4-15-1995

The Brigham City Co-op: Case Study of an Efficient Economic and Social Institution

Stephen J. Valentine
Utah State University

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.usu.edu/honors

Part of the History Commons

Recommended Citation
https://digitalcommons.usu.edu/honors/417
THE BRIGHAM CITY CO-OP: CASE STUDY OF AN EFFICIENT ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL INSTITUTION

AN HONORS THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE UTAH STATE UNIVERSITY HONORS DEPARTMENT

DEPARTMENT OF HISTORY

BY

STEPHEN J. VALENTINE

APRIL 15, 1996
THE BRIGHAM CITY CO-OP: CASE STUDY OF AN EFFICIENT ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL INSTITUTION

AN HONORS THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE UTAH STATE UNIVERSITY HONORS DEPARTMENT

DEPARTMENT OF HISTORY

BY

STEPHEN J. VALENTINE

APRIL 15, 1995
INTRODUCTION

The leaders of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints faced a twin dilemma in the years of 1868 to 1874. The specter of non-Mormon infiltration of society and destruction of the Mormon empire loomed menacingly on the horizon, and internal divisions and inequities threatened to destroy the religious ideals of unity and equality fostered by Mormons since the time of Joseph Smith, Jr. This twin crisis led Mormon leaders to institute church-wide economic and social programs of reform, culminating in 1874 with the establishment of the Second United Order of Enoch.

The issue explored herein is the internal dilemma of the Mormon Church; the perceived threat of inequality and division among Church members, and the subsequent attempts to institute social programs to alleviate these problems. Mormon leaders had to balance religious beliefs of unity, equality of opportunity, and self-sufficiency with economic realities of inequality, stagnant social mobility, and individual self-interest. These internal pressures were balanced by a socio-religious institution that enabled social control while offering substantial incentives to both self and group interests. Using Brigham City as a case study, I will attempt show that the United Order provided an efficient institution not only for fostering religious unity, but also to balance the often competing interests of religious belief with economic self-interest.
HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Brigham City was settled in 1851 by William Davis and a small group of settlers, acting independently of Church direction. The community struggled for survival for the first three years, and by 1854 only six families remained. Brigham Young recognized the potential importance of the settlement as the northern outpost of the Mormon Kingdom, and in 1854 he called Lorenzo Snow, a close friend and member of the Council of Twelve Apostles, to gather several families and settle in Brigham City, to personally take charge of the religious and economic development of the community. Lorenzo Snow, an early advocate of the need for greater community cohesion and self-sufficiency, took immediate steps to establish an unique experiment in Brigham City, starting with the organization of a cooperative general store in 1864.

The early cooperative experiment was a joint-stock company of four investors, the largest shareholder being Lorenzo Snow. Snow supervised the opening in 1864 of a general mercantile store with the stated purpose of "uniting the community for the general welfare and interest of the community."(2) There were several competing merchants in business at the time, but Snow, through religious persuasion, was able to convince the men to combine into a cooperative scheme of business, with each merchant selling out his goods for stock in the company. Within five years the Co-op
store would be the only store in town, and would monopolize all arteries of business and society in Brigham City.(3)

The association, named the Brigham City Mercantile and Manufacturing Company, became formally incorporated as a community-owned joint-stock company in December, 1870. The stated purpose of the company, or "Co-op" as it was locally known, was to "furnish employment for those of our settlement who wished to labor for their support, combine our interests, and become self-sustaining."(4) In an attempt to include all members of the community in the company, the Board of Directors reduced the price of an individual share to five dollars. The stockholders elected a six member Board of Directors to manage the association, and voting was done according to the number of shares held.(5)

The Co-op was intended to achieve Brigham Young's designs of economic self-sufficiency, independence from "Gentile" traders, and greater social order through community cohesion and equality of opportunity. These ideals, which constitute the ideological basis for the Co-op, were derived from Mormon scripture and the recorded revelations of Joseph Smith Jr., the prophet of the early church. Brigham Young, the successor of Young, particularly stressed the concept of Mormon unity and harmony. Unity, defined in the exhortations of Mormon leaders, is the economic, religious, and social cohesion of Mormon members. Trade, farming, manufacturing, as
well as religious matters, functioned properly only if individuals cooperatively assisted each other under the firm direction of Church leaders. Individuals combined in cohesive labor, religion, and purpose truly and purposefully forfeited individuality to form a "community".

