Abbey, "Down the River," in *Desert Solitaire: A Season in the Wilderness* (New York: Touchstone, 1968), 151-95; Wallace Stegner, "Glen Canyon Submersis," in *The Sound of Mountain Water: The Changing American West* (New York: Penguin Books, 1980), 121-36.

[84] William Kittredge, "Overthrust Dreams," in *The Best of* Outside*: The First 20 Years* (New York: Vintage Books, 1998), 359-60.

victim to the caprice of supply and demand. Over the course of the past two centuries, the gilded landscapes of the West have served as volatile meeting grounds between the unbridled optimism of American mythology backed by outside investment and the hardscrabble realities of resource finitude and exploitative labor practices.[85] Writing in the 1930s, Bernard DeVoto famously referred to the West as a "plundered province," a region autonomous in geography only, its resources locked up in eastern markets, its fate determined by the priorities of Wall Street.[86] This notion of regional imperialism still informs much of the scholarly discourse regarding resource extraction.[87] So too does the influence of eastern capital and government subsidy significantly complicate the narrative of individualism and independence to which many Westerners still cleave.[88] Although Michael Malone marked the 1980s as the "close of the 'colonial' period of western development, the frontier and post-frontier eras which saw the rise and fall of extractive industries and the often heedless exploitation of the region's natural resources," other scholars continue to stress the importance of the extraction-based economies in the history of the

---

[85] William G. Robbins argues against the exceptionalist tenor of Western narratives, citing the primacy of material forces and the all-encompassing reach of global capitalism in determining the region's historical development: "But in what has become the great American myth, above all, it was the *promise* of the West that loomed largest; for it was there that people would find the answer to their quest for a better life. Reality, in that sense, was less important than the symbols through which people perceived a larger design; indeed, in that scheme, symbol and myth passed for reality" (430). See: William G. Robbins, "Western History: A Dialectic on the Modern Condition," *The Western Historical Quarterly* 20 (November 1989): 429-49.

[86] Bernard DeVoto, "The West: A Plundered Province," *Harper's* (August 1934): 355-64.

[87] For more on the "plundered province" historiography, see: Michael P. Malone, "Introduction," in Michael P. Malone, ed., *Historians and the American West* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1983); William G. Robbins, "The 'Plundered Province' Thesis and the Recent Historiography of the American West," *Pacific Historical Review* 55 (November 1986): 577-97; David Igler, "The Industrial Far West: Region and Nation in the Late Nineteenth Century," *Pacific Historical Review* 69 (May 2000): 159-92; Gene M. Gressley, "Colonialism: A Western Complaint," *The Pacific Northwest Quarterly* 54 (January 1963): 1-8.

[88] A compelling example of this ambivalence toward the federal government in the West is the so-called "Sagebrush Rebellion" and "Wise Use" phenomenon that gained traction in the 1970s. See: "Two Reports from Nevada on the Sagebrush Rebellion, 1979," in Clyde A Milner, ed., *Major Problems in the History of the American West* (Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989), 556-9; R. McGreggor Cawley, *Federal Land, Western Anger: The Sagebrush Rebellion and Environmental Politics* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1993); Richard White, "Contested Terrain: The Business of Land in the American West," in William G. Robbins and James C. Foster, eds., *Land in the American West: Private Claims and the Common Good* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2000), 190-206; Ray Ring, "Rebels with a Lost Cause," *High Country News* (December 2007), <http://www.hcn.org.dist.lib.usu.edu/issues/360/17399>.

American West.[89] Anne Hyde, for example, defines extractive industry broadly as that which "relies primarily on raw materials produced directly by the environment."[90] In this formulation, not only mining towns, but also those reliant on drilling, ranching, fur trading, and skiing have exhibited characteristics of boom-bust inconstancy. The social, economic, and environmental costs of such extraction run like a constant thread through Western history. By looking beyond the ubiquitous open-pit and deep vein mines etched into the western landscape and examining the other industries that have supported life in the west – military bases, ski resorts, national parks, transportation networks, and tourism – scholars have begun to see the links between regional economies and the expansion of global capitalism.

