The Cache Valley Shoshones: Cultural Change, Subsistence, and Resistance, to 1870

John W. Heaton
Utah State University

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.usu.edu/etd
Part of the History Commons

Recommended Citation
https://digitalcommons.usu.edu/etd/4022
THE CACHE VALLEY SHOSHONES:
CULTURAL CHANGE, SUBSISTENCE,
AND RESISTANCE, TO 1870

by

John W. Heaton

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree
of
MASTER OF ARTS
in
History

UTAH STATE UNIVERSITY
Logan, Utah
1993
To Rachel
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

A project of this nature requires much support, both moral and practical, to reach fruition. Many people influenced this project and should be recognized for their gallant support.

Special thanks to--my mentor and friend, Anne M. Butler, for believing in me, for bravery in the face of the enemy, meritorious service, and patience above and beyond what is expected of a thesis advisor; Clyde A. Milner II, for giving me a chance; Tom Lyon, for his professionalism, concern, and interest; A. J. Simmonds, for inviting me into his inner sanctum of knowledge of Cache Valley and giving me free rein of his laboratory (Merrill Library Archives).

Thanks to--the history department faculty, especially David R. Lewis, for his humor and willingness to listen to my concerns about Native American history; to Barbara Stewart, for her genuine concern and interest.

Thanks to the archivists--Bradford Cole and Robert Parson, Utah State University Archives; Mary Anne Greenwell-Plantz and Val Wilson, Utah State Archives; the helpful staff of the L. D. S. Archives; the Daughters of the Utah Pioneers, especially Isabelle Bright.
Thanks to--my family and friends for putting up with me--my mother, Patricia Heaton, for unconditional love and support; my father, J. Harold Heaton, for teaching me the value of dedication and discipline; and to his wife, Jackie, for her wit and good nature; my favorite uncle, Rodney Mann, for his sense of humor and timing; the Pelhams and Bruscos for ignoring my strange quirks; my brother Michael, for being my brother Michael; Wayne and Cherry Luzzader and family, for shattering the myth of the scary in-laws and providing love and support; my great friends from Portland, Oregon, my old buddy, Sam, and his wife, Deb, and the rest of the Proctors, the Parkers, the Williams, Big Al, Drew, and Jim for sending me off on a great adventure; the Hamsons, who befriended me upon my arrival.

Thanks to--my big dogs for "walkys" and stress relief in the high country: Satch, Kiah, and especially the Outlaw Josey Wales, who wagged his way into my life eight years ago, stuck by me through thick and thin, and has been the best buddy a man could ever have.

Greatest thanks to--the love of my life, Rachel, for patience, love, support, and her willingness to climb on board this "long strange trip" with me.

John W. Heaton
PREFACE

The Northwestern Shoshones traveled with the changing seasons. They looked upon the earth not just as a place to live, but they called the earth their mother. She was the provider of their livelihood. The mountains, streams and plains stood forever they said, but the seasons walked around annually.

The Shoshones of the Great Basin inhabited one of the most unforgiving environments in North America. Although the evolution of their culture allowed them to survive in this region, they received derogatory names—such as "Snakes," "Dust-eaters," "Diggers," and "Shuckers"—from the European Americans with whom they came in contact. The equestrian bands of Shoshones,

---

1This quote is an excerpt from Shoshone oral history. Mae T. Parry, "Massacre at Boa Ogoi," in The Shoshoni Frontier and Bear River Massacre, by Brigham D. Madsen (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1985), 231.

2Scholars have diverged on the issue of the proper spelling of "Shoshone." Most contemporary historians prefer "Shoshoni." However, in deference to the spelling used by Fort Hall Reservation Shoshones and Shoshone oral historian Mae T. Parry, this thesis uses "Shoshone."

located in the northern reaches of the basin and beyond, although vilified, also evoked a measure of respect for their "ferocity" and military prowess. These two contrasting images—poverty-stricken brutes and savage warriors—formed the basis for contemporary perception and traditional scholarship.

More recently, historian Brigham Madsen, an expert on the Northern Shoshones, has presented a more balanced approach to their history. However, his narratives portrayed Shoshone culture as seemingly rigid, as responding passively—although often violently—to overwhelming environmental, biological, economic, and social changes in their traditional homeland. Yet, Shoshone reaction to European-American encroachment transcended reflexive responses. Shoshones incorporated technological innovations when they could, and seized the initiative in their relations with whites.

As an alternative to viewing these modifications as

---


a passive reaction to contact with European Americans, this thesis argues that Shoshones actively responded to foreign encroachment by incorporating white technology into their culture within a native context, and by initiating change. Although contact with foreigners transfigured their traditional native society, it did not make Shoshones any less Shoshone. Their subsistence patterns adapted, but Shoshones did not choose to abandon their hunter-gatherer migratory lifestyle.

Shoshone resistance to settlement took on attributes of an offensive. Driven from their lands by settlers, the Shoshones forced Mormon church leaders, government officials, emigrants, and individual farmers to scramble to cope with their presence. Shoshone refusal to relinquish rights to their homeland and traditional culture required European-American intruders to live warily, consent to repeated demands of tribute, and provide periodic food subsidies.

The cost of keeping the peace in Cache Valley emerged as a heavy burden to Mormon settlers. The success of Shoshone resistance can be measured in the repeated calls of Mormon settlers and church leaders, as well as government Indian agents, for relief from the burden of feeding the natives. The federal government responded swiftly and violently at Bear River in 1863.
There, Colonel Patrick Connor's California Volunteers inflicted a crushing blow on the Northwestern Shoshones, killing more than 250. In the wake of this defeat, the Shoshones continued to resist assimilation for about another ten years. Finally, the outnumbered and outgunned Shoshones submitted to gnawing hunger and agreed to live under white supervision.

This thesis examines the interaction between the Cache Valley Shoshones, a sub-band of the Northwestern Shoshones, and the various waves of European Americans whom they encountered. An analysis of the Cache Valley Shoshones provides an example of Indian/white relations in the Great Basin during the 19th century. Cache Valley Shoshones, an equestrian band by the time fur trappers entered the Central Rockies, lived in a region that emerged as a center of fur trade activity. In the years following the demise of the fur trade, the great roads of overland emigration crossed just north of Cache Valley, straight through Shoshone country. By mid-century, Mormon settlers began pouring into

---

6The Utah Territorial Indian Commissioner arbitrarily designated the Shoshone bands to the north and west of his agency headquarters in Salt Lake City as the Northwestern Shoshones in The Treaty of Box Elder 30 July 1863. Despite the fact that the so-called "Northwestern Bands" actually occupied a central position within the boundaries of the greater Shoshone linguistic group, the designation continues to be in use. Charles J. Kappler, ed., Indian Affairs. Laws and Treaties. vol. II (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1904), 850.
the valley, and within two decades, secured its possession. The Cache Valley Shoshone band "suffered particularly" from the presence of European Americans. Their active response to contact with a foreign culture--incorporation of technology, economic participation, adaptation to the presence of whites, and resistance to assimilation--is the focus of this project.

Chapter one surveys the anthropological and early history of the Cache Valley Shoshones. It traces the change in subsistence and culture that occurred when they incorporated the horse into their way of life. Chapter two discusses the tidal wave of economic action and environmental change encountered by the Shoshones during the fur trade era. Again, the Shoshones adapted to new technology and opportunity. Chapter three examines the movement of Mormon settlers into the valley. The Shoshones found themselves pushed off their traditional subsistence base. Rather than capitulating, the Cache Valley Shoshones went on the offensive, found new ways to survive, and managed to cling, for about two decades, to their traditional migratory existence.

Forced from their land and left with no means to subsist, the Cache Valley Shoshones submitted to American

---

domination and control. Most of the remnants of the Cache Valley band either moved onto the Shoshone reservation at Fort Hall, Idaho, or onto the Mormon church-sponsored Washakie farm. Throughout the process of dispossession, Cache Valley Shoshones actively resisted--adapting whenever necessary, seizing opportunities whenever possible.
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DEDICATION</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PREFACE</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. THE PENGWIDIKA OF CACHE VALLEY</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. VISITORS IN THEIR LAND</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. DRIVEN FROM THE GARDEN</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. EPILOGUE</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABSTRACT

The Cache Valley Shoshones: Cultural Change, Subsistence, and Resistance, to 1870

by

John W. Heaton, Master of Arts
Utah State University, 1993

Major Professor: Professor Anne M. Butler
Department: History

During the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, the Shoshones of Cache Valley evolved from scattered pedestrian hunter-gatherers to large, armed, mounted bands that hunted and gathered from the Great Basin to the Plains. Trade with European Americans helped initiate this evolution. However, Shoshones did not respond passively to the presence of European Americans. Shoshones actively sought change, and incorporated trade goods into their culture within a Shoshone context. They adapted to each wave of European Americans that they encountered. When Mormons dispossessed them of their land, Cache Valley Shoshones resisted by going on the offensive. Finally overwhelmed, the remnants of the Cache Valley Shoshones submitted--physically but not
spiritually—to European-American oversight. (149 pages)
The Women took the water brought in by Coyote and washed the babies. They made all the tribes of Indians in this way except the Shoshone. When Coyote came, they said, "we have left these for you to wash." Coyote washed the Shoshone babies and said to them; "you are my children." If he had washed all the babies, there would have been nothing but Shoshone in the world. That is why the other tribes were always fighting the Shoshone.¹

The Shoshones of Cache Valley, also known as the Pengwidika or Fish Eaters, were a subgroup of the Northwestern Shoshones.² Their oral creation story—first published in 1906—referred to the existence of hostile relations with other native groups. However, according to anthropologist Julian Steward, the Shoshones


²This group was also known as Hukandika ("dusteaters": they walked on foot and thereby got the dust of the desert in their mouths) or Rabbit Eaters; Ake Hultkrantz, "The Shoshones in the Rocky Mountain Area," Annals of Wyoming 33 (April 1961): 31-32; The Northwestern Shoshones were one of many linguistically uniform bands that constituted the Shoshonean language group, a subgroup of the Uto-Aztecan linguistic stock. Stewart, "The Shoshoni," 2.
of the pre-horse era lived a peaceful existence as "warfare was virtually unknown." Not until the acquisition of horses in the early 1700s did the Shoshones begin periodic warfare with native groups from the Great Basin, Plateau, and Plains.