Equality of opportunity, another key Mormon tenet, derived directly from the basic Mormon belief of the individual's progress toward salvation. Though unequal in this mortal life, Mormons believe that every person has equal opportunity in attaining the fullest degree of eternal salvation. Similarly, in Mormon belief, all should have equal opportunity to attain earthly honor and riches. Church sponsored economic programs, such as the Brigham City Co-op, aimed to not only consolidate the community, but also to assist the poor find greater opportunity and economic equality.

Contemporaries viewed Brigham City as an example of successful communal industry and social harmony, of particular importance to social reformers due to the labor disorders and strikes gripping the United States during this period. Brigham Young, who continually supported the operation of the Co-op, modeled his United Order in large part after the Brigham City experiment. Even when the nation and most Utah communities were hard hit by the financial depression of 1873, Brigham City experienced its period of greatest expansion and profit. The community even attracted the notice of social reformers in England who wrote that the Mormons had "created a soul under the rib of death."

(6)
The United Order, initiated by Brigham Young in 1874 as a sweeping program of economic and social reform for the entire Church, created no tangible changes in the Co-op. The reorganization into the United Order consisted merely of changing the name from the Co-op to the United Order, and the creation of a 60 member United Order Council which served as an advisory board to the Co-op Board of Directors. (7) Additionally, the United Order Council provided a religious incentive and sanction for the Co-op, and functioned as a forum for local workers to become ideologically united and directed in their labors.

The Co-op leaders, in order to achieve group solidarity, maintained tight control of labor and competition. The Co-op was intended to encompass all the community, and there were even plans to relocate all departments in one central location, with street cars to run from the central location to various parts of the town and the railroad station. (8) Competition, so feared as disruptive to the Co-op plan, was non-existent until the formal renunciation of the United Order in 1882. The absence of competition was partly due to religious motives and economic coercive control, and also due to the fact that employment for the Co-op was almost universal in Brigham City. Competing merchants found few Mormons to patronize their businesses due to the success of Lorenzo Snow's economic experiment of combining religious dogma and sanction with a community-wide economic and social institution.
The ideals of Snow had to contend with the growing inequality and depressed social mobility that citizens of Brigham City were experiencing by 1870. Brigham City had within twenty years reconstructed much of the social order of the "Gentile" world the early Mormon pioneers left behind. Economist Clayne Pope has argued that the unique doctrine of the Church coupled with the circumstances of exodus, migration, and settlement, should have provided an ideal and unprecedented opportunity for Mormons to construct a harmonious and equal society. Yet by 1870 this had not occurred in Brigham City, for already class divisions were forming and inequality, the foundation of disunity, was increasing.

Occupational and financial data from the 1860, 1870, and 1880 Federal censuses, as well as the earliest available tax rolls, illustrates the widening economic division developing in Brigham City during this period. The percentage of unskilled laborers in Brigham City rose from 26 percent of the labor force in 1860 to 48 percent in 1870. Mean total wealth in 1860 for farmers, the wealthiest and numerically largest occupational segment (64 percent), was $987.00, whereas the common laborer only averaged $342.00. By 1870 this inequity would widen, as the numbers of unskilled and common labors had grown and their mean real value decreased. Farmers, in 1870, only represented 34 percent of the work force, yet their averaged real value
increased to $1200.00. Unskilled laborer wealth, now nearly half of the labor force had fallen to $257.00 total mean wealth.