In this final unit, students will explore the connections between economy, place, and identity. Beginning with an account of the rise and fall of metal mining in the West, students will consider the economic structures and labor regimes that facilitated the extraction of gold, copper, silver, molybdenum, uranium, and coal on a massive scale; in particular, students will learn about the lives of nineteenth-century miners – including the ethnic, gendered, and class-based hierarchies that informed much of the social structure – and draw connections to the petroleum and natural gas industries operating today on the Colorado Plateau.[91] From metal mining itself, students will look to sister industries to better understand the technologies and products that

---

[89] Michael Malone, "The Collapse of Western Metal Mining: an Historical Epitaph," *Pacific Historical Review* 55 (August 1986): 455-464. See also: "Michael Zielenziger on the West's Economy, 1987" in Clyde A Milner, ed., *Major Problems in the History of the American West* (Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989), 617-21.

[90] Anne F. Hyde, "Round Pegs in Square Holes: The Rocky Mountains and Extractive Industry," in David M. Wrobel and Michael C. Steiner eds. *Many Wests: Place, Culture, and Regional Identity*, 93-113.

[91] A particularly illuminating case study is that of the Rock Springs Massacre of Chinese miners in Wyoming. See: "Chinese Accounts of the Killings at Rock Springs, 1885," in Clyde A Milner, ed., *Major Problems in the History of the American West* (Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989), 316-9; Randall E. Rohe, "Chinese Mining in the Far West, 1850-1890," *Montana the Magazine of Western History* 32 (Autumn 1982): 2-19; Malcolm J. Rohrbough, "Mining and the Nineteenth-Century American West," in William Deverell, ed., *A Companion to the American West* (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2004), 112-29; Sandra Steingraber, "When Cowboys Cry," *Orion Magazine* (May/June 2011), <http://www.orionmagazine.org/index.php/articles/article/6267>. "[T]he torch of Wild West lawlessness," writes Steingraber, "is now being carried by Wall Street–backed energy corporations, while the real-life cowboys are trying to find things in the law that will slow down the rate of plundering, raise the cost of plundering, or make the plundering marginally less accident-prone." See also: Kittredge, "Overthrust Dreams."

contributed to the boom in nineteenth and twentieth-century mining. Railroad expansion and nuclear proliferation are two salient examples in Utah's history. By contextualizing the joining of the Union Pacific and Central Pacific railroads at Promontory Point within the larger history of corporate consolidation at the turn of the century and seeing the postwar uranium boom in the four corners region as part and parcel of the Cold War Arms race, students will begin to appreciate the fluidity of regional boundaries in a globalized world.[92] Reading about the history of the Atomic Energy Commission in the desert southwest, especially the plight of the so-called "downwinders," will offer another opportunity to for students to explore the thin line between experimentation and exploitation and the competing discourses of national security and regional integrity.[93] Finally, students will consider the ways in which tourism and outdoor recreation – industries synonymous with the landscapes of the "New West" – function within the broader matrix of extractive industry. The town of Moab offers a particularly compelling case study of a uranium boomtown economy reoriented to accommodate tourism and recreation.[94] Some questions to guide students through this final unit include: how has western industry engendered place meanings, and how have those economies and meanings changed over time? Does the West remain a "plundered province" or has it achieved economic autonomy? What are the

---

[92] Richard White characterizes the transcontinental railroad as a tremendous feat of industrial hauteur and managerial recklessness. See: White, *Railroaded: The Transcontinentals and the Making of Modern America* (New York: W.W. Norton, 2011). White and his research team have also compiled a wonderfully diverse collection of notes, maps, graphs, and interactive visual aids for understanding the "spatial history" of railroad expansion in the nineteenth century: <railroaded.stanford.edu>. The *Golden Spike National Historical Sight* also offers an accessible historical exhibit that could contribute to student learning."

