Undergraduates crossing the threshold: Assessing library interns using the Framework

Carly Marino, Special Collections Librarian
Sarah Fay Philips, Coordinator of Instruction & Research
1. Threshold Concepts and Undergraduate Internships
2. Humboldt State University *Library Scholar* Internship as a case study
3. How to incorporate knowledge practices from 3 of the frames
   a. Authority is Constructed and Contextual
   b. Information has Value
   c. Research as Inquiry
4. Formal assessment example
   a. Exhibit Analysis assignment
5. Q & A
Who is here?

Do you:

1: Have an undergraduate internship program

2: Want to develop an undergraduate internship program

3: Want to learn more
Undergraduate Internships are environments for exploring Threshold Concepts, because they are “akin to a portal, opening up a new and previously inaccessible way of thinking about something.”

Threshold Concepts & Undergraduate Internships

- Undergraduate internships are instruction
- Structure undergraduate internships in a supportive and effective learning environment
- A cohort supports students as they make linkages and grapple with troublesome knowledge and threshold concepts together

Questioning Why? Ideas
“What surprised me about the internship is how involved it was. Based on my past internships I expected to be doing busy work or running errands. I didn’t expect to learn as much as I have... I [was] also surprised how important everyone has become to me which is something I didn’t expect.”

(Student B Spring 2016)
Threshold Concepts & Undergraduate Internships

**Transformative**: significant shift in how a student views an idea or discipline

**Integrative**: help a student understand how previously disparate knowledge is related

**Problematic or Troublesome**: knowledge gained may contradict a student’s previously held opinions. May be so new or strange to the student that they may have trouble grasping them.

“I didn’t have many expectations going into the internship, so there wasn’t much for me to make a comparison to. I suppose it was different in that there was a lot more opportunity to learn than I expected. I didn’t expect to learn as much as I did. I thought it would be more application of skills we already possess.”

(Student D Spring 2016)
“Given the centrality of [threshold] concepts within sequences of learning and curricular structures their troublesomeness for students assumes significant pedagogical importance. How might we best assist our students to gain understanding of such concepts? What might account for the variation in student facility to cope (or not) with these learning thresholds?“

Team-based, project-based Undergraduate Internships in the Library!

Humboldt State University Library Scholar Internship

Project-based internship designed to impact student learning.

- Curricular Focused
- Case Study - Special Collections
- Interdisciplinary
- Team Based
2 minutes to note projects that
- you need support with
- has campus support
- has curriculum alignment
Project Based Internship
Humboldt State University's Literary Journal

One of the new sections of Humboldt State's Library is the Authors' Hall, where our university celebrates authors who have come and been a part of the community. Students, faculty, and staff are all welcome to submit things they've published to be a part, and one of the biggest parts of Authors' Hall is the school's literary journal, Toyon.

In publication since 1954, Toyon has been a big part of writers' lives here at Humboldt State as a chance to publish their work for their peers.
Authority is Constructed and Contextual

Knowledge Practices
Learners who are developing their information literate abilities:

- define different types of authority, such as subject expertise (e.g., scholarship), societal position (e.g., public office or title), or special experience (e.g., participating in a historic event)

- acknowledge they are developing their own authoritative voices in a particular area and recognize the responsibilities this entails, including seeking accuracy and reliability, respecting intellectual property, and participating in communities of practice

- understand the increasingly social nature of the information ecosystem where authorities actively connect with one another and sources develop over time.
Authority is Constructed and Contextual Incorporation in Internship

Authorship and Ownership: Blog posts, social media, exhibits, workshops

Designing online exhibits: Curation research and selection

Conversations about bias and perspective

Intellectual property application

Collection and donor work

Press releases and publication projects
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Framework</th>
<th>HSU Library Needs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moment</td>
<td>Photographs and Documents Digitized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authority is</td>
<td>Student Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constructed and</td>
<td>Design Online Exhibit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contextual</td>
<td>Student Learning and Troublesome Moment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Selecting and Researching Items and Publishing Content Online</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment of</td>
<td>Assessment of Student Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Learning</td>
<td>Exhibit Analysis Assignment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE HUMBOLDT BAY AND SHIPS

The Humboldt Bay proved exceptionally valuable to the region, not only as a means to transport cargo, but as a means of travel as well. The Bay is the only area of the region accessible to most vessels except those with deep drafts, making it a popular port of entry.