The total wealth controlled by the leadership of the Co-op and the 60 member United Order Council represents a further problem of upper class economic aggrandizement, which plagued Brigham City, like the rest of America, during this period. The six member Co-op Board of Directors, representing only 3 percent of the work force and a minuscule .05 percent of the total population, monopolized 22 percent of the total community wealth in 1870. The United Order Council, representing a wide range of economic condition, achieved the greatest balances, as it’s 18 percent of the work force controlled 19 percent of the wealth. The unskilled laboring class, however, which represented nearly half of the work force (43 percent) held only 12 percent of the wealth. By 1870 the majority of Brigham City’s work force was finding their real wealth decreasing, and their share of the community wealth diminishing.(10)

The preceding economic data has been cited to underscore the idea that a real cause for social disorder existed in Brigham City in 1870. On Sunday the common Mormon laborer listened to sermons extolling unity and equality, and yet on Monday he struggled to survive while watching his Church leaders prosper. And Lorenzo Snow’s Co-op exacerbated rather than ameliorated some economic problems. The Co-op, praised by later historians as providing greater economic and social opportunity for the
citizens, actually served to depress opportunity for social mobility. The closed system of labor and payment closed usual avenues of opportunity in independent small business, stifled the chance to accumulate cash savings, and increased the laborer's virtual dependence on the Co-op for his livelihood and necessities.

The research by Wayne Walquist and Clayne Pope both conclude that a remarkable degree of spatial mobility occurred in Utah between 1860 and 1880, largely because the young and poor could not find economic opportunity in their respective communities.(11) This pattern is confirmed in Brigham City during this period, as few laborers persisted in the community from one census to the next. Only one of 26 traceable laborers listed in the 1860 census persisted into later Brigham City records, including the 1870 and 1880 censuses, and the 1878 tax roll. The 1870 laboring group found roughly 25 percent persisting into 1880, and a record of mixed social mobility.

Eight laborers found in the 1870 group were traced through existing Brigham City records to determine the degree of mobility present in the community from 1870-1887. Detailed information on these men (included in appendix V) form the base of evidence for six basic conclusions. First, the opportunity for social mobility was not open to all, despite the attempts of Lorenzo Snow's Co-op; second, employment opportunities were sometimes unavailable or undesired; third, the social status of one's father had little
relevance in the ultimate mobility of the son; fourth, the poor were still more likely to move elsewhere despite the incentives Snow’s Co-op offered; fifth, mobility was depressed because of the payment mode of the Co-op in local script; sixth, the controlled labor and anti-competition environment of the Co-op contributed to the decrease in mobility through reduced avenues in small business opportunities. (12)

THE CO-OP AS AN EFFICIENT INSTITUTION

The realization that mobility remained closed to some laborers persisted as a reason of concern for Lorenzo Snow. Economic inequality and imperfect mobility realistically threatened Snow’s designs for social cohesion and order in the community. Consequently, Snow took deliberate steps to ameliorate the negative effects that economic problems were causing by establishing an institution that provided positive individual religious and social incentives. Furthermore, the Co-op institution incorporated the pervasive religious ideals upon which Mormon society was built into the economic realities of everyday life.

Lorenzo Snow successfully accommodated the first religious ideal, the need for economic and religious cohesion, by creating a common labor pool unified by effective mechanisms of labor control. The Co-op leaders initiated programs that created a common labor pool united by religion, economics, shared interest, and coercive control. Instead of communal property or
money, Snow utilized common labor as capital, thus distinguishing his system from the later Orderville communal experiment. (13)

The common labor system functioned on the basis of utilizing specialized labor under the tight direction of the Co-op leaders, with payment of any labor performed by local script, redeemable in merchandise or company stock. Seasonal workers were employed in the winter to construct buildings and factories for the Co-op, thereby receiving otherwise unavailable employment, and attaining shares of stock in the company. The Co-op gained valuable buildings, such as a $10,000 tannery, at basically no cost since payment in stock did not appreciably diminish the company capital. (14) This system of common labor allowed the Co-op to quickly accumulate capital that was reinvested in new industries. This efficient system consequently increased production from $60,000 in 1873 to $260,000 in 1875. (15)

The payment mode of the Co-op was perhaps the most ingenious methods of achieving unity, gaining capital, and increasing the common labor pool by means of increased employee dependence on the Co-op. Payment made in local Home-D script, worthless outside Brigham City, meant that an employee was dependent on the Co-op, not only to purchase merchandise, but because an accumulation of cash savings was impossible. Payment in company stock presented an even greater dilemma, and created a sort of reverse individual-to-company debt dependence. A gradual accumulation of company stock through labor created a credit and investment for the
employee; an investment, or "stake in society" that would be lost if the laborer left the community or ceased to work for the Co-op. Indeed, one could say that an employee could not quit because the Co-op was in debt to him!