[93] In her epilogue to Refuge, "The Clan of One-Breasted Women," Terry Tempest Williams explores how her family became "virtual uninhabitants" of a landscape and the local victims of a national program of atomic testing in Nevada. Her memoir explores the interstices between religious identity, gender, and environment: "The fear and inability to question authority that ultimately killed rural communities in Utah during atmospheric testing of atomic weapons was the same fear I saw being held in my mother's body. Sheep. Dead sheep. The evidence is buried." See: Terry Tempest Williams, *Refuge: An Unnatural History of Family and Place* (New York: Pantheon, 2000), 281-90. Carole Gallagher's photographic documentation of the "downwinders" offers a powerful visual supplement to this history; Carole Gallagher, *American Ground Zero: The Secret Nuclear War* (Cambridge: MIT Press, 1993). See also: Carole Gallagher, "Nuclear Photography: Making the Invisible Visible," *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists* 69 (November/December 2013): 42-6; "Joseph L. Lyon on Leukemia and Atom Bomb Tests in Southern Utah, 1979" and "Orrin Hatch Considers the Fallout Victims, 1979" in Clyde A Milner, ed., *Major Problems in the History of the American West* (Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989), 553-5; Bryan C. Taylor, "Nuclear Pictures and Metapictures," *American Literary History* 9 (Autumn 1997): 567-97.

[94] See: Michael A. Amundson, "Yellowcake to Singletrack: Culture, Community, and Identity in Moab, Utah," in *Imagining the Big Open: Nature, Identity, and Play in the New West*, 151-62.

similarities and differences between the "Old" and "New" West?[95] What have been the social and environmental costs of extractive industry in the West? How has the presence of massive swaths of federal land in the American West determined the range of economic possibility? Does local resistance to federal incursion promote or inhibit popular sovereignty?[96] Finally, what are the social and ecological consequences of tourism and recreation in the West?[97] Does tourism represent a viable economic model for the western states?

**Conclusion**

In *The Unsettling of America*, Wendell Berry commented on a "fundamental paradox" of our human condition: "we can make ourselves whole only by accepting our partiality, by living within our limits, by being human."[98] Somewhere amidst the fragmented and fractured, shiftless and subdivided world we inhabit, there is a basic human yearning for connection and rootedness. The aim of place-based education is to restore the connections that have been lost, to unify the seemingly disparate strands of our modern existence and recapture a sense of place and sense of self that too often go overlooked. In lieu of a parochial and destructive attachment to western

---

[95] See: Earl Pomeroy, *In Search of the Golden West: The Tourist in Western America*. Second Edition (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2010); Lawrence Culver, "From 'Last of the Old West' to First of the New West: Tourism and Transformation in Jackson Hole, Wyoming," in *Imagining the Big Open: Nature, Identity, and Play in the New West*, Liza Nicholas, Elaine M. Bapis, and Thomas J. Harvey, eds. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2003),163-80.

[96] Students should think about which groups would benefit from economic control over local resources; they should also dissect the idea of "sovereignty" and consider how federal land pits local land users against the American people in aggregate.

[97] On the social and cultural costs of recreation, see: Annie Gilbert Coleman, "The Unbearable Whiteness of Skiing," *Pacific Historical Review* 65 (November 1996): 583-614; Gary Kimball, *Life Under China Bridge and Other Stories of Minorities in Old Park City* (Tramway Books, 2013); Lisa Jones, "El Nuevo West," *High Country News* (December 1996): 1, 6, 8-11; Wendy Rex-Atzet, "Narratives of Place and Power: Laying Claim to Devil's Tower," in *Imagining the Big Open: Nature, Identity, and Play in the New West*, Liza Nicholas, Elaine M. Bapis, and Thomas J. Harvey, eds. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2003), 45-69; Hal Rothman, *Devil's Bargains: Tourism in the 20th Century West* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1998). For the ecological ramifications of the outdoor recreation industry, see: Hal Clifford, *Downhill Slide: Why the Corporate Ski Industry is Bad for Skiing, Ski Towns, and the Environment* (San Francisco: Sierra Club Books, 2002); Annie Gilbert Coleman, *Ski Style: Sport and Culture in the Rockies* (Lawrence, KS: University Press of Kansas, 2004); Krista Langlois, "Water Rights Bill Pits Ski Industry Against Conservationists," *HCN.org* (March 11, 2014): <http://www.hcn.org/blogs/goat/water-rights-bill-pits-ski-industry-against-conservationists>.