The incorporation of the horse by Northwestern Shoshones represented one of the first recorded cultural adaptations made by this group. The horse influenced the ways Cache Valley Shoshones interacted with and altered their environment to suit the needs of their changing life patterns. Shoshone adaptation to equestrian culture enabled them to increase the efficiency of their subsistence in the harsh Basin-Plateau region. Additionally, horses provided the means to exploit the vast resources of buffalo found on the northern plains.

To better understand the nature and the consequences of the alterations in Cache Valley Shoshone subsistence patterns, this chapter examines the Great Basin environment in general, and more specifically that of

---


Cache Valley. This includes the anthropological record and early history of the Northwestern Shoshones, as it applies to Cache Valley hunter-gatherer bands of both foot and horse. Finally, this chapter examines the fluid aspects of Cache Valley Shoshone culture during the era that preceded the Rocky Mountain fur trade by addressing the following questions. In what ways did the addition of the horse affect Cache Valley Shoshone culture? How did this band actively seek and make changes to its subsistence patterns and the environment from which it drew subsistence? What were the results of these changes, or what was the nature of Cache Valley Shoshone culture on the eve of the Rocky Mountain fur trade era?

The Great Basin, comprising an area of 210,000 square miles of predominantly mountains and desert, influenced the cultural makeup of one of its principal aboriginal groups: the Shoshones. The region extends east to the Rocky Mountains of central Wyoming and Colorado, west to the Sierra Nevada Mountains of California and the Cascades of Oregon, and north from Idaho's Bitter Root and Salmon River Mountains and Oregon's Blue and John Day Mountains, south to the Grand Canyon in Arizona.\(^5\) One of the region's significant

\(^{5}\)Leonard J. Arrington, Great Basin Kingdom: An Economic History of the Latter-day Saints, 1830-1890 (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1958), 43; Omer
physical features is the absence of any watercourse to the sea. While the Snake, Green, and Colorado Rivers flow partially within this region, the great depth of their stream beds preclude their association with the "interior drainage" (bounded in the east by Utah's Wasatch Mountains) of the Great Basin System. The main rivers—"the Bear, Jordan, Weber, Sevier, and Humboldt—flow respectively into Great Salt Lake, Bear Lake, Sevier Lake, and the Carson Sink."  

For aboriginal groups of the Great Basin, aridity emerged as the critical factor of life. The Sierra Mountains act as a rain screen by wringing moisture laden clouds from the Pacific Ocean. Thus, the Great Basin valleys receive annually an average of less than five inches of precipitation in lower altitudes and from five to ten inches in higher elevations. As a result, mountains within the Great Basin provide relief from low rainfall totals because "precipitation increases rapidly with altitude."  


7Arrington, Great Basin Kingdom, 43.

filed one after another in a parallel north to south formation, serve to extract what little moisture remains after the Sierra Nevada passage. Hundreds of small streams from these ranges provide the arid basin with the bulk of its scant water supply. Of these parallel ranges, the Wasatch—which reaches elevations of 10,000 to 12,000 feet above sea level and surrounds valleys of from 4,000 to 6,000 feet—receives from twenty to thirty inches annually. As an added significance, these few ranges of higher elevation, such as the Wasatch, "not only capture but retain" moisture into the summer months in the form of snowpack.9

Not surprisingly, locations within valleys of lower elevation, near mountain ranges with high elevations and sufficient drainage, generally contained the highest population densities.10 These "oases," as termed by ethnologist Omer Stewart, provided concentrations of plant and animal life. As such, they became the basis for the establishment of human subsistence in the Great Basin.11

---

9 Ibid., 11-12.

10 These densities ranged from "1.5-2 persons per 100 square miles. Walker, Indians of Idaho, 87.

One such oasis, Cache Valley, served as an important "home" for the Pengwidikas, a band of the Northwestern Shoshones. Cache Valley lies in northeastern Utah (sixty percent) and southeastern Idaho (forty per cent). The north/south lying valley floor stretches to about fifty miles in length, with widths of from five to twelve miles. The valley floor lies between 4,400 and 4,600 feet above sea level, has a moderate climate (temperatures range from highs of 95 degrees, to lows of 25 degrees below), and receives annually fifteen to twenty inches of precipitation. The mountains, which flank both sides of the valley, rise to elevations as high as 9,980 feet, and can receive as much as fifty inches of precipitation annually.

The Bear River Range, on the eastern boundary of

---

12 The use of the term "home" for the Shoshones is problematical. A nearly constant nomadic subsistence precluded the establishment of a permanent home. However, the severity of winters in the northern Utah area meant that the Shoshones needed to retire—with the bounty of the Summer's hunting-gathering—to pre-selected winter camps. For this reason, the Shoshones often returned every winter to the same semi-permanent "homes" during the winter months. Murphy and Murphy, Shoshone-Bannock, 315.

Cache Valley, is part of the greater Wasatch Mountain range. It separates Cache Valley and Bear Lake Valley. Several important streams originate in this range. From the south, the Little Bear, Blacksmith Fork, and Logan Rivers drain the southern end of the valley and merge with the Bear River prior to leaving the valley on the western side. From the north, several small tributaries, such as Worm Creek, drain from the Bear River Range and merge with Cub River prior to entering Bear River. From the mountains on the northern and western boundaries flow Deep Creek and Weston Creek, respectively. These creeks also feed Bear River prior to its exit from the valley. In addition to these numerous streams and creeks, Cache Valley receives the run-off of nearly thirty springs, while several artesian springs rise from the valley floor. 14

The well-watered valley floor is flat from years spent submerged as part of ancient Lake Bonneville during the Pleistocene epoch. Fur trader Peter Skene Ogden, the first European American to record his visit to the valley (during 1825), saw large herds of buffalo grazing on the

14Little Bear River has an average flow of 43,210 acre feet (an acre foot is equal to the amount of water necessary to cover an acre one foot deep), Blacksmith Fork averages 82,854 acre feet, Logan River averages 188,670 acre feet, while the Bear River averages 483,627 acre feet. Ibid., 1-2, 15-18.
abundant grasses.\textsuperscript{15} This area "was essentially a grassland with small amounts of sagebrush."\textsuperscript{16} A study conducted by range scientists A. C. and Mary Hull found that among the native grasses present in the valley, "beardless bluebunch was the most abundant species." Other probable native species of importance were "streambank wheatgrass, basin wildrye, junegrass, sandberg bluegrass, western wheat grass, various bluegrasses, Indian ricegrass, needle and thread, and sand dropseed."\textsuperscript{17} The Hulls also stated that "palatable forbs," such as arrow-leaf balsam-root, little sunflower, and stone seed, "were probably abundant, especially on the north exposures and favorable sites."\textsuperscript{18} Important palatable shrubs included chokecherry and serviceberry.\textsuperscript{19}

Ogden reported seeing "no wood of any kind except Willows."\textsuperscript{20} However, according to Ogden's assistant, William Kittson, the fur traders found Cache Valley's


\textsuperscript{17}Ibid.

\textsuperscript{18}Ibid.

\textsuperscript{19}Ibid., 29.

\textsuperscript{20}Miller, "Ogden's Journal," 176.
riparian habitat made up of, among other things, white maple, oak, poplar, and aspen trees. The foothills and mountain slopes teemed with Utah juniper, bigtooth maple, Douglas fir, Engelmann spruce, alpine fir, and lodgepole pine.\textsuperscript{21}

The diverse Cache Valley ecosystem provided refuge from the drier areas of the Great Basin for many species of animals as well. One of the more industrious of these creatures, the beaver, affected the riparian habitat in significant ways. By slowing the flow of water and increasing the deposition of sediment with dams, beavers promoted grassland, marsh, and pond habitats. These areas became home to various species of fish; waterfowl; small and large game animals, such as rabbits, raccoons, otters, deer, antelope, elk, buffalo, bears; and other animal species.\textsuperscript{22}

Cache Valley's environment offered important resources during several seasons of the year, with winter


the most critical of months. While winter storms dropped snow and lowered temperatures, Cache Valley Shoshones found shelter and heat in the abundant willows and brush. Additionally, the numerous hot springs in the northern end of the valley helped to take the edge off the winter cold. This, along with the valley's central location within Shoshone territory, made Cache Valley an ideal wintering ground.\textsuperscript{23}

The examination of pre-horse Northwestern Shoshone culture largely remains the province of archaeologists and anthropologists.\textsuperscript{24} The first recorded contact between...

\textsuperscript{23}Parry, "Massacre at Boa Ogoi," 232.

\textsuperscript{24}Steward excavated several caves on the northern shores of Great Salt Lake. He found evidence of a culture occurring prior to and distinct from that of the Shoshone that he called Promontory culture, "but its correspondence to Shoshoni culture is far from complete." Julian H. Steward, "Ancient Caves of the Great Salt Lake Region," Smithsonian Institution Bureau of American Ethnology, Bulletin 116 (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1937), 83; C. Melvin Aikens excavated sites on the lower Bear River near Willard Bay and the northwestern shore of Great Salt Lake. His findings corresponded roughly with Stewards, although he added A.D. 1350 to 1850 as an approximate time frame for the appearance of the Shoshones in the Great Basin. C. Melvin Aikens, "Excavations at Snake Rock Village and the Bear River No. 2 Site," in Anthropological Papers, no. 87, ed. Jesse D. Jennings et al. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1967), 35, and "Hogup Cave," in Anthropological Papers, no. 93, ed. Jesse D. Jennings et al. (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1970), 194; Weston Canyon, an excavation cite in the mountains surrounding north western Cache Valley in Idaho, contained evidence of occupations dating from "approximately 6000 B. C. until the time of Christ." The cultures periodically inhabiting the cave were primarily
Europeans and Northwestern Shoshones occurred well after the assimilation of the horse into Shoshone culture. However, Steward suggested that the pre-horse Shoshones probably "were at one time fundamentally similar to Western Shoshones" who remained unmounted.

To understand the nature of prehistoric Northwestern Shoshones, scholars extrapolate from the anthropological record of the Western Shoshone foot culture. Using this nomadic hunter groups "of a broad cultural and economic base." The dating of the artifacts precludes their association with the Shoshones according to the time frame of Aikens. Susanne J. Miller, "Weston Canyon Rockshelter: Big-Game Hunting in Southeastern Idaho" (Master's thesis, Idaho State University, 1972), 123, 128-29; see also Mario P. Delisio, "The Natural and Cultural Stratigraphy of the Weston Canyon Rockshelter, Southeastern Idaho" (Master's thesis, Idaho State University, 1970).