Common labor also became combined under the Co-op system through an effective appeal to religious sentiment by the United Order Council. Feramorz Fox, early Co-op historian, noted that the United Order Council was the most effective means of instilling religious sentiment for Snow's economic plan because it created a framework by which people were brought "into conformity with the Church wide plan and wishes of President Young". (16) The Council became the indoctrinating mechanism, solidifying support and reinforcing the extolled belief that the economic programs of the Co-op were in fact religiously motivated, and should be followed with pietistic zeal.

The United Order Council was a collection of religious and economic leaders of the Co-op who gathered primarily to advise the Co-op Board of Directors and "reinforce their devotion to the higher goals". (17) The Council included each department supervisor, the Board of Directors, the wealthy and influential individuals and Church leaders, as well as a representative collection of laborers from each department. The Council became a forum for town discussion and reinforcement of religious ideals. Constant reinforcement and group planning provided excellent control among the
department leaders who then transmitted their indoctrination down to the common laborers. Through the Council, the laborer learned what was expected of him religiously, what role he played temporally, and how he was serving to build the Kingdom of God.

Another means of controlling labor was the classification and specialization of labor into various departments. By 1874 approximately 40 departments divided the economy into specialized trades and factories, covering almost every phase of agriculture or manufacture. The departments included such diverse enterprises as a dairy, hattery, broom factory, and silk department.(18) These departments furnished all the goods and services for the community and provided the opportunity for employment for all the citizens of Brigham City. By 1870 the opening and closing of the Co-op departments, signified by a single courthouse bell, regulated the work-forces of the entire community.(19)

The classification system, in addition to promoting greater efficiency in the economy, also reduced competition by incorporating former competitive merchants into positions in a Co-op department. Morris Rosenbaum, for example, a prominent merchant before the Co-op monopolization, was invited to manage the Co-op Mercantile store instead of his own store, thereby removing his potential economic competition.(20) Lorenzo Snow would later recall that a major design in achieving unity had been "by classifying and assigning them severally to such departments of industry as would best
promote individual and general interest and of the building up the Kingdom of God."(21)

There was also a "down and dirty" side to controlling labor in Brigham City; the coercive or "forced unity" control by Co-op leaders. Co-op leaders would not countenance any competition or opposition to the Co-op in Brigham City, and took strident steps to eliminate and control opposing labor. The United Order Minutes from the period illustrate the leaders' views of the matter:

It was moved and carried unanimously that the council disapprove, discountenance, and disfellowship all persons who would start an opposition store or assist to erect a building for that purpose.

(22)

From the Church pulpit, the Co-op leaders frequently instructed the citizens not to trade or fellowship any opposing merchants. According to one contemporary, active involvement in the Order was an indication of religious fidelity, and any who labored outside the Order were socially and religiously suspect.(23) Any who would countenance opposition, especially the strictly forbidden trade with Corinne, a neighboring "Gentile" city, was liable to be investigated by committees appointed to deal with backsliding members. The Committees could recommend suspension from the quorum of the priesthood or excommunication from the Church.(24) To assist in this process, and in case the admonitions of the spirit were not enough, Co-op leaders stationed faithful members at rival competitors' doors to record the names of all persons who traded therein.(25)
A veritable crisis occurred in the community over the conduct of one Morris D. Rosenbaum, one of the wealthiest inhabitants and a former merchant. The crisis served to illustrate not only the tenuous hold of the Co-op on the ambitions of businessmen, but also the tenacity and strength of Co-op control of labor. Upon opening a rival mercantile store in the face of stiff economic and religious resistance from the community, Rosenbaum asked President Brigham Young to address his grievances and allow his competition in Brigham City. Young instead wrote a letter to the United Order Council, directing them to reincorporate Rosenbaum in the Order and make him general manager of the Co-op mercantile store. The Co-op directors were incensed and refused to allow Rosenbaum this position. A delegation immediately departed to explain to President Young the situation and the Board’s stand on competition. Meanwhile, the leaders instructed members not to countenance Rosenbaum in any way in order to force him out of business.