[98] Berry, "Unsettling of America," 95.

mythology, a critical pedagogy of place offers students a way to see themselves within the broader current of historical development that has shaped and continues to shape the cultures, institutions, and landscapes in which we are consciously or subconsciously embedded. As C.L. Rawlins once wrote, "everybody has to be someplace."[99] By dissolving the boundaries between region and nation, local and global, and interrogating the potentialities and limits of local knowledge, students of the American West can begin to understand not only *where* they are, but also *who* they are. Even in our globalized age, place and identity remain inextricable. Elucidating the contingencies of our historical moment and coming to terms with our *place* in the geographical, moral, and metaphorical landscapes of the present thus becomes crucial to an engaged and global citizenship. By illuminating the concerns and paradoxes that link us to prior generations, a critical engagement with place can help transform the blank vastness of *terra incognita* into the solid bedrock of *terra firma*.

[99] C.L. Rawlins, "Everybody Has to Be Someplace," *High Country News* 14 (December 1982): 8-9.

## *Bibliography*

### Secondary Sources

Amundson, Michael A. "Yellowcake to Singletrack: Culture, Community, and Identity in Moab, Utah." In *Imagining the Big Open: Nature, Identity, and Play in the New West*. Edited by Liza Nicholas, Elaine M. Bapis, and Thomas J. Harvey, 151-62. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2003.

Apple, Michael W. *Ideology and Curriculum*. New York: Routledge, 2004.

Armitage, Kevin C. *The Nature Study Movement: The Forgotten Popularizer of America's Conservation Ethic*. Lawrence, KS: University of Kansas Press, 2009.

Aron, Stephen. *American Confluence: The Missouri Frontier from Borderland to Border State*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2009.

Berman, Marshall. *All That is Solid Melts into Air: The Experience of Modernity*. New York: Penguin Books, 1982.

Bowers, C.A. *Education, Cultural Myths, and the Ecological Crisis: Toward Deep Changes*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1993.

Cawley, R. McGreggor. *Federal Land, Western Anger: The Sagebrush Rebellion and Environmental Politics*. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1993.

Chiang, Connie Y. "Imprisoned Nature: Toward an Environmental History of the World War II Japanese Incarceration." *Environmental History* 15 (April 2010): 236-267.

Christensen, James B. "Negro Slavery in Utah Territory." *The Phylon Quarterly* 18 (Fall 1957): 298-305

Christensen, Scott R. *Sagwitch: Shoshone Chieftain, Mormon Elder, 1822-1887*. Logan: Utah State University Press, 1999.

Clifford, Hal. *Downhill Slide: Why the Corporate Ski Industry is Bad for Skiing, Ski Towns, and the Environment*. San Francisco: Sierra Club Books, 2002.

Coleman, Annie Gilbert. "The Unbearable Whiteness of Skiing." *Pacific Historical Review* 65 (November 1996): 583-614.

Coleman, Ronald G. *A History of Blacks in Utah, 1825-1910*, Doctoral Dissertation. Salt Lake: University of Utah, 1980.

Cresswell, Tim. *Place: A Short Introduction*. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2004.

Cronon, William. "Revisiting Turner's Vanishing Frontier." In *Major Problems in the History of the American West*. Edited by Clyde A. Milner, 668-81. Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989.

Culver, Lawrence. "From 'Last of the Old West' to First of the New West: Tourism and Transformation in Jackson Hole, Wyoming." In *Imagining the Big Open: Nature, Identity, and Play in the New West*. Edited by Liza Nicholas, Elaine M. Bapis, and Thomas J. Harvey, 163-80. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2003.

Edwards Jr., D. Brent. "Critical Pedagogy and Democratic Education: Possibilities for Cross-Pollination." *Urban Review* 42 (2010): 221-242.

Eisenstadt, S.N. "Multiple Modernities." *Daedalus* 129 (Winter, 2000):1-29.

Elder, John, editor. *Stories in the Land: A Place Based Environmental Education Anthology*. Great Barrington, MA: Orion Society, 1998.

Farmer, Jared. *On Zion's Mount: Mormons, Indians, and the American Landscape*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2008.

Fettes, Mark and Gillian Judson. "Imagination and the Cognitive Tools of Place-Making." *Journal of Environmental Education* 42 (2011): 123-135.

Fowler, Robert Booth. *The Dance With Community: The Contemporary Debate in American Thought*. Lawrence: University of Kansas Press, 1991.

Franklin, Barry M. *Curriculum, Community, and Urban School Reform*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.

Gallagher, Carole. "Nuclear Photography: Making the Invisible Visible." *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists* 69 (November/December 2013): 42-6.