Steward, "Basin-Plateau Aboriginal Groups," 236; Francis Haines cited evidence that the Shoshones acquired horses from the Spanish borderlands between 1690 and 1700. David Thompson's journal mentions the warfare on the northern plains during 1720s or 1730s between the mounted Blackfoot and Shoshone bands. The journal from the 1742 Vérendrye expedition refers to the ferocity of a mounted people known as the "Gens du Serpent." These represent the earliest historical references to the Northern Shoshones, both occur after the acquisition of the horse. See J.B. Tyrrell, ed., David Thompson's Narrative of His Explorations in Western North America, 1784-1812 (Toronto: Publications of the Champlain Society, 1916), 131, 326-343, and P. Margry, ed., "Journal du Voyage fait par le Chevalier de la Vérendrye," in Découvertes et Établissements des Français dans l'Ouest et dans le sud de l'Amerique Septentrionale, 1614-1754 (1888), 6: 598-601, in Murphy, Shoshone-Bannock, 294.

methodology, the Cache Valley Shoshones prior to 1690 utilized a hunter-gatherer subsistence pattern. This pre-historic band was a conglomerate of semi-independent family groups. These families lived in "conical pole lodges thatched with bundled grass, bark, or tule mats."  

The family unit, constructed along a bilateral tradition, served as the basis for social and economic endeavor. Patrilineal or matrilineal families--social organizations that designated the side of a family that a married couple lived with--posed too many challenges to subsistence, whereas the bilateral family unit, as a result of its smaller size and flexibility, enabled the Shoshones to survive more efficiently. Consequently, "there was no localized lineage, nor condition for clan development." In other words, environmental constraints impeded the formation of bands.  

These family units spent much of their time gathering more than one hundred varieties of plants and grasses in the following subsistence pattern. In the spring, bulrushes and tules provided rootstalks while weeds such as thistle and clover "were eaten as greens."

---

29 Walker, Indians of Idaho, 89.
By summer, Shoshones gathered bulbs such as the bitterroot, camas, and yampa and dried them for winter use. Grass seeds, gathered in the summer and fall and cached for winter use, were ground into flour forming an important dietary component. Topography played an important role in the availability of resources such as berries. "Individual plants of the same species" ripened at different times—depending on the elevation from which they were gathered—providing a prolonged availability.  

Other primary dietary foods included seeds and piñon pine nuts, as well as insects such as crickets, grasshoppers, ants, insect larvae, and bees. The Shoshone gatherers,

31 Ibid.

32 Carling Malouf, "Ethnohistory in the Great Basin," in A Great Basin Shoshonean Source Book, ed. David Hurst Thomas (New York: Garland Publishing, 1986), 3; Steward, "Western North America—Basin," 276-77. Taken as a whole, the Shoshone diet provided excellent nutrition when most resources were available (however fluctuation of the availability of these resources should be considered). For example, the pine nuts of the Colorado Piñon and Singleleaf Piñon, both found in the Great Basin, contain the following food content respectively: 14% and 10% protein, 62-71% and 23% fat, 18% and 54% carbohydrate. One pound of the Colorado Piñon nut provides 2,880 calories, while both the Singleleaf and Colorado Piñon nuts provide all twenty amino acids (or complete protein). The two types of pine nuts also contain high food quality with unsaturated oleate, linoleate, and linolenate comprising 85% of the total fat content. The Colorado Piñon nut is also rich in phosphorous and iron, and both contain significant amounts of vitamin A, thiamine, riboflavin, and niacin. More significantly, when this resource is available it can be "collected with a high degree of efficiency . . . more than repaying the energy expended in its collection
usually women, found many of these items in the "lower hills and valleys." Cache Valley Shoshones stored these foodstuffs for winter use.

As a result of the scarcity of large game animals in the Great Basin, hunting provided less nourishment for the foot Shoshones than did other resources. Although Shoshones did hunt large animals such as deer, elk, antelope, and buffalo, rabbits were "the largest animals regularly found" in the region. Other smaller animals that helped provide subsistence included squirrels, porcupine, and various rodents. To hunt these animals

and processing." Ronald M. Lanner, The Piñon Pine: A Natural and Cultural History (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 1981), 101-102. The cricket and grasshopper, another important food source of the Shoshones, also had "a high caloric return rate for time invested" in gathering. According to one test, this rate was actually higher than any other domestic or wild food source. "Sun-dried grasshoppers from Great Salt Lake are 60% protein, 10% carbohydrate, and 2% fat by weight and contain roughly 3,010 calories per kilogram." In fact, in roughly one hour's time, a person could "feed four people for nearly a month." The insects collected, dried, pounded into flour, and then mixed with berries and animal fat (pemmican) provided good nutrition. David B. and Brigham D. Madsen, "One Man's Meat is Another Man's Poison: A Revisionist View of the Seagull 'Miracle,'" Nevada Historical Quarterly 30 (Fall 1987): 166, 168, 177.


35 Ibid.
more efficiently, Shoshone family units temporarily banded together—with both sexes participating—for antelope or rabbit drives. These communal drives often occurred during winter encampment when fifteen to twenty families gathered.\textsuperscript{36}

No assessment of the Cache Valley Shoshone subsistence base would be complete without mentioning the resources available along the riverbanks and marsh areas. The Pengwidika received their name because of the trout fisheries of Cache Valley. These fish could be caught year round. Other important fish included suckers and minnows. The waterfowl in the marshes—ducks, mud-hens, geese, grebe, and bird eggs—added to the diverse diet of this band.\textsuperscript{37}

Steward labeled Shoshone hunting and gathering as "multiple subsistence patterns" because "different categories of plant and animal foods entailed certain distinctive activities."\textsuperscript{38} In other terms, Shoshone subsistence and culture operated according to the

\begin{flushleft}
\footnotesize

\textsuperscript{37}Stewart, "Western North America--Basin," 276.

\textsuperscript{38}Steward, "Foundations of Shoshonean Society," 116-119.
\end{flushleft}
seasonal availability, techniques used to acquire, and location of each resource within the yearly pattern. Food resources possessed desirable characteristics predicated on species type, "abundance, seasonality, distribution, and technology for obtaining it." Intimate knowledge of the resource base proved crucial to survival. Shoshones found and gathered these resources "from contiguous but dissimilar microenvironments." This necessitated a nomadic lifestyle of constant migration, with the exception of winter camp, to specific locations during specific seasons of the year. In this manner, the Shoshones exploited a resource during its time of maximum utility.

The Shoshone subsistence in Cache Valley, no matter how sufficient in years of plenty, could prove inadequate in times of scarcity. Perhaps this disparity between the good and bad years prompted Shoshones to incorporate innovative technology into their traditional hunter-gatherer patterns. Sometime in the late seventeenth century, the Shoshones--either by direct trade with the

---

39Ibid.

40Walker, Indians of Idaho, 35.

41Ibid.

42Ibid., 116-118; Steward, "Basin-Plateau Aboriginal Groups," 236.
Spanish in the borderlands or through trade with other native groups from the south—obtained horses. The use of horses spread from the south on both slopes of the Rocky Mountains, but the diffusion occurred faster on the western side. The Shoshones acquired horses before most native groups of the Great Basin, Plateau, and Plains. This allowed Shoshones to expand their subsistence base considerably. They ranged as far as the northern plains before being pushed back to the western side of the Rockies in the mid-eighteenth century by Missouri River tribes.43

Scholars have speculated that two factors related to the arrival of European traders factored in the loss of Shoshone power and prestige on the northern plains. First, exposure to European epidemics decimated Shoshone populations long before Shoshones came into direct contact with Europeans. Second, eastern native groups secured firearms from Canadian and American traders before the Shoshones did. The increased wealth that horses brought to Shoshone bands paradoxically increased their attractiveness to armed native raiders. The disease-weakened Shoshones could not defend against the

43Murphy and Murphy, "Shoshone-Bannock," 294, 332; Stewart, "The Shoshoni," 3.
technological innovation of firearms. 44

The introduction of firearms temporarily affected the balance of power between the tribes. Contemporary accounts, focused on the sensational aspects of inter-tribal conflict, occasionally obscured other changes in Shoshone culture. 45 The incorporation of the horse represented a "technological revolution" for Shoshone bands. 46 This revolution transformed bilateral family groups that previously walked from resource base to resource base, into mounted migratory bands. Equestrian Shoshones traveled further distances between resources in shorter time, hunted larger game animals with increased efficiency, and—perhaps most significantly—transported


the new surplus of food with them wherever they went.\textsuperscript{47}

The ability to procure and transport buffalo meat (and byproducts) with increased efficiency altered the subsistence and social patterns of groups with horses. While roots and other plant foods remained an important aspect of the Shoshone diet, the pursuit of large game emerged as a main focus of the subsistence cycle. In the spring, equestrian Shoshones rode into the mountains for large game. While in these locales, they also sought the traditional food items, such as roots. During the middle of summer, the most drastic shift in the subsistence cycle occurred as bands "joined into large groups" to hunt buffalo east of the Rockies.\textsuperscript{48} When these bands returned to the Great Basin for winter encampment, they brought meat that they either stored for winter use, or traded to horseless Shoshones who gathered traditional summer foods.\textsuperscript{49}

The incorporation of the horse brought, along with increased subsistence capability, wealth and consolidation of power. Buffalo hunting east of the Rockies united the traditional autonomous families into

\textsuperscript{47}James P. Ronda, \textit{Lewis and Clark among the Indians} (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1984), 150.

\textsuperscript{48}Walker, \textit{Indians of Idaho}, 90.

\textsuperscript{49}Ibid.
large bands for most of the year. Bands joined together for protection against rival groups from the east, as well as for increased hunting efficiency. These "essentially cooperative" hunts yielded so much more meat than individual hunts, that "individuals were forbidden to hunt alone." Cooperative hunts enabled a group of "several hundred" Shoshones to acquire enough meat to last most of the year. These united bands initially migrated into the rich buffalo hunting grounds of the northern plains and scattered the horseless native groups who traditionally lived there.