The plot thickened over the next several days as the community learned that Rosenbaum was accompanied in business by none other than Robert Fishburn, the highly respected music director of the community! Furthermore, Rosenbaum began circulating that he had previously counseled with Lorenzo Snow about opening his rival store, and that Snow himself gave Rosenbaum his blessing. Community members were both absorbed and distressed by the proceedings, and Snow immediately condemned Rosenbaum, denied any
previous involvement, and refused conciliation. The Directors agreed that conciliation was impossible, and accordingly John D. Reese accepted assignment to speak with Rosenbaum. Reese later related that he found Rosenbaum possessed of a "very bitter and wicked spirit, opposing the authority and counsel here." Neither side was willing to be reconciled.

As word was waiting from President Young, the Directors called a special emergency session of the United Order Council in order to confront Rosenbaum. After two hours of tumult and tirade by both sides, Fishburn rose and denied any dishonest dealings, instead proclaiming that Rosenbaum had in fact deceived him by proclaiming that Snow had blessed the rival operation. Begging for redress, Fishburn abandoned Rosenbaum and rejoined the Order in good standing. Rosenbaum remained adamant in opposition, and the meeting adjourned without action taken.

Two days later the Co-op leaders called another meeting, again without word from Young. Although the details of the meeting are unknown, it was clear that the conflicting sides reached agreement, for Rosenbaum immediately closed shop and repaid the money lent him. The existence of the abortive rival business, and all the controversy surrounding it, had only lasted only two weeks.(26) The controversy surrounding the issue, however, illustrates the power the Order had to control labor, but also the competing desires of some individuals in the community. Unity was achieved, but individual ambitions were still seething, now just below the surface.
The process of direct control succeeded in protecting the Co-op from external economic completion, but there were also internal threats of labor problems that had to be resolved. The Council minutes illustrate the increasing emphasis being placed on internal labor control. Lorenzo Snow stated on one occasion that there needed to be more than a tacit understanding about the obligation for laborers to remain at work. Instead, Snow wanted a strong understanding that would bind the laborer to his department. (27) The Council even considered retaining a portion of the worker’s wages until the expiration of his labor contract, as means of increasing firm labor control. (28) The Council also concurred that "no person should have work without first getting the sanction of the general Council of the United Order." (29) Obviously this requirement would increase Council control over the employment of each individual in the community.

One distraught department supervisor addressed the Council on the question of how best to control and govern his laborers, and get the most work out of them. Brother Reese answered that "it is the duty of superintendents to keep order in their departments", while brother Tingey counselled that he corrected laborers "privately and kindly; if that failed he gave them their time and quit." Lorenzo Snow authoritatively answered that "the foundation of success lay through example and through being prompt to correct every fault in negligence by the employee." (30)
The issue of labor control was best exemplified in the case of Denmark Jensen and Christian Olsen, two common laborers in the Co-op lumber mills. Lorenzo Snow opened the 15 July, 1877 Council meeting by speaking on the mutual obligation between the Co-op and its employees, and then proceeded to relate the case of Jensen and Olsen. Apparently both men had left the lumber mill without permission to return to Brigham City, and were now excluded from work within the Co-op. Both men were summoned before the council that day and their defense heard. Olsen apologized for his rash actions, stated that he now saw the error of his ways, and wished to return work. Denmark also wished to return to work, yet stated he would not apologize, for he saw no error in what he had done. Snow replied that he need not apologize as long as he returned to work and paid the department the losses in labor incurred by his departure. Denmark reluctantly concurred in the judgment.(31)

Some workers, like Christian Olsen, would not question the authority of the Co-op leadership in their direction of labor. Others, like Denmark Jensen, questioned it, yet found no better alternative to resisting. The majority of workers, however, remained in the Co-op not simply because of the labor controls, or lack of better alternative, but because the Co-op offered real individual incentives. The Co-op achieved unity through labor control, and it achieved social order and religious and social (if not economic) equality—
the other pressing Mormon beliefs—through its effective use of providing incentives.