The Humboldt Bay is the only double-ended harbor between San Francisco and the Oregon border. The Bay is 14 miles long and spans from 1 to 4 miles wide, making it a key port for unloading and loading of treasurers into and out of Humboldt County.

Ships and Travel:

The travel ship remained a dominant factor during this era. The route to and from Humboldt consisted of two lines of freight and passenger steamers. One route came south from San Francisco, and the other went north to Coos Bay and farther north to Astoria, Oregon.

Although the trip through the swale was a popular one, it did have its dangers. Many ships attempting to make the trip met a disastrous fate, with many ending up in the bottom of the Bay.
Information Has Value

**Knowledge Practices**
Learners who are developing their information literate abilities

- understand that intellectual property is a legal and social construct that varies by culture;

- articulate the purpose and distinguishing characteristics of copyright, fair use, open access, and the public domain;

- recognize issues of access or lack of access to information sources;

- decide where and how their information is published;
Information Has Value
Incorporation in Internship

SkillShops:
Copyright
Open Access Week
Wikipedia Edit-a-thon

Library Lifelong Learning Lounge

L4 HSU SUMMER 2016 MAY-JULY

LIBRARY LIFELONG LEARNING LOUNGE

Mission: Meet Personal and Professional Development needs of students (specifically student workers), staff, and faculty over the summer. Connect programming offered over the previous year or for the future year in a coherent, organized, and planned summer series of “lunchtime” activities.

Cultural Awareness  Technology
Creativity and Professional Exploration
Information Has Value
Incorporation in Internship

Social Media: creation, policies

Native American collections, photographs, and other material

Conversations about access

Presentations about Information Resources (budget, management)

Creators and contributors to scholarly conversation
HSU Library Needs
Publishing Projects

Student Project
publish rare books (pre-1923) and Special Collections material online

Student Learning and Troublesome Moment
Wikipedia Edit-a-thon

Assessment of Student Learning
Correct application of copyright in work
Library Scholar Intern Campus Connections
Library Scholar Intern Campus Connections
“If the collection looks disheveled and not truly aesthetically pleasing for the public, (but its order makes sense to librarians/archivists) digitizing the work can make the collection more enticing and approachable for people outside of the process.”

(Student C Spring 2016)
“Prior to my internship... I had no idea there was so much more information there. I always took the library resources I used for granted. I never thought about how the library got all the books and articles I used. It shocked me to see how much work goes into setting up all of the resources that we have access to on campus.” (Student E Spring 2016)
Knowledge Practices
Learners who are developing their information literate abilities

- deal with complex research by breaking complex questions into simple ones, limiting the scope of investigations;
- organize information in meaningful ways;
- synthesize ideas gathered from multiple sources;
Research as Inquiry
Incorporation in Internship

Exhibit concept and proposal
Curation and selection of objects to display
Researching the researcher
Process an archival collection
Creating digital timelines or maps
Interdisciplinary team based research
HSU Library Needs
Collection that needs to be made available to researchers

Student Project
Design an exhibit (physical or online)

Student Learning and Troublesome Moment
Exhibit proposal and presentation and examination bias

Assessment of Student Learning
Evaluation of exhibit
Creating a Gift for the Future: Digitization Utilizing Omeka.net

Scanning

Scanning is the first step to digitization. When starting the scanning process, write down instructions specific to the scanner to help identify the best settings for future reference. Methods change depending on the object. Note books are scanned using a copy stand, a camera facing downward, and foam wedges to prevent damage. Slides need a slide holder to prevent direct heat and warping, and require the removal of the lid cover of the scanner to allow light to shine through. Photos and documents use a standard scanner. Change the dpi, color, and reflective quality according to set procedures for that particular format. Freely scale the image as a JPEG or TIFF and save it to the specified folder. The object is ready for the next step of digitization and prepared for an online exhibit.