Giddens, Anthony. *Modernity and Self-Identity: Self and Society in the Late Modern Age*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1991.

Greene, Maxine. *The Dialectic of Freedom*. New York: Teacher's College Press of Columbia University, 1988.

Gressley, Gene M. "Colonialism: A Western Complaint." *The Pacific Northwest Quarterly* 54 (January 1963): 1-8.

Gruenewald, David A. and Gregory A. Smith, "Making Room for the Local." In *Place-Based Education in the Global Age*. Edited by David A. Gruenewald and Gregory A Smith, xii-xxiii. New York: Lawrence Erlbaum, 2008.

Gunn, Simon. *History and Cultural Theory*. Harlow, England: Pearson-Longman, 2006.

Gustafson, Per. "Meanings of Place: Everyday Experience and Theoretical Conceptualizations." *Journal of Environmental Psychology* 21 (2001): 5-16.

Habermas, Jurgen. "Modernity versus Postmodernity." *New German Critique* 22 (Winter, 1981): 3-14.

Hanson, Kenneth O. "The Writer's Sense of Place: A Symposium and Commentaries." *South Dakota Review* 13 (Fall 1975): 21-22.

Howley, Aimee, Marged Howley, Christi Camper, and Heike Perko. "Place-Based Education at Island Community School." *Journal of Environmental Education* 42 (2011): 216-236.

Hutson, Garrett. "Remembering the Roots of Place Meanings for Place-Based Outdoor Education." *Pathways: The Ontario Journal of Outdoor Education* (2011): 19-25.

Hyde, Anne F. "Round Pegs in Square Holes: The Rocky Mountains and Extractive Industry." In *Many Wests: Place, Culture, and Regional Identity*. Edited by David M. Wrobel and Michael C. Steiner, 93-113. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1997.

Hyde, Anne F. "Transients and Stickers: The Problem of Community in the American West." In *A Companion to the American West*. Edited by William Deverell, 304-28. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2004.

Igler, David. "The Industrial Far West: Region and Nation in the Late Nineteenth Century." *Pacific Historical Review* 69 (May 2000): 159-92.

Kimball, Gary. *Life Under China Bridge and Other Stories of Minorities in Old Park City*. Tramway Books, 2013.

Knapp, Clifford E. "The 'I – Thou' Relationship, Place-Based Education, and Aldo Leopold." *Journal of Experiential Education* 27 (2005): 277-85.

Knight, Tony and Arthur Pearl. "Democratic Education and Critical Pedagogy." *Urban Review* 32 (2000): 197-226.

Lewis, David Rich. "Native Americans in the Nineteenth-Century West." In *A Companion to the American West*. Edited by William Deverell, 143-61. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2004.

Limerick, Patricia Nelson. *The Legacy of Conquest: The Unbroken Past of the American West*. New York: W.W. Norton and Company, 1987.

Louv, Richard. *Last Child in the Woods: Saving our Children from Nature-Deficit Disorder*. Chapel Hill: Algonquin Books of Chapel Hill, 2005.

Lowe, Lisa. "Globalization." In *Keywords for American Cultural Studies*. Edited by Bruce Burgett and Glenn Hendler. New York: New York University Press, 2007: <http://dist.lib.usu.edu/login?qurl=http%3A%2F%2Fsearch.credoreference.com%2Fcontent%2Fentry%2Fnyupacs%2Fglobalization%2F0>.

Macleod, David I. *The Age of the Child: Children in America 1890-1920*. New York: Twayne, 1998.

Madsen, Brigham D. *The Shoshoni Frontier and the Bear River Massacre*. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1985.

Malone, Michael P. "The Collapse of Western Metal Mining: an Historical Epitaph." *Pacific Historical Review* 55 (August 1986): 455-464.

Michael P. Malone, editor. *Historians and the American West*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1983.

Malpas, J.E. *Place and Experience: A Philosophical Topography*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999.

Marsden, Michael T. and Jack Nachbar, "The Modern Popular Western." In *Problems in the History of the American West*. Edited by Clyde A. Milner, 481-6. Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989.

Marx, Leo. *The Machine in the Garden: Technology and the Pastoral Ideal in America*. Thirty-fifth Anniversary Edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.

Morehouse, Aaron. "A Deeper Meaning of Place." *Environmental Education Research* 14 (December 2008): 693-697.