PROVIDING INCENTIVES

The most obvious incentive for a Brigham City resident of 1870 was the sense of faithful fulfillment of religious duty by participation in the Co-op. Religion remained the core of community life in Brigham City during the 1870’s; most individuals ordered their lives according to the dictates of their religion. Contemporary accounts repeatedly emphasize that religion, rather than economic profit or labor control, was the motivator that kept them in the Co-op. Individual accounts abound about great personal sacrifice and financial sacrifice made in the name of religious devotion to the Co-op and the revered authority of Lorenzo Snow.

Joseph Smith Hamson, for example, was "called" by Lorenzo Snow to fulfill a Co-op work mission hundreds of miles away in Southern Utah. Although distraught at the prospect of leaving his family, Hamson accepted the call as a matter of religious duty. The Co-op work camp spent two years cultivating cotton and producing warp for the Co-op Woolen Mill. The two years were fraught with hardship, as illness and fevers continually weakened the camp. Hamson returned to Brigham City and in 1877 was called by Snow again to work for the Co-op, this time at the Twin Saw and Shingle Mills. Tragedy struck Hamson soon after, when his leg was caught in a saw belt and mangled so badly that it had to be amputated below the knee. (32)
The hardship associated with the work callings, however, did not keep laborers from accepting work assignments. Charles F. Nelson, for example, related his feelings about being called by Snow to tend the Co-op sheep herd in Hogup, a remote location in northwest Box Elder County. Although the assignment meant hardship and temporary bereavement from his family, Nelson faithfully responded to the call because "Lorenzo Snow stated, 'If you go, I will call it a mission'". Nelson felt that he could not refuse such a mission call from his Church leader. (33)

In addition to religious compulsion, the poor laborer also found incentive in the Co-op by the many programs instituted to alleviate his condition, and by the acceptance, rather than rejection, that the community had for the poor. Lorenzo Snow related that a good portion of the valuable bread stuffs had been given to the poor each year, though this deprived the Co-op of a valuable commodity, since wheat was traded as a cash article (34). Many prominent men took the poor into their homes, as suggested by President Snow. Bishop Alvin Nichols alone supported eleven poor individuals, including three Indians (35). In all, over 50 people received support by the more wealthy households in 1870, representing a serious effort to alleviate the condition of the poor or disabled.

Lorenzo Snow also oversaw the establishment of an unique "tramp department", with the stated aim of assisting the poor vagrants the drifted through the community. The department hired the "tramps" who arrived off
the local railroad, as well as the general unemployed from not only Brigham City but also neighboring communities. The department hired the poor as day-laborers and paid subsistence wages for their labor. The tramp department succeeded beyond all expectation, even reporting a profit of $950.00 for the year of 1877.(36)

All laborers enjoyed the incentive of universal employment offered by the Co-op. Contemporaries described Brigham City as a "hive of industry" where no man need be unemployed or impoverished. Indeed, Brigham City was described as not having a "loafer, or an idle man, boy, woman, or girl; industry, prosperity and contentment seemed to characterize the entire community".(37) The use of a common labor pool utilized unemployed masons or carpenters to construct community buildings, it incorporated "tramps" and the poor into a specific department with specified labor available, it even utilized the Indians of the community by the establishment of an "Indian Farm" where Indians could learn agriculture and become self-supporting.(38)

The Co-op and United Order Council actively participated in the improvement of community life. The United Order Council oversaw the construction of homes for desirous members, and made improvements or additions to member's property without charge. It became the guardians and benefactors of widowed wives and children, it helped pay for Mormon missions for individuals so called, and it labored to care for the sick and
afflicted, so their illness would not mean loss of income for the family. Bishop Alvin Nichols stated that the Co-op had supported and employed "many people, some of whom are in delicate health or crippled, who under other circumstances would be utterly unable to earn their living." Lorenzo Snow also provided many social and cultural incentives to those who labored in his Co-op. The Co-op leaders supported the first community schools, helped pay the salaries of the teachers, and provided text books for students. Most Co-op departments additionally hired young men as apprentices and taught them skilled crafts or trades, giving the youth of the community training and employment they otherwise would not have received.