In addition to this shift in the balance of power on the northern plains, the horse initiated alterations in social patterns in the Great Basin as well. Among the Shoshones of the Great Basin, a class system emerged that centered on horse ownership. The majority of northern Shoshones "became participants" in this new system "in which those with many horses and sufficient goods to travel widely formed the upper class." The middle class, those with fewer horses and less mobility,


Ibid.; Hultkrantz, "Shoshonis in the Rocky Mountain Area," 23-24. As has already been mentioned, the Shoshones controlled the northern plains until the mid-eighteenth century when eastern native groups obtained guns from European-Americans.

participated only "partially in the nomadic life of the upper class," or controlled the most productive salmon fisheries on the Snake River.\(^{53}\) The lower class clung to the traditional pedestrian seasonal hunting-gathering patterns of their ancestors.\(^{54}\)

The "upper class" or mounted Shoshones continued to associate "at certain times of the year" with Shoshones of the "foot class."\(^{55}\) However, the horse Shoshones "dominated" those on foot and on occasion refused access to more productive food resource areas. At the same time as the mounted Shoshones increased in power, the foot Shoshones became appreciably poorer as equestrians pushed them into the more desolate areas of the Great Basin.\(^{56}\)

Equestrian Shoshones, already atypical of general Great Basin cultural patterns as a result of the incorporation of the horse, took on accoutrements of plains culture. They developed into a warrior society that "extolled the virtues of warfare."\(^{57}\) Successful war leaders gained political clout and wealth through

\(^{53}\) Ibid.

\(^{54}\) Ibid.

\(^{55}\) Murphy and Murphy, "Shoshone-Bannock," 315.


\(^{57}\) Walker, Indians of Idaho, 26-27.
military prowess and horses. Buffalo increased in importance as a source of food, clothing, and shelter. Wealth and mobility also fomented trade and social interaction with distant tribes.\textsuperscript{58}

However, these mounted bands did not completely cast off their Great Basin cultural heritage. The culture that emerged reflected aspects of both plains and basin life. Gathering remained an important source of food, as did other traditional subsistence methods, while winter camp in the valleys of southern Idaho and northern Utah continued to be important features of the Shoshone lifestyle.\textsuperscript{59}

Shoshones of Cache Valley, like other Northwestern Shoshone bands, incorporated the horse into their culture. In this process they adapted to new exigencies inherent to equestrian life and altered their subsistence patterns and their environment. These changes, implemented during the early eighteenth century, suggest that Shoshones actively sought to improve their subsistence with technological innovation. Furthermore, rather than viewing Shoshones as a society in a climax stage of development, they should be seen as an evolving culture.

\textsuperscript{58}Steward, "Basin-Plateau Aboriginal Groups," 235.

\textsuperscript{59}Ronda, \textit{Lewis and Clark}, 150-51.
One of the basic problems the Shoshones faced as they acquired horses concerned the physical upkeep of their new domestic animals. According to estimates, at the time of the arrival of the first European Americans, "there were from 1 to 2 horses per individual" among the Shoshone bands. Taking into account the aridity of the Great Basin, herds of this size posed certain logistical problems for equestrian bands. Horses actually competed with the Shoshones for certain resources as the animals ate the very grasses whose seeds contributed to human subsistence. Additionally, grasses were a seasonal resource. During the late fall through spring—the most critical time of the year for herd survival—providing fodder for horses emerged as a primary concern for mounted Cache Valley Shoshone bands.

---


61 Ibid.


63 The Pawnees faced similar problems when they incorporated the horses into their culture. They solved the problem of scarcity much like the Northwestern Shoshones, through the use of fire to promote abundant early spring growth, occasional supplemental feeding, and by periodic relocation of camp. For this excellent study of Pawnee adaptation to equestrian culture see Richard White, *The Roots of Dependency: Subsistence, Environment, and Social Change among the Choctaws, Pawnees, and Navajos* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1983), 147-211.
Cache Valley's grass resources offered some of the best grazing lands in the Great Basin. During the winter months, snow accumulation on the valley floor generally did not reach depths that precluded grazing on a variety of grasses. However, occasional severe winters brought snow depths above average. Although this precluded grazing, emergency fodder in the form of tree bark along streams and in the foothills provided nutritional, albeit meager resources. When this failed, Cache Valley Shoshones relocated south, near Great Salt Lake, where winters were generally milder.64

Regardless of the severity of the winter months, late winter and early spring brought shortages, the extent of which depended on weather patterns. While the Cache Valley Shoshones did not suffer as large a problem as Shoshone bands wintering in more barren areas, the problem of seasonal scarcity remained acute. Mounted Shoshones solved this problem by implementing innovative range management.

Cache Valley Shoshones adopted the use of fire to promote dense early growth of grasses. Fur trade and exploration records are replete with references to Great

Basin and Plateau native groups burning the plains "to produce better grass." Many of these records refer to the mounted Shoshone bands. Lewis and Clark noted the use of fire among the Lemhi band in the central Idaho Rockies. Ogden, during his Snake Country expedition, noted several occasions and uses among Shoshones for fire. American Fur trader Captain B.L.E. Bonneville recounted an exhaustive trek through an immense—Shoshone set—prairie fire that kept him disoriented for days.


66 Meriwether Lewis and William Clark, The History of the Lewis and Clark Expedition, vol. II, Elliott Coues, ed. (New York: Dover Publications, 1893), 438; Ogden recounts observing three other reasons for the Shoshone use of fire, to hunt beaver and rodents, as a military tactic, and as a signal to gather for a buffalo hunt, found in E.E. Rich, ed., Peter Skene Ogden's Snake Country Journal, 1824-25 and 1825-26 (London: Hudson's Bay Record Society, 1950), 166, and in K.G. Davies, ed., Peter Skene Ogden's Snake Country Journal, 1826-27 (London: Hudson's Bay Record Society, 1961), 9, 118, 127, 133; Washington Irving, The Adventures of Captain Bonneville, U.S.A., ed. Edgeley W. Todd (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1961), 173-179; other uses for fire include: to help capture large and small game animals as well as insects and lizards, and to promote the growth of plants yielding berries and edible greens, see Walter P. Cottam, "The Impact of Man on the Flora of the Bonneville Basin," (Salt Lake City, 1961), 6, PAM A, 55, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT; another effect of the annual burning of grasslands was the destruction of forage eaten by browsers such as deer and elk, while this was a negative result for the Shoshones, the benefits to their horse herds outweighed the detrimental effects, see White, Roots of Dependency, 184.
While the Shoshones used fire for several purposes, the most important use was to provide fodder for their herds. By firing the valley floor during the late fall, Cache Valley Shoshones insured an earlier spring growth and increased yield of grasses. According to ecological studies conducted on the Plains, "by eliminating the previous year's growth [of grass] and excessive ground mulch, fire allows the sun to warm the earth more quickly."67 The results: grass growth weeks earlier than areas not burned, and "significantly higher yields from March to July."68 These early spring grasses often meant the difference between life and death for the winter-weakened herds.

The Cache Valley Shoshones, through fire use, significantly altered their environment to meet the needs of their evolving equestrian culture and subsistence. Annual burnings cleared the Cache Valley floor of trees, except in riparian habitats, and sage brush. Furthermore, according to ecologist Walter Cottam, Cache Valley Shoshones "were able to maintain, against the true bench and foothill climax of shrubs and junipers, a postclimax grassland which was actually a relic of an

---

67 White, Roots of Dependency, 185.
68 Ibid.
earlier, wetter age. ⁶⁹

By the end of the eighteenth century, equestrian Shoshone bands remained largely unarmed. They lived part of the year in semi-secure mountain refuges. They travelled in large composite groups to the buffalo hunting grounds on the plains. Yet, they found themselves forced to maintain a wary eye for raiding groups—armed and mounted—during all seasons of the year. These Shoshones recognized their disadvantage and sought change. The Lemhi Shoshones revealed their desire for change when they encountered Lewis and Clark in the Beaverhead Mountains of Idaho and inquired of the availability of firearms through trade. ⁷⁰

When the first fur traders entered Cache Valley in the second decade of the nineteenth century, they found a wary equestrian band of Shoshones. This band, the Pengwidika, survived in a harsh climate and region of scarcity. They were members of an evolving culture. During that evolutionary process, Cache Valley Shoshones incorporated the horse into their subsistence patterns.


They altered their physical environment with fire to accommodate their domestic herds, increased the parameters of their seasonal hunting and gathering to include buffalo grounds east of the Rockies, and adjusted their culture by forming conglomerate familial bands. These larger bands—possible as a result of the expanded subsistence capabilities that horses presented—provided relative safety, and promoted development of a combination of Basin/Plains/Plateau culture based on wealth in the form of horses and warrior leadership.

The Shoshones—after learning of the benefits that European-American trade offered—actively sought and incorporated new goods and technology into their traditional subsistence patterns. Firearms, kettles, blankets, and other goods provided Cache Valley Shoshones with "luxuries" that helped minimize the severity of Great Basin survival. However, Shoshone involvement in trade with fur trappers introduced unforseen forces, such as competition, markets, and environmental degradation, that countered some of the benefits of trade. These new elements initiated further adaptation in subsistence patterns, as well as the beginnings of resistance to European-American influences.
CHAPTER II
VISITORS IN THEIR LAND

We told them of their dependence on the will of our government for all their future supplies of whatever was necessary either for their comfort or defense. He lamented that it would be so long before they should be supplied with firearms, but that till then they could subsist as they had heretofore done. 1

Sunday, 11 August 1805 "proved to be one of the most important days" 2 for the Lewis and Clark expedition and the Lemhi Shoshones. On this day, the explorers, desperately in need of horses and geographic information, encountered the horsemen of the Rockies in the Beaverhead Mountains of Idaho. The Lemhi, although initially hesitant, accepted these first whites into their territory. The enticement of trade offered by Lewis and Clark fostered hope among these Shoshones that they might regain prowess lost on the northern Great Plains to the native groups of the Missouri River. Repeated promises of future trade allowed Lewis and Clark to persuade the Lemhi to interrupt their usual subsistence pattern, trade

---

1Lewis and Clark to Chief Cameahwait of the Lemhi Shoshone 17 August, 1805, Lewis and Clark, Lewis and Clark Expedition, 511.