Morgan, Alun D. "Learning Communities, Cities and Regions for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship." *Local Environment* 14 (May 2009): 443-459.

Pisani, Donald J. *To Reclaim a Divided West: Water, Law, and Public Policy, 1848-1902*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1992.

Pisani, Donald J. *Water and American Government: The Reclamation Bureau, National Water Policy, and the West, 1902-1935*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002.

Pomeroy, Earl. *In Search of the Golden West: The Tourist in Western America*. Second Edition. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2010.

Ravage, John. *Black Pioneers: Images of the Black Experience on the North American Frontier*. Salt Lake: University of Utah Press, 2008.

Raymond, Elizabeth. "When the Desert Won't Bloom: Environmental Limitation and the Great Basin." In *Many Wests: Place, Culture, and Regional Identity*. Edited by David M. Wrobel and Michael C. Steiner, 71-92. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1997.

Reisner, Marc. *Cadillac Desert: The American West and Its Disappearing Water*. New York: Penguin Books, 1993.

Resor, Cynthia Williams. "Place-Based Education: What is Its Place in the Social Studies Classroom?" *Social Studies* 101 (2010): 185-188.

Rex-Atzet, Wendy. "Narratives of Place and Power: Laying Claim to Devil's Tower." In *Imagining the Big Open: Nature, Identity, and Play in the New West*. Edited by Liza Nicholas, Elaine M. Bapis, and Thomas J. Harvey, 45-69. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2003.

Robbins, William G. "The 'Plundered Province' Thesis and the Recent Historiography of the American West." *Pacific Historical Review* 55 (November 1986): 577-97.

Robbins, William G. "Western History: A Dialectic on the Modern Condition." *The Western Historical Quarterly* 20 (November 1989): 429-49.

Roberts, Jay W. Beyond Learning by Doing: Theoretical Currents in Experiential Education. New York: Routledge, 2012.

Rohe, Randall E. "Chinese Mining in the Far West, 1850-1890." *Montana the Magazine of Western History* 32 (Autumn 1982): 2-19.

Rohrbough, Malcolm J. "Mining and the Nineteenth-Century American West." In *A Companion to the American West*. Edited by William Deverell, 112-29. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2004.

Rorty, Amelie Oksenberg, "Rousseau's Educational Experiments," In *Philosophers on Education: New Historical Perspectives*. Edited by Amelie Oksenberg Rorty, 237-54. New York: Routledge, 1998.

Rorty, Richard. *Achieving our Country: Leftist Thought in Twentieth-Century America.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1997.

Ross, Kristen. *Fast Cars, Clean Bodies: Decolonization and the Reordering of French Culture*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1995.

Rothman, Hal. *Devil's Bargains: Tourism in the 20th Century West*. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1998.

Shull, Kristina Karin. "Is the Magic Gone? Weber's 'Disenchantment of the World' and its Implications for Art in Today's World." *Anamesa* 11 (Fall 2005): 61-73.

Sobel, David. *Beyond Ecophobia: Reclaiming the Heart in Nature Education*. Great Barrington, MA: The Orion Society, 1999.

Sobel, David. *Childhood and Nature: Design Principles for Educators*. Portland, ME: Stenhouse Publishers, 2008.

Sobel, David. *Place-Based Education: Connecting Classrooms and Communities*. Great Barrington, MA: Orion Society, 2005.

Smith, Gregory A. "Place-Based Education: Learning to Be Where We Are." *Phi Delta Kappan* 83 (April 2002): 584-94.

Stegner, Wallace. *Beyond the Hundredth Meridian: John Wesley Powell and the Second Opening of the American West*. New York: Penguin Books, 1992.

Stegner, Wallace. *Mormon Country*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1970.

Taylor, Bryan C. "Nuclear Pictures and Metapictures." *American Literary History* 9 (Autumn 1997): 567-97.

Tuan, Yi-Fu. *Cosmos and Hearth: A Cosmopolite's Viewpoint*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1996.

Tuan, Yi-Fu. "Space and Place: Humanistic Perspective," In *Philosophy in Geography*. Edited by Stephen Gale and Gunnar Olsson, 387-427. Dordrecht, Holland: D. Reidel Publishing Company, 1979.

van der Veer, Peter. "The Global History of 'Modernity.'" *The Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient* 41 (1998): 285-94.