Snow actively promoted cultural activities such as music and drama, for the benefit and betterment of the community. The Brigham City Dramatic Association was founded in 1863 under the guidance of Lorenzo Snow. The association began presenting plays for the community in Snow's home, but soon expanded into the County Court House as the popularity increased. Snow cultivated the music of the community by hiring Robert Fishburn from Smithfield to relocate in Brigham City and serve as Music Director of the local choir. A community dance hall was constructed by the Co-op, and several Co-op members served as musicians for weekly dances. Snow also organized a polysophical society and a debating society, for the cultural and educational improvement of the society. The admission to the all social
and cultural events were paid by the local Home-D script. The cultural events were intended for the benefit of the Co-op members, and served as another incentive for community members to enter into the Order.

The skilled craftsmen and prosperous businessmen also found incentives in the Co-op. Ola N. Stohl, for example, operated a successful tailor shop independently in 1866, yet encountered economic competition from other tailors in town. The incorporation of the Co-op combined all the community tailors into one department, and in 1874 President Snow invited Stohl to become superintendent of the department. Stohl benefitted economically from the reduced competition, and received higher pay as a superintendent than he had as a tailor. The department functioned cohesively until 1879, when Stohl was called on a Church mission and the department dissolved.(46)

Some craftsman, such as Chester Southworth Sr., received direct economic benefit and incentive from the Co-op programs. Southworth opened an independent tannery in 1857 in a small adobe shop.(47) Lorenzo Snow's extensive vision for the Co-op translated into an expansion of Southworth's small tannery into a large, modern factory. The construction and equipment were entirely furnished by company capital, the total expenditures exceeding $10,000.00.(48) Southworth managed the factory for the Co-op for several years, enjoying far greater productive capacity and labor supply than conceivable in his small adobe shop.
The common laborer benefitted from the Co-op by employment opportunity, the poor received financial and educational assistance, and even the wealthy found incentive, either through religious ideals or economic gains. A final incentive existed, however, and one close to the heart and desires of Lorenzo Snow. The Brigham City Co-op functioned most efficiently as a shelter and haven for Mormons seeking independence from the "Gentile" world and retardation of the "Americanization" of Mormon society. Lorenzo Snow, writing in the last entry of the United Order Minutes, reexamined the accomplishments and failures of the Co-op as follows:

Because of many losses and disasters . . . we have discontinued some of our enterprises and curtailed others. Yet for a period of fifteen years, our union has prevented division in mercantile business; say nothing about many other things which have been done by our union, and I have nothing to regret of all we have accomplished. We have kept out our enemies, and in all these matters we did them by common consent.(49)

ASSESSMENT

The Brigham City Co-op and United Order efficiently balanced religious beliefs of unity and equality with the competing pressures of economic inequality and social disorder. This equilibrium was achieved by the implementation of successful social controls than enabled group cohesion while offering economic, social, and religious incentives. The real achievement of the Co-op leaders, therefore, resides not in any material gain, but in the social union and order resulting from an equitable balance of
religion and economics. The equitable combination of Church and State created a successful experiment responsible for both the admiration of social reformers throughout the world, and the tangible improvement in the economic, social, and religious lives of Brigham City citizens.
FOOTNOTES


(3) Ibid., p. 113

(4) Letter in possession of Church Archives, Watkins to Gates. See also Riddle, Mark, "The Brigham City Co-op" (Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University, 1978, Master's Thesis) p. 5

(5) Ibid.

(6) Arrington, "Cooperative Community," 211.


(8) Ibid., p. 116


(10) Statistics are from the 1860, 1870, 1880 U.S. Manuscript Censuses, and Brigham City Tax Assessors Rolls, 1878, in possession of State Archives.