2Ronda, Lewis and Clark, 139.
numerous horses, and--at great risk of starvation later in the season--assist the explorers across the mountains. Without this aid from the native inhabitants of the region, the expedition faced the prospect of wintering in the unfamiliar Rocky Mountains or turning back toward St. Louis. In return for their critical assistance, these Shoshones waited two decades for the promised trade relations with the United States to materialize. ³

Traditionally, historians looked to the romantic and dramatic aspects of Shoshone history. The Lemhi, the people of the famous Sacagawea--the Shoshone guide of Lewis and Clark--caught the imagination of the American mind. This attraction helps to explain the large scholarly bibliography devoted to these people. Others of this cultural group, such as the Wind River Shoshones led by Washakie, also drew the attention of the white populace. Washakie and his subchiefs presided over raiders of the Oregon and California Trails. The inflated stories of their "depredations" blended with the glorious name of Sacagawea to reach an international

audience. Most examinations of Shoshone history either ignore the Rocky Mountain fur trade era, or refer briefly to it as an introduction to the Oregon Trail era.⁴

These better known Shoshone groups, although related linguistically, culturally, and often by blood, did not replicate the general experience of their linguistic relations, such as those of Cache Valley. The Cache Valley Shoshones lived in a region tucked away between the Bear River, Wasatch, and Wellsville mountain ranges. This area offered special opportunities for fur trappers. As a result, Cache Valley Shoshones interacted with large numbers of fur trappers who utilized their region for many purposes. Indeed, few other Shoshone groups felt the intense impact of the fur trade as did those of Cache Valley.⁵

This chapter addresses the Shoshone response to the arrival of fur trappers, the exchange between these cultures, and the environmental legacy of the fur trade

⁴Ronda refers to the "special if indefinable" meaning of the Lewis and Clark Expedition in American History in Ronda, Lewis and Clark, xiii, and also addresses the Sacagawea myth in ibid, 256-58; for an example of an historian using the fur trade era as an introduction to Shoshone history see: Madsen, The Northern Shoshoni, 23-26.

in Cache Valley. The fur trade era represents the initial extended contact between European Americans and Shoshones in Cache Valley. The socioeconomic patterns that developed, coupled with the resulting environmental exigencies, shaped the future Shoshone/white relationship, and suggest an explanation for the eventual decision by Cache Valley Shoshones to turn to depredation—as defined by whites—as a means of survival.

The valley received its name during the mid 1820s because trappers utilized it as a central location to "cache" equipment, tools, supplies, and furs, while travelling to other trapping regions. During the winter months, trappers sought refuge in the valley, often sharing winter camp with Shoshones. In the spring, those trappers who wintered over wasted little time dispersing out to the best trapping grounds. Cache Valley, with its central location in addition to rich natural and human resources, became a fur trade "highway" and expedition preparation ground where trappers fattened their horses on abundant grasses and hunted game to "jerk" for the trail. Trappers also used the site for an annual rendezvous in 1826 and again in 1831, occasions that
broadened the traffic into the region.⁶

The fur trade years, a time of intense interaction between white and native cultures in Cache Valley, provide insight into the environmental exigencies faced by the Shoshones during the era of Mormon settlement in Utah. Granted, the primary documents come from European-American fur trappers. A careful extrapolation of the existing record indicates that a portion of Shoshone history can be illuminated, and that the crux of the Shoshone-white interaction in Cache Valley was environmental. The sources suggest the patterns of the environmental impact of the European Americans in Cache Valley, and more importantly, the contours of an informed Shoshone response.

Fur trappers introduced an unfamiliar mode of production—"organiz[ations] of labor and machinery"⁷ for the extraction and utilization of resources for human

---


consumption—to the Shoshones. The native group actively incorporated elements of this new system into their own culture through the use of white technology to trap beaver and a shift of traditional female labor from gathering food, to intensive processing of fur pelts. As a result, Shoshones experienced a relative increase in wealth, population, power, and prestige, attributable to the fur trade. Consequently, the effects of the decline of the fur trade in the late 1830s, heightened in Cache Valley because of its status as a fur industry center, dramatically affected the Shoshones in northern Utah.

The remoteness of the Rocky Mountains, difficulties posed by transportation, the political situation between the United States and Great Britain, and the economy allowed this region to remain virtually untouched by European Americans. In the early 1820s, the economy in the United States, so troubled during the panic of 1819, began to improve. Fur trade prospects from within the Rocky Mountains again beckoned to interested entrepreneurs. Additionally, the U. S. Congress removed the constraints, more theoretical than real, placed on American traders by the Indian factory system. This made

---

8For an excellent survey of the fur trade in the years prior to 1820 see: Richard M. Clokey, William H. Ashley: Enterprise and Politics in the Trans-Mississippi West (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1980); and Ronda, Astoria and Empire.
it easier to compete with the British companies trapping in the Rocky Mountains. In Mexico, revolutionaries replaced Spanish control in 1821. The newly independent Mexican government sought to entice American trade to the Santa Fe region. Soon, trappers entered the Rocky Mountains from St. Louis and Santa Fe, as well as from the Columbia River.⁹

By the summer of 1832, the population of European American trappers in the Rocky Mountains peaked at nearly one thousand Americans, six hundred British, and a large unknown contingent of free trappers of diverse ethnic

---

⁹Wishart, The Fur Trade of the American West, 121; for an excellent treatment of the impact of the fur trade on the growth of St. Louis see: William E. Foley and C. David Rice, The First Chouteaus: River Barons of Early St. Louis (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1983); for an equally comprehensive examination of the effects of the fur trade on Santa Fe and Taos see: David J. Weber, The Taos Trappers: the Fur Trade in the Far Southwest, 1540-1846 (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1971). In 1818, Donald McKenzie of the Canadian North West Company led a well-equipped brigade into the Snake country. This penetration marked the first organized attempt to exploit the massive fur resources of the central Rockies. Within six years, the Americans, under the leadership of William Ashley, joined the hunt. These early ventures represented little more than preliminary forays that paved the way for future expeditions. LeRoy R. Hafen, ed., The Mountain Men and the Fur Trade of the Far West vol. v (Glendale: Arthur H. Clark, 1968), 235-36; for a complete investigation of William Ashley see: Clokey, William H. Ashley; Dale L. Morgan, Jedediah Smith and the Opening of the West (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1953); and Dale L. Morgan, The West of William H. Ashley, 1822-1838 (Denver: Old West Publishing, 1964); for an examination of pre-1820 fur trade competition in the West see: Ronda, Astoria and Empire.
backgrounds. Most of these trappers eventually converged on Shoshone territory in Cache Valley. The mixing of diverse cultures in the semi-arid ecosystem of Cache Valley had far-reaching implications for Shoshone groups who obtained a large portion of their subsistence in this region.  

The European-American recognition of beaver as a marketable resource represented what one environmental historian called "forms of consciousness." When one form of consciousness challenges a different one during an "ecological revolution, power of society, nature, and space is at stake." The thrust of European and American perceptions, values, and economic systems into the Rocky Mountains effected an ecological revolution from the standpoint of the Shoshones of Cache Valley.

The mechanism for this revolution was the introduction of the fur trade mode of production to Shoshone hunter-gatherer societies. With this new economic organization, whites transformed the Cache Valley ecosystem from a remote region previously used as a subsistence base, to a center of fur production with

---


11Merchant, Ecological Revolutions, 22.
economic and social ties to international markets. In the process of this change, a Shoshone culture that previously adapted to the Spanish introduction of horses, adjusted to new opportunities presented to them through the fur trade.\textsuperscript{12}

In the Rockies, the fur trade evolved differently than on the Missouri River. A lack of navigable rivers for highways into the remote region, a limited body of geographic information, and the absence of relations with the native population, coupled with the Shoshones' and other native groups' nomadic subsistence patterns, posed barriers to contemporary modes of fur production in the early 1820s.\textsuperscript{13} Additionally, the Rocky Mountain mode of

\textsuperscript{12}Worster, "Transformations of the Earth," 1090.

\textsuperscript{13}The general practice of the pre-1820 fur trade called for a government licensed company to build a fixed trading post in the heart of native lands and establish commercial ties with a specific band. This system depended on navigable rivers for communication and supply, and a small, mostly white, labor force to man the post. This system required government licensed alliances with specific native groups, whose members supplied the labor to produce bales of fur--in return for trade goods--to be shipped to manufacturers around the world. In order to generate profits, this mode of production relied on a variety of different species of animals as a resource base. Reliance on a single staple fur bearing animal would soon decimate that animal's population in the vicinity of the fort. When this decimation occurred, a fort ceased to function economically. For an excellent assessment of this mode of production see: Wishart, The Rocky Mountain Fur Trade, 41-115. In this system, native populations provided most of the skilled labor necessary as few European-Americans intruded on Indian lands. Whichever company owned a fort enjoyed a government
production fostered a different relationship between native inhabitants and European-American traders, than that of the Missouri River. Unlike the traditional post system, which encouraged white attention to the well-being of native producers, the rendezvous mode of production altered traders' interests. Under the new structure, migrant (mostly) white trappers extracted

licensed monopoly of trade and influence among the specific band. Since the natives performed the key tasks of the industry, fur companies maintained an interest in the stability and health of the bands with whom they traded. For an example of interaction between European-Americans and Native Americans under this system see Foley and Rice, *The First Chouteaus*, 45-65.