Weber, Max. *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism, with Other Writings on the Rise of the West*. Translated by Stephen Kalberg. New York: Oxford University Press, 2009.

White, Richard. "Contested Terrain: The Business of Land in the American West." In *Land in the American West: Private Claims and the Common Good*. Edited by William G. Robbins and James C. Foster, 190-206. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2000.

White, Richard. *Railroaded: The Transcontinentals and the Making of Modern America*. New York: W.W. Norton, 2011.

Worster, Donald. *Rivers of Empire: Water, Aridity, and the Growth of the American West.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985.

Wurdinger, Scott D. *Using Experiential Learning in the Classroom: Practical Ideas for All Educators*. Lanham, MD: ScarecrowEducation, 2005.

Zilversmit, Arthur. *Changing Schools: Progressive Education Theory and Practice, 1930-1960*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993.

**Primary Sources**

Abbey, Edward. *Desert Solitaire: A Season in the Wilderness*. New York: Touchstone, 1968.

Bailey, Liberty Hyde. *The Nature Study Idea: Being an Interpretation of the New Movement to Put the Child in Sympathy with Nature*. New York: Doubleday, Page, 1903.

Berkes, Howard. "The Vision of John Wesley Powell: Explorer Foresaw Water Issues That Would Plague the West." *NPR.org* (August 26, 2003): <http://www.npr.org/programs/atc/features/2003/aug/water/part1.html>.

Berry, Wendell. *A Continuous Harmony: Essays Cultural and Agricultural*. San Diego: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1972.

Berry, Wendell. *It All Turns on Affection: The Jefferson Lecture and Other Essays*. Berkeley: Counterpoint, 2012.

Berry, Wendell. *The Unsettling of America: Culture and Agriculture*, Third Edition. San Francisco: Sierra Club Books, 1996.

*Cadillac Desert: Water and the Transformation of Nature*. Directed by Jon Else and Linda Harrar. San Jose, CA: KTEH, 1997.

*Children of the Camps*, directed by Stephen Holsapple. Arlington, VA: PBS, 1999.

"Chinese Accounts of the Killings at Rock Springs, 1885," In *Major Problems in the History of the American West*. Edited by Clyde A. Milner, 316-9. Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989.

Couch, Julianne. "Floyd Dominy, the Colossus of Dams, Dies at 100." *HCN.org* (April 23, 2010): <http://www.hcn.org/hcn/wotr/floyd-dominy-the-colossus-of-dams-dies-at-100>.

Daniel, John. "A Word in Favor of Rootlessness: The Joys and Perhaps Necessary Virtues of Not Settling Down." *High Country News* (December 2008): <http://www.hcn.org/articles/a-word-in-favor-of-rootlessness/article_view?searchterm=Place&b_start:int=0>.

Devine, Robert S. "The Trouble with Dams." *Atlantic Online* (August 1995): <http://www.theatlantic.com/past/politics/environ/dams.htm>.

DeVoto, Bernard. "The West: A Plundered Province." *Harper's* (August 1934): 355-64.

Dewey, John. *Democracy and Education: An Educational Classic*. Radford, VA, Wilder Publications, 2008.

Dewey, John. *Experience and Education*. New York: Collier MacMillan, 1938.

Ehrlich, Gretel. *The Solace of Open Spaces*. New York: Penguin Books, 1986.

"Executive Order 9066, February 19, 1942," In *Our Documents: 100 Milestone Documents from the National Archives*. Edited by Christine Compston and Rachel Filene Seidman, 178-9. New York: Oxford University Press, 2003.

Gallagher, Carole. *American Ground Zero: The Secret Nuclear War*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1993.

Jones, Lisa. "El Nuevo West." *High Country News* (December 1996): 1, 6, 8-11.

"Joseph L. Lyon on Leukemia and Atom Bomb Tests in Southern Utah, 1979," In *Major Problems in the History of the American West*. Edited by Clyde A. Milner, 553. Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989.

Kittredge, William. "Overthrust Dreams." In *The Best of* Outside*: The First 20 Years*, 358-67. New York: Vintage Books, 1998.