(12) Compiled from 1860, 1870, and 1880 Federal Manuscript Censuses; 1887 Tax Assessors Rolls, in the possession of the State Archives. Also Brigham City Co-op Stock Report and United Order Roll Book, account books in the Brigham City Mercantile and Manufacturing Association records 1865-1895, in the possession of the L.D.S. Church archives. Also see Appendix V for more information on social mobility.

(13) Fox, Feramorz Y., "Experiments in Cooperation" (typescript, LDS Church Archives), Chapter VI p. 14.

(15) Riddle, "The Brigham City Co-op," 8-9.


(17) Arrington, Building the Kingdom of God, 122.


(19) Arrington, Building the Kingdom of God, 117.

(20) Brigham City Co-op Board of Directors Minutes, November 4, 1872. An account book in the Brigham City Mercantile and Manufacturing Association records 1865-1895, in the possession of the L.D.S. archives.


(22) Ibid., 206.

(23) Horsley, Burt A. "Oh Pshaw and Counfound It: Reminiscenses of a Mormon Patriarch". Typescript in the possession of the Brigham City Community Library, p. 4.

(24) Ibid.


(27) Brigham City United Order Minutes, February 20, 1875. An account book in the extensive Brigham City Mercantile and Manufacturing Association records 1865-1895, in the possession of the L.D.S. Church archives.

(28) Ibid.

(29) Ibid.

(30) United Order Minutes, February 12, 1877.

(31) Ibid., July 15, 1877.

(33) **Biographical Sketch of Charles Fredrick Nelson.** D.U.P. Histories, p. 2.

(34) Arrington, "Cooperative Community," 213.

(35) 1870 Federal Manuscript Census.

(36) Riddle, "Brigham City Co-op," 21.

(37) Arrington, *Building the Kingdom of God,* 123.

(38) Arrington, "Cooperative Community," 204

(39) Ibid., 208

(40) Journal History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, April 20, 1874. In the possession of the L.D.S. Church Archives.

(41) Short History of the Co-op, An account book by Lorenzo Snow in the Brigham City Mercantile and Manufacturing Records 1865-1895, page n.n. In the Possession of the L.D.S. Church Archives. Also see Riddle, Brigham City Co-op," 21.

(42) Riddle, "Brigham City Co-op," 21.

(43) **History of Box Elder County** (Daughters of the Utah Pioneers, 1937) p. 66

(44) Robert Leeming Fishburn, 214.

(45) **History of Box Elder County,** p. 188.

(46) Ibid., 78-79.

(47) Ibid., 81-82.


(49) Brigham City United Order Minutes, July 20, 1880.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Fox, Feramorz Y. "Experiments in Cooperation." Manuscript in the possession of the L.D.S. Church archives.


Primary Sources

Biographical Sketch of Charles Frederick Nelson. Daughters of the Utah Pioneers Histories. Manuscript.

Brigham City Board of Directors Minutes. Account books in the Brigham City Mercantile and Manufacturing Association records 1865-1895, in the possession of the L.D.S. Church archives.

Brigham City Co-op Stock Report. Account books in the Brigham City Mercantile and Manufacturing Association records 1865-1895, in the possession of the L.D.S. Church archives.

Brigham City Co-op Short History. Manuscript by Lorenzo Snow in the Brigham City Mercantile records, Church Archives.

Brigham City Tax Assessor's Roll, 1887. Utah State Archives.

Brigham City United Order Minutes. Account books in the Brigham City Mercantile records, Church Archives.
Brigham City United Order Roll Book. Account books in the Brigham City Mercantile records, Church Archives.

1860 United States Manuscript Census. Utah State Archives.

1870 United States Manuscript Census. Utah State Archives.

1880 United States Manuscript Census. Utah State Archives.


History of Box Elder County. Daughters of the Utah Pioneers, 1937. Manuscript.

Horsley, Burt A. "Oh Pshaw and Confound It: Reminiscences of a Mormon Patriarch." Manuscript in the possession of the Brigham City Community Library.

Journal History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. In the possession of the L.D.S. Church Archives.

Letter between Watkins and Gates. In the possession of the L.D.S. Church archives.