14 In 1824-25, an independent entrepreneur from St. Louis, William H. Ashley, used a new mode of fur production for the Rocky Mountains. Partly by accident, and partly by design, Ashley developed a system that bypassed the rigorous upriver journey on the Missouri River. Instead, he used pack animals to cross South Pass and move straight into the heart of the beaver country in the central Rockies. Ashley built no trading posts; rather, his men understood that they would rendezvous on a specific date at a central location, such as Cache Valley, to trade furs for money or supplies. Then, instead of returning to St. Louis, or as the British trappers did, to a distant trading post and thereby losing valuable time, American trappers wintered together or with friendly Shoshone groups, often in or near Cache Valley. When the next season of hunting began, these men were already near the important beaver streams. According to John C. Ewers, "historians have generally credited Ashley with the invention of the trappers rendezvous. However, it seems more probable that the astute businessman adopted a preexisting native custom to meet the needs of his business." John C. Ewers, *The Adventures of Zenas Leonard, Fur Trader* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1959), xiii; for more on Ashley's mode of production see Wishart, *The Rocky Mountain Fur Trade*, 115-205.
beaver pelts from a region until depleted supplies pushed the men to other areas. In this system, trade with Shoshones occurred as a secondary concern. It no longer fueled the process of gathering pelts. Trade became a means of effecting treaties, making alliances or friendships, or procuring logistical needs. Although these factors represented important elements, they assumed an erratic character. Concern for Shoshones emerged sporadically when whites needed assistance, wanted to trade, or feared attack.\footnote{Ibid.}

During May, 1825, the first recorded contact between Cache Valley Shoshones and European-American fur trappers occurred. Peter Skene Ogden, of the British Hudson's Bay Company, led a "Snake Country brigade" into Cache Valley. On the 3rd, seven Shoshone warriors encountered Ogden's men and an era of change for both cultures began. Ogden's men called to the warriors, and tried to coax them into the camp. At first, the Shoshones did not respond to the attempted communication of these strange men. According to Ogden they "appeared doubtful" of the trapper's intentions. The Shoshones rode strong horses and "wore their war garments." Most of their people, under the leadership of "Pe-i-em" were away "on a trading excursion for shells." This left this group temporarily
vulnerable to attack and partially explained their "shy" behavior. Two of Ogden's men successfully persuaded the "Snakes" to join them so that the trappers might extract information concerning geography and the whereabouts of their American competitors.16

During Ogden's first encounter with Cache Valley Shoshones, he discovered that these natives possessed four guns that "appeared as if they were taken out of the store only a few days since, nor were they wanting any ammunition having procured it [also] from the Americans."17 The trade in firearms offered Shoshones renewed hope in their ability to defend themselves against the dreaded Blackfeet and the prospect of regaining their former prowess as controllers of the northern plains. As a result, firearms and ammunition emerged as a staple of the trading relationship between the two cultures.

The articles of agreement drawn up in Cache Valley in 1826 in which Ashley sold his company reflected the importance of the firearms trade. Ashley "oblige[d] him self to furnish such an assortment of Merchandise as said party of the second part may require . . . ." The first


17 Miller, "Ogden's Journal," 171.
three "required" items on the list were gunpowder, lead, and shot; with "North West Fuzils" (muskets), knives, axes, blankets, and kettles following these items not far down on the list. 18

An accurate assessment of the extent of arms proliferation among various Shoshone groups, and the length of time that passed before this occurred, remains difficult to ascertain. John Townsend, a member of Nathaniel Wyeth's brigade in 1834, offered clues in an account of trade with Shoshones on a branch of the "Mallade" River in southern Idaho. The Indians and traders formed a circle and smoked a pipe of peace, after which the whites offered "a yard of scarlet cloth for leggings, some balls and powder, a knife, and a looking glass," in exchange for some "fermented camas," dried salmon, and information about Shoshone fisheries and geography. That these Shoshones traded for ammunition, rather than for rifles or muskets suggests that--in the case of this Shoshone group--the demand for firearms had diminished. 19

Other trapper accounts support indications that

18 Morgan, West of William H. Ashley, 150-51.

19 Reuben Gold Thwaites, ed., Early Western Travels, 1748-1846, vol. 21, Wyeth's Oregon, or a Short History of a Long Journey, 1832; and Townsends Narrative of a Journey Across the Rocky Mountains, 1834 (Cleveland: Arthur H. Clark, 1905), 245.
Shoshones possessed an abundance of firearms by the 1830s. John Wyeth, Nathaniel's cousin, expressed "surprise" to find that Shoshones, in the year 1832, were "well provided with muskets, powder and ball, woolen cloth, and many other articles." Osborne Russell, a Cache Valley trapper, stated that by the late 1830s, the "Snakes who live upon Buffalo and live in large villages...are well armed with fusees (muskets) and well supplied with horses." 20

The trapper references to the Indian trade also point to the active way that Shoshones sought white goods. To secure better technology, the Shoshones adjusted their subsistence patterns to supply the European-American demand for pelts. Ross underscored this active participation in an account of trade with Shoshones, who clad "in buffalo robes and dressed deer skin" quickly "promised to turn beaver hunters" when they realized the value fur potentially held for them. 21

One important item traditionally linked to the fur trade was alcohol. On the Missouri River trade, where natives played a bigger role in production, traders used alcohol to stimulate demand for their goods and to create

20 Ibid., 83; Russell, Journal of a Trapper, 144-45.

debt. In the Rocky Mountains, alcohol played a lesser economic role for two reasons. First, the bulk of liquor kegs created transportation problems that limited the quantity that pack horses could carry from St. Louis to the rendezvous. Second, the trade with the Shoshones and other native groups in the Rockies operated at a secondary level of economic importance because European-American trappers were the primary producers. Since most pelts came from European-American trappers, trade—occurring once or twice annually—was geared to their trapping needs.22

Generally, alcohol—in part because of a lack of availability—did not represent an inducement to Shoshone fur production. However, adaptation to other trade goods tied Shoshones economically to the white mode of production. This in turn had effects on their culture and their ecosystems. As part of this process, European Americans introduced white markets for Shoshone goods, women, and services, such as their horses, furs, food,

22White, Roots of Dependency, 58-59; Wishart argued that it was "possible that the extent and evils of alcohol use in the fur trade before 1840 have been exaggerated," in The Fur Trade of the American West, 69; "Fourth proof rum reduced [?] at thirteen dollars fifty cents per Gallon" was the thirtieth item on the list of goods that Ashley contracted to supply his partners at the 1827 rendezvous. Whether or not this indicates a lower level of importance remains speculative. See Morgan, West of William Ashley, 151.
and geographic knowledge. The most profound change as a result of the shift in the Cache Valley Shoshone way of life came in the area of increased wealth.

As was the case for native groups east of the Rockies, such as the Fox, Sauk, Winnebagos, and Menominees, the Shoshones, through the fur trade, made improvements in their "standard of living." Spanish horses and American guns allowed Shoshones to become "wealthy and formidable." While the extent of this wealth probably varied from group to group, and between the horse and foot classes, Shoshones of Cache Valley experienced a relative increase in wealth.

The crucial element of this economic gain concerned the effects on population. Although a combination of environmental constraints, warfare with eastern groups, and disease combined to keep Shoshone populations down

---


25 Several smallpox epidemics swept through the native groups on both sides of the Rockies during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Murphy states that these epidemics probably factored in the Shoshone retreat from the northern plains and their subsequent loss of power. Murphy and Murphy, *Shoshone-Bannock*, 295; for a general account of the spread of European diseases through the native populations of the Western Hemisphere see Alfred W. Crosby, Jr., *The Columbian Exchange: Biological and Cultural Consequences of 1492* Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1972.
prior to the fur trade era, the increase in Shoshone wealth appears to have translated into population growth. Although the fur trade records remains vague, apparently disease ceased to be a factor in Shoshone population numbers.

Unlike the paucity of evidence concerning disease among the Rocky Mountain native groups during the fur trade era, the epidemics that raged through the Missouri River native groups—especially the epidemic of 1837—have been well documented.26 White, in a study of the Sioux, offers explanation for a lack of disease among the Shoshones. He stated that "wandering groups were far less vulnerable to . . . epidemics than . . . populous agricultural villages"27 of the Missouri River. The Blackfeet, a nomadic band that did suffer terrible losses during the 1837 epidemic, did so because their migration took them into direct contact with the origin of the small pox: a Missouri River trading post.28

The Northwestern Shoshones lived in the remote


27White, "The Winning of the West," 325.

28Ibid., 329.
reaches of the Central Rockies, and "out of reach of the main epidemic corridor along the Missouri." While they did make hunting excursions onto the plains, Shoshones did so with an attitude of seeking to avoid contact with hostile groups. Shoshone nomadic patterns and the location of their home territories apparently shielded them from major losses to disease during the fur trade years.

Environmental historian Barry Commoner suggested that there "is considerable evidence that increased wealth reduces mortality, which if the birth rate does not also decline--leads to an increase in population." Environmental historian Barry Commoner suggested that there "is considerable evidence that increased wealth reduces mortality, which if the birth rate does not also decline--leads to an increase in population." Hunter and gatherer groups, because of the necessity to exist within the capacity of ecosystems, employed population controls such as sexual continence, polyandry, abortion, and infanticide. Shoshones found it necessary in the pre-contact era to incorporate these measures to

---

29 Ibid.

30 However, with the coming of American emigrants in the 1840s, the Shoshones no longer enjoyed a buffer against disease. Reports of sporadic epidemics became more frequent in the next decades. For examples near Cache Valley see Madsen, Shoshoni Frontier, 12-13 and "The Northwestern Shoshoni," 36-37.

ensure survival.\textsuperscript{32}

The increased wealth brought by the fur trade allowed Cache Valley Shoshones to make several adaptations in their culture. Shoshones began to tap traditional resources with increased efficiency and larger profits. Firearms allowed them to hunt larger mammals from further distances with increased safety. Shoshones quickly recognized the demand introduced by traders for Cache valley's relatively untapped resources --namely beaver--and began processing pelts.

The expansion of available resources instituted different social behaviors that reflected the increased wealth. Russell asserted that "a plurality of wives is very common among the Snakes" in the 1830s. Ross wrote of the many wives of a Shoshone chief named "Ama-ketsa." In the eighteenth century, the Shoshone marital pattern of polyandry--in which many husbands had sexual intercourse with one wife--reflected the need to control their population. The shift to the practice of polygyny --in which one husband had sexual intercourse with many wives--suggests that Shoshones sought to expand their

In 1830, trapper Warren Angus Ferris and the company he trapped with encountered a Shoshone village of about 150 lodges on Bear River in Cache Valley. He mentioned that "crowds of dirty naked children followed us from lodge to lodge . . . ." This observation contrasted sharply with reports from explorers, such as Ogden who travelled through Shoshone country five years earlier. Ogden reported that "few children are to be seen among them."