Metadata: Information About Information

Metadata is descriptive information about exhibit items. Metadata and information professionals craft standardized terms and phrases similar to the search terms one might enter into Google, with the goal of anchoring research and data so that the collection may be more searchable. Omeka has a fillable metadata feature which shows up alongside every digitized item. Research projects can be organized with a metadata application profile.

Why?

The digitization of information is important for several reasons, most importantly making information easily available to researchers all over the world. Digitization also can be used to make information accessible that is not otherwise available, or to preserve unique information that is in danger of otherwise being lost.

Publicizing Work

When publishing works on Omeka, one should keep in mind the intended audience of the exhibit and collection. How will they use it in research? Why are the researchers interested? The featured works in the Omeka exhibit should be the most relevant from the collection and pictures should be prominently displayed.

Once a work is published on Omeka, publicizing the work is important so peers know the research is accessible online. There are six ways to publicize an online collection. Social media is a great way to make works known. Consider asking a librarian to add a link to your site on their research guide. Additionally, contact any professors to whom your work is relevant.

Check out our site: http://vinyard.omeka.net

Contributors: Alexandra Jason, Blanca Urquiza, Cathlyn Garibay, Kaylee Voigt, Nicole Maithebons, Victoria Bruner, Xi Bao

Acknowledgements: Larry Isgro, Cataloging/Metadata Librarian Larry.Isgro@humboldt.edu, Carly Marzio, Special Collections Librarian/Archivist Carly.Marzio@humboldt.edu.
"One connection that I have made between theory and practice is that when it comes to certain things, there isn’t just one correct way to do things; often there are several. Like accessioning material. There are several ways to identify items and information depending on what works best for the organization of material."

(Student E Spring 2016)
Assessment and Library Scholar Internship Curriculum

1. Pre-Test Initial Exhibit Analysis
2. Introduced Skills/Framework for Internships
3. Developed Skills/Threshold Experiences
4. Some mastery with the application of skills, tools & understanding
5. Post-Test Final Exhibit Analysis

Reflection and Discussion
You are newly hired as an assistant in a museum and you are asked to step in to lead an exhibit tour. Examine the [exhibit name and URL] and answer the following questions as you prepare the presentation.