Kochiyama, Yuri. "Then Came the War (1991)," In *Voices of a People's History of the United States*. Edited by Howard Zinn and Anthony Arnove, 358-63. New York: Seven Stories Press, 2009).

Langlois, Krista. "Water Rights Bill Pits Ski Industry Against Conservationists." *HCN.org* (March 11, 2014): <http://www.hcn.org/blogs/goat/water-rights-bill-pits-ski-industry-against-conservationists>.

Lavey, John. "The (United) Watershed States of America," *Communitybuilders.net*. (September 26, 2013): <http://communitybuilders.net/the-united-watershed-states-of-america/>.

Lopez, Barry. "We Are Shaped by the Sound of Wind, the Slant of Sunlight." *High Country News* (September 1998): <http://www.hcn.org/issues/138/4431>.

Mead, Elwood. "Report of Irrigation Investigations in California." Washington D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1901: <https://ia600404.us.archive.org/10/items/reportofirrigati00unitrich/reportofirrigati00unitrich.pdf>.

Mead, Elwood. "Report of Irrigation Investigations in Utah." Washington D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1903: <http://books.google.com/books?id=9u4NAAAAYAAJ&printsec=frontcover&source=gbs_ge_summary_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false>.

"Michael Zielenziger on the West's Economy, 1987." In *Major Problems in the History of the*

*American West.* Edited by Clyde A. Milner, 617-21. Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989.

"Orrin Hatch Considers the Fallout Victims, 1979," In *Major Problems in the History of the American West*. Edited by Clyde A. Milner, 554-5. Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989.

Powell, James. "Calamity on the Colorado." *Orion Magazine* (July/August 2010): <http://www.orionmagazine.org/index.php/articles/article/5617>.

Powell, John Wesley. "Report on the Lands of the Arid Region of the United States with a More Detailed Account of the Lands of Utah." Second Edition. Washington D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1879: <http://pubs.usgs.gov/unnumbered/70039240/report.pdf>.

Rawlins, C.L. "Everybody Has to Be Someplace." *High Country News* 14 (December 1982): 8-9.

"The Reopening of the Western Frontier." *High Country News* 20 (September 1988): <http://s3.amazonaws.com/hcn-media/archive-pdf/1988_09_12_rfs.pdf>.

Ring, Ray. "Rebels with a Lost Cause." *High Country News* (December 2007): <http://www.hcn.org.dist.lib.usu.edu/issues/360/17399>.

*Shane*. Directed by George Stevens. Hollywood, CA: Paramount Pictures, 1953.

Stegner, Wallace. "At Home in the Fields of the Lord." In *The Sound of Mountain Water: The Changing American West*. New York: Penguin Books, 1980. 157-69.

Stegner, Wallace. "Glen Canyon Submersis." In *The Sound of Mountain Water: The Changing American West*. New York: Penguin Books, 1980. 121-36.

Stegner, Wallace. "Living Dry." In *Where the Bluebird Sings to the Lemonade Springs: Living and Writing in the West*. New York: Modern Library, 2002. 57-75.

Stegner, Wallace. "Thoughts in a Dry Land." In *Where the Bluebird Sings to the Lemonade Springs: Living and Writing in the West*. New York: Modern Library, 2002. 45-56.

Steingraber, Sandra. "When Cowboys Cry." *Orion Magazine* (May/June 2011): <http://www.orionmagazine.org/index.php/articles/article/6267>.

Turner, Frederick Jackson. "The Significance of the Frontier in American History." *Proceedings of the Forty-First Annual Meeting of the State Historical Society of Wisconsin*. Madison, WI. 79-112.

"Two Reports from Nevada on the Sagebrush Rebellion, 1979," In *Major Problems in the History of the American West*. Edited by Clyde A. Milner, 556-9. Lexington, MA: D.C. Heath and Company, 1989.

Uchida, Yoshiko. "Desert Exile (1942)," In *The Power of Words: Documents in American History, Volume II: From 1865*. Edited by T.H. Breen, 178-80. New York: HarperCollins College Publishers, 1996.

*The West: Geography of Hope, 1877-1887*. Directed by Ken Burns and Stephen Ives. Bethesda, MD: PBS, 1996.

Williams, Terry Tempest. *Refuge: An Unnatural History of Family and Place*. New York: Pantheon, 2000.