Other effects of the Shoshone/European-American relationship during the fur trade years contributed to increased Shoshone populations. As a result of British and American efforts to promote peace between warring native factions in the Rockies, intertribal conflicts

---


34 Ferris, Life in the Rocky Mountains, 125.

35 David E. Miller, "Peter Skene Ogden Discovered Indians," in Charles Redd Monographs in Western History: Number 3, Essays on the American West, 1972-1973, ed. Thomas G. Alexander (Provo: Brigham Young University Press, 1974), 153. In a related study of the Comanches of the southern plains—relatives of the Shoshones—historian Dan Flores concluded that the addition of the horse increased the wealth of the people. This wealth allowed the Comanches to give up their previous practices of population controls (similar to Shoshone methods) and use both polygyny and adoption of captives to raise the population. Flores, "Bison Ecology and Bison Diplomacy," 471.
appeared to decline. While fur traders sought economic stability from their peace negotiations, Shoshones reaped the benefits of fewer losses of life to other hostile native peoples.\textsuperscript{36}

Shoshones also profited from alliances with traders. At the Bear Lake rendezvous of 1827, Shoshones received help from William Sublette, five of Sublette's men, and some Utes when attacked by Blackfeet. Ogden and Kittson recorded several instances of Shoshones travelling and camping with them for safety. By the same token, whites travelling in small parties welcomed a chance to join a Shoshone group if the latter extended an invitation. Jedediah Smith, en route to the Bear Lake rendezvous, joined a "band of Snakes" also on the way to the trade fair. Both trappers and Shoshones sought relative safety

\textsuperscript{36}For an example of one of these early treaties see: Ross, \textit{Fur Hunters of the Far West}, 169. Treaty promotion proved problematical because the native groups of the region possessed different cultural methods of dealing with inter-tribal relations. Native leaders functioned in a manner foreign to European-American leaders. Band allegiance among Shoshones during the fur trade era remained "very transient." People moved freely to different bands, loyalty to specific leaders changed frequently, and the powers of leaders remained restricted to control over hunting, subsistence activities, war, and negotiations with whites. The enforcement powers of Shoshone leaders after such negotiations were limited to the individual prestige and influence of each man. However, American trappers did negotiate a peace treaty between the Shoshones and Utes "with lasting benefits." Liljeblad, \textit{Idaho Indians}, 17; Morgan, \textit{The West of William H. Ashley}, 168.
In numbers. 37

In addition to strategic alliances and fur pelts, Cache Valley Shoshone bands offered—for a price—services and food and survival techniques to the trappers who entered their territory. Many of these offerings proved crucial to the success of the trade if not to the lives of the traders. Information regarding geography, resources, and the whereabouts of fur trade competitors allowed traders to plot strategy, find rich trapping grounds, and outwit other fur companies. Fur trade journals provide numerous references to Shoshone assistance of this nature. During winter camp of 1828, Ogden received "five snakes" from Bear River. While Ogden questioned these Shoshones, he learned that "the snow in that quarter [was] deeper than here," and that his American competitors were "in three different places starving, [because there was] no buffalo in that quarter this year and [they] were reduced to eat their horses and dogs." 38


38 Williams, Ogden's Snake Country Journal, 53-54; for other examples of this relationship see: Miller, "Ogden's Journal," 171; and Miller, "Ogden Discovered Indians,"
The European-American mode of production, which required trappers to live in the mountains year round, created the logistical problem of feeding large groups of trappers removed from convenient lines of communication. George Simpson, Hudson Bay Company's head of operations in North America, expressed his desire that the Snake brigades live "off the land." To accomplish this, white traders adopted Shoshone subsistence techniques of constantly moving camp to areas where game and grass appeared abundant. Whites also utilized Shoshone food sources or "country provisions" such as dried meats, pemmican, and other native foods. Ross told his readers not to "be surprised" that the trappers acquired a taste for Shoshone food because his men "live almost as the Indians, eating everything at times that can be eaten. Some from choice, others from necessity."

The trade for foodstuffs underscored the importance of Shoshone trade in general. With few convenient navigable rivers in the central Rockies, trappers relied on horses to pack men, equipment, supplies, and furs. Consequently, fur parties created a demand for horses. For the equestrian Shoshones, the European-American need

158; Ferris, Life in the Rocky Mountains, 133.

39 Miller, "Ogden's Journal," 161

40 Ross, Fur Hunters of the Far West, 171, 180.
for horses provided an important bargaining chip in trade
relations. Many references from trappers referred to the
merely trinkets needed to part Shoshones from their furs
and horses. These references reveal a cultural gap and
trapper ethnocentrism. The traders from both cultures
placed their own value on items of trade. Ross recorded
an account of trade with "Pee-eye-em," stating that

\[\ldots\) it was truly Indian-like to see these
people dispose of articles of real value so
cheap while the articles of comparatively no
value at all, at least in the estimation of the
whites were esteemed highly by them. When any
of our people through mere curiosity wished to
purchase an Indian headdress composed of
feathers, or a necklace of bear's claws or a
little red earth or ochre out of any of their
mystical medicine bags, the price was enormous.
But a beaver skin worth twenty-five shillings
in the English market might have been purchased
for a brass finger ring scarcely worth a
farthing. A dozen of the same rings was
refused for a necklace of bird claws not worth
half a farthing.

Perhaps, had Shoshones left a record of this occasion,
they might have expressed sentiments similar to those of
Ross. They might have thought that "it was truly white-
like" to pay so much for abundant furs that could be
readily acquired in Shoshone lands.\[^{41}\]

\[^{41}\) Ibid., 171-72.\]
to pelts caught by white trappers. Other trappers purchased buffalo robes for the winter months. Ogden's journals offered two examples. While Ogden was in Cache Valley in 1825, a Shoshone camp "of 4 lodges" joined his brigade. When a freeman traded "nearly 60 skins in goods" for a horse, an "enormous price" by Kittson's estimation, Ogden wrote that "these poor Snakes understand trade . . . ." A few years later Ogden desperately needed horses. Near present Bancroft, Idaho, Shoshones traded him two horses "at an extravagant rate." Ross wrote that although in the first few years of exposure to white trade the Shoshones seemed to make bad bargains, "they soon learned the mystery of the trade, and their own interest." 

During the winter of 1840, Russell stayed with some Cache Valley Shoshones for several days. He mentioned that the Indians possessed "considerable number of Beaver Skins," but Russell had nothing to trade. They requested that he go to Fort Hall (near present Pocatello, Idaho) to get some goods and then return to spend the winter

---

42 Williams, Ogden's Snake Country Journal, 124.
43 Ewers, Adventures of Zenas Leonard, 49.
45 Williams, Ogden's Snake Country Journal, 127; Ross, Fur Hunters of the Far West, 171.
with them. For Russell, a winter spent with Shoshones in Cache Valley meant, in addition to trade, companionship, shelter, food, and protection. For the Shoshones it afforded an opportunity to extend hospitality, make a connection to the white world, and enjoy the conversation of a mountain man, in addition to the trade Russell offered. Clearly, trade went beyond economics to act as a social bridge between the two cultures. As each group sought gain, they built bonds of friendship and commerce. 46

Trade provided more than an exchange of goods. It was the mechanism that brought cultures together in Cache Valley. The friendships, albeit sometimes fragile, made between the two dominant cultures in the Rockies during the fur trade era were initially built from the foundation of the common goals of each group that could be reached through trade.

In The Middle Ground, Richard White argued that traders "needed Indians as allies, as partners in exchange, as sexual partners, as friendly neighbors." In these exchanges a common or "middle ground" formed. 47 Certainly, similar connections formed in the Rocky

Mountains. Irving's rendition of Captain Bonneville's journal stated that "the Shoshone beauties became objects of rivalry among some of the amorous mountaineers . . . ." While traditional literature typically depicts Indian women as mere sexual distractions within the Rocky Mountain fur trade, recent research suggests that Shoshone women filled a more critical function in the creation of Shoshone-white alliances. In addition to the crucial labors Shoshone women performed to process furs and skins for the fur trade, the alliances made when they married opened the door to trade for the band with the trapper bridegroom.

Friendships that developed between Shoshones and trappers often settled matters of life and death for trappers. Ross recounted the story of a trapper, named Hodgens, who lost his way in the snow while hunting. After two weeks, he crawled into a Shoshone camp where he recognized the tent of the chief. The chief nourished him back to health and supplied a horse, provisions, and his own son as a guide back to the whites. According to

48 Irving, Captain Bonneville, 156.

Ross, "Ama-ketsa's friendly conduct . . . was strong proof of that chief's good will towards our people." Ross might have underestimated the chief's motives. The "good will" he spoke of kept this band of Shoshones allied to white trade, technology, and influence. Ama-ketsa probably knew that his favor meant that the trappers owed him one.  

The story of Horn Chief, "a distinguished chief and warrior," demonstrates the complexity of the Shoshone/European American interaction that developed in the Cache Valley region. Ferris told of a Shoshone plot to massacre his party encampment on the Bear River "solely for the purpose of possessing themselves of our arms and baggage." The Shoshones resolved to enter the camp by professing friendship and then mounting a surprise attack. As Ferris told it,

... when they had collected to more than thrice our number, the Horn Chief Suddenly appeared in the centre of our camp, mounted on a noble horse and fully equipped for war. His head was surmounted by a curious cap or crown, made of the stuffed skin of an antelope's head, with the ears and horns still attached, which gave him a bold, commanding, and somewhat ferocious appearance . . . . he commenced a loud and threatening harangue to his people . . . which we inferred from his looks, . . . boded them no good, and this opinion was strengthened by their sneaking off one by one.

Some months later, Ferris and his companions learned of

---

50 Ross, Fur Hunters of the Far West, 174.
the nature of this incident. Horn Chief "dared them [his band members] to fire a gun," and so shamed them with insults to their cowardice, that they skulked away without carrying out their plot.\textsuperscript{51}

While the alliances between the Shoshones and trappers thus far enumerated seemed to demonstrate at least superficial cooperation between cultures, such was not always the case. As Shoshones prospered, they increased their excursions onto the Great Plains and took on more of the Plains culture. Military prowess, as a source of prestige, power, and upward mobility, ranked as crucial among the cultural attributes on the plains. Raiding centered on plunder rather than the conquest of new territories. Marauding gained acceptance among Shoshones as an appendage to peaceful trading and as a legitimate means to increase wealth.\textsuperscript{52}

Ogden wrote of the Shoshone tendency, "when they find themselves superior in numbers," to "have recourse to most violent means to obtain their ends . . . ."\textsuperscript{53}

Ogden and Ferris wrote about an ambush on Etienne Provost's brigade near Salt Lake. The Shoshones, led by Bad Gocha (bad left-handed one), invited the trappers to

\textsuperscript{51}Ferris, \textit{Life in the Rocky Mountains}, 143-45.