Who is the intended audience?
Are authoritative sources used? How do you know?
Find additional supporting or contradictory information about the topic.
What perspectives other than the creator are included?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Student Learning Outcome</th>
<th>Performance Level: Initial/Beginning (0)</th>
<th>Performance Level: Developing (1)</th>
<th>Performance Level: Skilled (2)</th>
<th>Performance Level: Capstone/Professional (3)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Students will be able to find and select appropriate sources that support or provide related information on the exhibit</td>
<td>Uses open web and selects poor quality sources. Is not able to identify additional information on the topic</td>
<td>Uses open web and selects quality sources. Uses Library resources but selects irrelevant or inappropriate sources</td>
<td>Uses appropriate level and good quality Library resources (from the catalog, Articles+, databases, etc.) OR Used provided bibliography</td>
<td>Used provided bibliography AND (appropriate level and good quality Library resources OR appropriate and good quality resources from the Open Web)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Students will accurately identify and evaluate authority and credibility of sources and the exhibit</td>
<td>Student makes no effort to evaluate for authority or credibility or back up reasons</td>
<td>Student attempts to use evaluative criteria, but does so inaccurately or incorrectly or inconsistently</td>
<td>Uses evaluative criteria to provide a limited or superficial explanation of authority or credibility</td>
<td>Uses accurate evaluative criteria to provide in-depth explanation of rationale for authority or credibility.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Element</td>
<td>Student Learning Outcome</td>
<td>Performance Level: Initial/Beginning (0)</td>
<td>Performance Level: Developing (1)</td>
<td>Performance Level: Skilled (2)</td>
<td>Performance Level: Capstone/Professional (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Student will be able to evaluate exhibit and identify constructive ways to improve exhibit</td>
<td>Student makes no effort to identify ways to improve the exhibit</td>
<td>Student attempts to use superficial description (more/less) OR incorrectly identifies improvements</td>
<td>Uses evaluative criteria to provide limited and basic suggestions for improvement</td>
<td>Uses accurate evaluation of missing elements and gaps in research to identify improvements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D*</td>
<td>Students will be able to use evaluative criteria to identify the perspective and potential bias of the creator</td>
<td>Student makes no effort to evaluate for bias or back up reasons</td>
<td>Student attempts to use evaluative criteria, but does so inaccurately or incorrectly</td>
<td>Uses evaluative criteria to provide a limited or superficial explanation for bias</td>
<td>Uses accurate evaluative criteria to provide in-depth explanation of rationale for bias.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Element</td>
<td>Alignment with ACRL Framework</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A: Students will be able to <strong>find and select appropriate sources</strong> that support or provide related information on the exhibit</td>
<td>Searching as Strategic Exploration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B: Students will accurately <strong>identify and evaluate authority and credibility of sources</strong> and the exhibit</td>
<td>Authority is Constructed and Contextual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Information has Value</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Element</td>
<td>Alignment with ACRL Framework</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C: Student will be able to <strong>evaluate</strong> exhibit and <strong>identify constructive ways to improve exhibit</strong></td>
<td>Scholarship as Conversation Research as Inquiry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D: Students will be able to use evaluvative criteria to <strong>identify the perspective and potential bias of the creator</strong></td>
<td>Scholarship as Conversation Information has Value</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Exhibit Analysis Assignment Change

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Average change from initial to final (F15)</th>
<th>Average change from initial to final (S16)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A: Students will be able to <strong>find and select appropriate sources</strong> that support or provide related information on the exhibit</td>
<td>+.75</td>
<td>+.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B: Students will accurately <strong>identify and evaluate authority and credibility</strong> of sources and the exhibit</td>
<td>+1</td>
<td>+1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Exhibit Analysis Assignment Change

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Average change from initial to final (F15)</th>
<th>Average change from initial to final (S16)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C: Student will be able to <strong>evaluate</strong> exhibit and identify constructive ways to improve exhibit</td>
<td>+1</td>
<td>+1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D: Students will be able to use evaluative criteria to <strong>identify the perspective and potential bias of the creator</strong></td>
<td>+.25</td>
<td>+.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Change from pretest to posttest for each element
Rate of Change for all Interns Fall and Spring
What Does This Mean?

Internships are a way to:

• Impact and improve student learning
• Teaching information literacy, problem solving, critical thinking and lifelong learning
Impact of successful Internships

• Bequest from former Library Student Assistant designated to fund Interns
• Collection donated with funding for processing
• Higher profile in Library Redesign
• Campus Research Grant
• Federal Grant
In their own words

“Now after this internship the Humboldt Room isn't just a resource it's also a place I find relaxing which is why next semester I plan on stopping by to scan more journals. It's like a second extension of home. I felt out of place my first semester here and being an intern made me feel like part of the school and felt better about my choice to attend HSU.” (Student B Spring 2016)
Carly Marino
Special Collections Librarian
carly.marino@humboldt.edu

Sarah Fay Philips
Coordinator of Instruction and Reference
sarahfay@humboldt.edu

Photographs courtesy of Humboldt State University Flickr, Carly Marino, Claire Reynolds and Victoria Bruner