

Appendix C. Analysis of additional chiasms in the Doctrine and Covenants

Don Winegar has recently proposed chiasms in the Doctrine and Covenants (<http://rldsandc.com/>) as evidence that the words in the book are the words of the spirit of God. In some cases, he finds overlapping chiasms that involve the same verses but have different starting, ending, and focal points. Our detailed analyses of two of his chiasms, one in Section 1 and the other in Section 8, give the respective values $L = 1.0$ and $L = 0.42$, indicating that neither chiasm is admissible as evidence. His misleading chiastic summaries are egregious examples of cherry picking, that is, picking out only those literary elements that fit the chiastic form and ignoring vast numbers of repeated elements that do not fit the form.

He summarizes Section 1 as:

- 1a. 1. voice of him who dwells on high
- 1b 1 the voice of the Lord is unto all men
- 1c 2. shall be spoken
- 1c 2. shall be revealed
- 1d 3. I the Lord
- 2a 4. commandments
- 2a 5. the earth
- 2b 6. the Lord
- 2e 7. the day when the Lord shall come
- 3a-e 8.the Lord the Lord the Lord
the Lord the Lord the Lord God
- 4a 9. my servant Joseph Smith, Jr
- 4a 10. gave him commandments
- 4a 10.gave commandments
- 4c 11. Speak
- 4c 12. God
- 4c 13. of the world
- 4d 14. mine everlasting covenant
- 4e 14. the fullness of my gospel
- 4e 13. of the world
- 5a 12 God
- 5a 11 spoken
- 5a 10 commandments
- 5d 9. my servant Joseph Smith, Jr
- 5d-6a 8. God God the Lord the Lord
8. the Lord the Lord the Lord
- 6b 7. the day speedily cometh
- 6c 6. the Lord
- 6c 5. Idumea, or the world.

This chiasm has five elements that appear at more than one level, *speak* (levels B, M), *Lord* (C, E, and H), *commandments* (D, L), *earth* (F, I), and *God* (J, N). Thus, although the chiasm has 15 levels, it involves only 9 unique chiasitic elements, each listed here along with the total number of its appearances in the entire section:

Level(s)	Chiasitic Element	# Appearances
A:	voice	7
B, M:	speak / spoken / spake	6
C, E, H:	Lord	19
D, L:	commandments / commanded	7
F, I:	earth	7
G:	the day cometh	3
J, N:	God	7
K:	my servant Joseph Smith, Jr	2
O:	of the world	4

The chiasm also includes 52 nonchiasitic elements, elements that are stated at least twice that can't be worked into the chiasitic structure.

Non-chiasitic element	# Appearances
world	2
hearken ye people	2
people	3
church	4
true	3
on high	2
all men	3
seal	2
eye/eyes	2
hear	3
rebellious	2
revealed	2
mine everlasting covenant	2
go forth	2
servants	4
book	2
inhabitants of the earth	4
be fulfilled	4
verily I say	3
bearing / beareth	2
power	6
heaven / heavens	4
measure / measured	3
every man	4
fellow man	2

man	2
ends	2
arm	2
shall come	2
come	3
give / given	3
were given	2
word / words	2
prophets	2
establish / established	2
image	2
shall fall	2
proclaim / proclaimed	2
weak / weakness	3
strong	2
flesh	2
faith / faithful	2
know / known / knowing / knowledge	5
sin / sinned	2
repent / repents	3
receive / receives	3
record	2
forth	2
taken	2
Spirit	2
nigh	2
pass away	2

Using these data, CHIASMUS predicts $L = 1.0$ for this chiasm:

```

Chiasm: D&C 1
Number n of chiastic elements: 9
Number of appearances of each chiastic element: 7, 6, 19, 7, 7, 3, 7,
2, 4
Number m of nonchiastic elements: 52
Number of appearances of each nonchiastic element:
2,2,3,4,3,2,3,2,2,3,2,2,2,2,4,2,4,4,3,2,6,4,3,4,2,2,2,2,2,3,3,2,2,2,2,2
,2,2,3,2,2,2,5,2,3,3,2,2,2,2,2,2
Number r of rearrangements: 1000
Number of duplicate levels (normally 0): 6
Calculating... Type command-. to quit.
|-----|-----|-----|-----|
XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX
Reordering likelihood L =1.0000000000000000
Margin of error (+ or -) =0.0316227766016838

```

We now display D&C 1 in its entirety, labeling its chiastic elements in bold face, extra appearances of these elements in italics, and non-chiastic elements in italics:

HEARKEN, O ye people of my church, saith the (A) voice of him who dwells on high, and whose eyes are upon all men; yea, verily I say: Harken ye people from afar; and ye that are upon the islands of the sea, listen together. For verily the voice of the Lord is unto all men, and there is none to escape; and there is no eye that shall not see, neither ear that shall not hear, neither heart that shall not be penetrated. And the rebellious shall be pierced with much sorrow; for their iniquities shall be (B) spoken upon the housetops, and their secret acts shall be revealed. And the voice of warning shall be unto all people, by the mouths of my disciples, whom I have chosen in these last days. And they shall go forth and none shall stay them, for I the (C) Lord have commanded them. Behold, this is mine authority, and the authority of my servants, and my preface unto the book of my (D) commandments, which I have given them to publish unto you, O inhabitants of the earth. Wherefore, fear and tremble, O ye people, for what I the (E) Lord have decreed in them shall be fulfilled. And verily I say unto you, that they who go forth, bearing these tidings unto the inhabitants of the (F) earth, to them is power given to seal both on earth and in heaven, the unbelieving and rebellious; Yea, verily, to seal them up unto the day when the wrath of God shall be poured out upon the wicked without measure—Unto (G) the day when the Lord shall come to recompense unto every man according to his work, and measure to every man according to the measure which he has measured to his fellow man. Wherefore the voice of the (H) Lord is unto the ends of the (I) earth, that all that will hear may hear: Prepare ye, prepare ye for that which is to come, for the Lord is nigh; And the anger of the Lord is kindled, and his sword is bathed in heaven, and it shall fall upon the inhabitants of the earth. And the arm of the Lord shall be revealed; and the day cometh that they who will not hear the voice of the Lord, neither the voice of his servants, neither give heed to the words of the prophets and apostles, shall be cut off from among the people; For they have strayed from mine ordinances, and have broken mine everlasting covenant; They seek not the Lord to establish his righteousness, but every man walketh in his own way, and after the image of his own (J) god, whose image is in the likeness of the world, and whose substance is that of an idol, which waxeth old and shall perish in Babylon, even Babylon the great, which shall fall. Wherefore, I the Lord, knowing the calamity which should come upon the inhabitants of the earth, called upon (K) my servant Joseph Smith, Jun., and spake unto him from heaven, and gave him (L) commandments; And also gave commandments to others, that they should proclaim these things unto the world; and all this that it might be fulfilled, which was written by the prophets—The weak things of the world shall come forth and break down the mighty and strong ones, that man should not counsel his fellow man, neither trust in the arm of flesh—But that every man might (M) speak in the name of (N) God the Lord, even the Savior (O) of the world; That faith also might increase in the earth; That mine everlasting covenant might be established; That the fulness of my gospel might be proclaimed by the weak and the simple unto the ends (O') of the world, and before kings and rulers. Behold, I am (N') God and have (M') spoken it; these (L') commandments are of me, and were given unto my servants in their weakness, after the manner of their language, that they might come to understanding. And inasmuch as they erred it might be made known; And inasmuch as they sought wisdom they might be instructed; And inasmuch as they sinned they might be chastened, that they might repent; And inasmuch as they were humble they might be made strong, and blessed from on high, and receive knowledge from time to time. And after having received the record of the Nephites, yea,

even **(K')** my servant **Joseph Smith, Jun.**, might have *power* to translate through the mercy of **(J')** **God**, by the *power* of **God**, the *Book* of Mormon. And also those to whom these *commandments were given*, might have *power* to lay the foundation of this *church*, and to bring it *forth* out of obscurity and out of darkness, the only *true* and living *church* upon the face of the whole **(I')** **earth**, with which I, the **(H')** **Lord**, am well pleased, *speaking* unto the *church* collectively and not individually—For I the *Lord* cannot look upon *sin* with the least degree of allowance; Nevertheless, he that *repents* and does the *commandments* of the *Lord* shall be forgiven; And he that *repents* not, from him shall be *taken* even the light which he has *received*; for my *Spirit* shall not always strive with *man*, saith the *Lord* of Hosts. And again, *verily I say* unto you, O *inhabitants of the earth*: I the *Lord* am willing to make these things *known* unto all *flesh*; For I am no respecter of persons, and will that *all men* shall *know* that **(G')** **the day speedily cometh**; the hour is not yet, but is *nigh* at hand, when peace shall be *taken* from the **(F')** **earth**, and the devil shall have *power* over his own dominion. And also the **(E')** **Lord** shall have *power* over his saints, and shall reign in their midst, and *shall come* down in judgment upon Idumea, or the *world*. Search these **(D')** **commandments**, for they are *true* and *faithful*, and the prophecies and promises which are in them shall all *be fulfilled*. What I the **(C')** **Lord** have **(B')** **spoken**, I have **spoken**, and I excuse not myself; and though the *heavens* and the *earth* *pass away*, my *word* shall not *pass away*, but shall all *be fulfilled*, whether by mine own **(A')** **voice** or by the **voice** of my *servants*, it is the same. For behold, and lo, the *Lord* is *God*, and the *Spirit* *beareth record*, and the *record* is *true*, and the truth abideth forever and ever. Amen.

Winegar summarizes Section 8 as:

- 1b 1. receive a knowledge (2)
- 1b 2. shall ask in faith (2)
- 1b 3. knowledge concerning (2)
- 1c 4. tell you (2)
- 2b 5. therefore (4)
- 2b 6. hands (3)
- 3b 7. gift (3)
- 3b 8. gift of Aaron (2)
- 3b 9. no other power save the power of God
- 3b 8. gift of Aaron
- 3c 7. gift
- 3c 6. hands
- 3d 5. therefore
- 3d 4. tell you
- 3d 3. knowledge concerning
- 3e 2. ask in faith
- 3f 1. receive knowledge

Here, the number of appearances of each chiastic element is listed to the right in parentheses. The repeated non-chiastic elements in the section, together with the number of appearances of each, are:

faith (2)
 God (5)
 heart (3)
 behold (6)
 spirit (3)
 remember (2)
 things (3)
 power (2)
 work (2)
 spoken (2)

Using these data, CHIASMUS predicts $L = 0.42$ for this chiasm:

```

Chiasm: D&C 8
Number n of chiastic elements: 8
Number of appearances of each chiastic element: 2,2,2,2,4,3,3,2
Number m of nonchiastic elements: 10
Number of appearances of each nonchiastic element: 2,5,3,6,3,2,3,2,2,2
Number r of rearrangements: 1000000
Number of duplicate levels (normally 0): 0
Calculating... Type command-. to quit.
|-----|-----|-----|-----|
xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx
Reordering likelihood L =0.4213200000000000
Margin of error (+ or -) =0.0006490916730324
  
```

We now display D&C 8 in its entirety, labeled as above:

OLIVER Cowdery, verily, verily, I say unto you, that assuredly as the Lord liveth, who is your *God* and your Redeemer, even so surely shall you **receive a knowledge** of whatsoever *things* you **shall ask in faith**, with an honest *heart*, believing that you shall receive a **knowledge concerning** the engravings of old records, which are ancient, which contain those parts of my scripture of which has been *spoken* by the manifestation of my *Spirit*. Yea, *behold*, I will **tell you** in your mind and in your *heart*, by the Holy Ghost, which shall come upon you and which shall dwell in your *heart*. Now, *behold*, this is the *spirit* of revelation; *behold*, this is the *spirit* by which Moses brought the children of Israel through the Red Sea on dry ground. **Therefore** this is thy *gift*; apply unto it, and blessed art thou, for it shall deliver you out of the **hands** of your enemies, when, if it were not so, they would slay you and bring your soul to destruction. Oh, *remember* these words, and keep my commandments. *Remember*, this is your **gift**. Now this is not all thy **gift**; for you have another **gift**, which is the **gift of Aaron**; *behold*, it has told you many *things*; *Behold*, there is no other *power*, save the *power* of *God*, that can cause this **gift of Aaron** to be with you. *Therefore*, doubt not, for it is the **gift** of *God*; and you shall hold it in your *hands*, and do marvelous *works*; and no *power* shall be able to take it away out of your **hands**, for it is the *work* of *God*. And, **therefore**, whatsoever you shall ask me to **tell you** by that means, that will I grant unto you, and you shall have **knowledge concerning** it. *Remember* that without *faith* you can do nothing; *therefore* **ask in faith**.

Trifle not with these *things*; do not ask for that which you ought not. Ask that you may know the mysteries of *God*, and that you may translate and **receive knowledge** from all those ancient records which have been hid up, that are sacred; and according to your *faith* shall it be done unto you. *Behold*, it is I that have *spoken* it; and I am the same that spake unto you from the beginning. Amen.