\textsuperscript{52}Liljeblad, \textit{Idaho Indians}, 15.

trade and smoke the peace pipe. However, Bad Gocha claimed that his "medicine" could not allow the smoking of the calumet near any metallic objects. When the trappers disarmed themselves, the Shoshones fell upon them. Only a few trappers escaped.54

The threat of violence forced trappers to keep a constant watch, in spite of their "alliances" with Shoshone groups. Ogden, like other brigade leaders, implemented strict regimens of security procedures, a nod to the uncertainty of the alliances. The trappers "overlook[ed] many serious offenses rather than expose small trapping parties to the vindictive attacks that would characterize an open war."55

In addition to the Shoshone threat, fur traders also worried about market forces. By 1830, intense competition among fur trade companies spawned commercial wars that artificially raised the price traders paid for furs to nine dollars a pound for beaver, up from three dollars in 1825.56 These price wars affected the rate of

54Ibid., 49; Ferris, Life in the Rocky Mountains, 385.

55Miller, "Ogden Discovered Indians," 144; Ferris, Life in the Rocky Mountains, 386.

56John Jacob Astor's American Fur Company, that instructed its men to "écraser toute opposition" or eliminate all competition, had an enormous impact on the fur market. Since Astor operated at a loss for an "extended period," his entry into the mountains made
resource extraction and the number of people engaged in the beaver trade. As the price paid for fur rose, more men entered the trade, and beaver populations faltered. Clearly, the destruction of the resource base relates to the folly exemplified in biologist Garrett Hardin's "The Tragedy of the Commons." As a result of unrestricted international competition, beaver populations faced destruction as the "inevitable fate of resources . . . shared in common by competing users." So too did other resources, such as game and fodder, critical to Shoshone subsistence. 57

In the waning years of the 1830s, the market for beaver softened. The price of beaver fell to two dollars a pound by 1840, while supplies and operation expenses goods cheaper and wages higher as other traders tried to match his prices. Wishart, The Fur Trade of the American West, 146, 150; Morgan, Jedediah Smith, 172; DeVoto, Across the Wide Missouri, 71.

57 Hardin's tale concerned a group of competing farmers grazing cattle on a common pasture. What was tragic was that each farmer found it more profitable to graze more cows than the pasture could support in the long run because each took all the profit from her extra cows but bore her pro rata share of the cost of destroying the pasture. Economic rationality thus drove the farmers to the irrational result of ruining their pasture and ultimately their own livelihoods; quoted from Arthur F. McEvoy, "Toward an Interactive Theory of Nature and Culture: Ecology, Production, and Cognition in the California Fishing Industry," in The Ends of the Earth: Perspectives on Modern Environmental History, ed. Donald Worster (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 213-14; Garrett Hardin, "The Tragedy of the Commons," Science 162 (December 1968): 1,243-8.
rose. Trapping focus shifted to the northern Rockies, one of the few remaining untapped regions. More trappers retreated from the mountains in 1840 than any other period.\(^\text{58}\) For Shoshones of Cache Valley, the demise of the fur trade forced this adaptive society to look for new ways to survive. The environmental legacy of the fur trade played an important role in the choices Shoshones made as they coped with drastic change in the economic system they had grown dependent on for much of their subsistence.

The initial environmental impact of the fur industry in Cache Valley touched the riparian habitat. Sluggish tributaries to the Bear River criss-crossed Cache Valley. Along streams such as the Cub, Logan, Little Bear, and Blacksmith Fork, beaver dams regulated the flow of run-off and sediment deposition.\(^\text{59}\) An accurate assessment of these habitats in 1840 remains sketchy as no scientific assessments occurred until 1842, when Frémont surveyed


\(^{59}\) Merchant states that "engineering skills made beavers important molders of natural habitats. Their dams across upland streams transformed the topography. Capturing and holding water, soil, and sediment from nearby hillsides, beaver ponds raised the temperature of the cold rushing waters, producing plankton and aquatic insects favored by fish. Ranging from a few square feet to hundreds of acres in area, the ponds became diverse habitats for a variety of fish, birds, and plants." Merchant, *Ecological Revolutions*, 37.
the valley as part of his governmental exploration of the Great Basin. Since the majority of trappers moved on to the Blackfoot territories of the northern Rockies around 1835, the relative pressure on beaver populations diminished and gave them a chance to rebound in the Cache Valley region. This suggests that although the fur trade damaged riparian habitats, it did not permanently destroy this crucial aspect of the ecosystem.

Small and big game populations in Cache Valley suffered more long-term effects than beaver from the impact of the fur trade. Pressures on these animals did not subside when the trappers left because demand for food did not decrease with the price of beaver. Indeed, game animals emerged as a more accessible food source to the armed Cache Valley Shoshones. The fur industry increased pressure on game populations. This drove game from the valley to the mountains, making this food source less accessible to Shoshone hunters. In the spring of 1835, Russell accompanied one of Wyeth's brigades to Cache Valley. He wrote that "this place being entirely destitute of game we had to live chiefly upon roots for ten days." They finally found two grizzly bears and filled the "Camp Kettles." In December 1840, Russell wintered in Cache Valley with a Shoshone band. He

climbed high into the surrounding mountains to hunt mountain sheep, most likely, because no game could be had in the valley.  

Perhaps most significant, Cache Valley Shoshones faced the prospects of severely diminished buffalo herds in the region. In 1825, Ogden had travelled "over a fine Plain [near present Lewiston, Utah] Covered with Buffaloes . . ." in Cache Valley. But by 1840, buffalo no longer roamed the west side of the Rockies in significant numbers. In part, large horse herds kept by Shoshones and trappers contributed to the demise of buffalo in Cache Valley. Because "horses have a 80% dietary overlap with bovines, and perhaps more critically similar water requirements," this must have adversely affected the carrying capacity of the Cache Valley ecosystem. When Shoshones and/or trappers stayed in the valley, they generally did so en masse. With hundreds of people and horses in a camp, food supplies quickly diminished. This necessitated an increase in the frequency of campsite movements to areas of fresh fodder and game. The constant pressure on game and the grass

---

61 Ibid., 112-13.
63 Madsen, Chief Pocatello, 26.
64 Flores, "Bison Ecology and Bison Diplomacy," 481.
that game fed on devastated the region's bison herds.

The immediate environmental legacy in Cache Valley, at first glance, would appear to be devastation to the riparian habitats' flora and fauna, small game driven from the valley, buffalo no longer found in significant numbers in the region, and valley grasses constantly "mowed" by native and white nomadic parties. This does not seem to be a devastating environmental assessment. Beaver populations probably made a comeback sometime in the mid 1840s. In the fall of 1840, Russell claimed that the "growth of grass [in Cache Valley] was the best I ever saw at this season of the year." The game driven to the mountains could possibly have made a comeback similar to the beaver, given a few years of reprieve from over-hunting.

Viewed in this light, the European-American mode of production, whose halcyon days in the Cache Valley region lasted a little more than a decade, did not inflict permanent damage to the fragile ecosystem of the valley, with the obvious exception of the buffalo population. Yet, Cache Valley Shoshones felt a socioeconomic legacy of the fur trade in their altered relationship to the environment. A full examination of the fur trade's environmental impact should consider the effects of the

---

introduction of a market economy to the Shoshones, and their cultural adaptation.

In making the change from foot to horses provided by whites more than a century earlier, Shoshones did not "cease to be Indian." Similarly, further changes brought by trappers were incorporated into a continually adapting Cache Valley Shoshone group. Their basic culture remained intact, but they developed new and "very different relationships to the ecosystems in which they lived." Shoshones ceased to be dependent on one or two ecosystems for subsistence. Instead, they grew accustomed, through the European-American influence in the valley, to the biosphere networks of the world.

Population increases and the Shoshone evolution toward larger band size account for the difficulties Cache Valley Shoshones faced in reverting to life as usual ante-fur trade. The fur trade altered Shoshone "population control mechanisms," thereby fomenting

---

66 Cronon, Changes in the Land, 163-64.

67 Free trappers "were biosphere people." They did not depend on a single ecosystem for survival, but derived instead, through the annual or bi-annual rendezvous, support from many areas. Raymond F. Dasmann, "Towards a Biosphere Consciousness," in The Ends of the Earth: Perspectives on Modern Environmental History, ed. Donald Worster (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 277-79; also Flores, "Bison Ecology and Bison Diplomacy," 476;
"potential ecological crises due to overpopulation." The increase in relative Shoshone wealth attributable to the fur trade era probably raised their populations to a crisis point. Shoshones did not possess cultural understanding of the volatile nature inherent to European-American economics. Furthermore, their "religious conception of the infinity of nature's abundance" further complicated their comprehension of the boom and bust cycles of American capitalism.

The size of Shoshone bands increased from what anthropologist Elman Service termed "Patri-local bands" (these were pre-contact groups), which consisted of thirty to one hundred people, to the size that Russell found on the Bear River, of three to four hundred lodges with four to five people per lodge. Hunting buffalo evolved from a "source of unknown wealth" at the beginning of the fur trade, to a necessity for large Shoshone bands to insure survival. This meant that Shoshones, already accustomed to traveling long distances, seasonally migrated even further from their Cache Valley base. This required further changes to their subsistence cycles. It also suggests that the

---

68 See Hoffman's discussion concerning prehistoric and contemporary hunter-gatherer groups in "Prehistoric Ecological Crises," 35.

increased importance of trans-Montane Shoshone buffalo hunts, which continued until after the establishment of reservations, contributed to the demise of buffalo on the Great Plains. 70

Another important consideration of the effects of the fur trade on Cache Valley Shoshones concerns the "new" generation raised during this era. It follows that these Shoshones, a whole generation that came of age during this era, learned a new way of living that incorporated influences of white technology and culture. As a result, the new generation acclimated itself to a different standard of wealth from that of its parents. A mounted warrior class, already in the process of development through contact with plains Indian culture, further enhanced its prowess with firearms and wealth that freed it from mere subsistence and allowed an increase in numbers. The warrior culture facilitated a natural shift from hunting and gathering to depredation of white travelers. 71

Shoshone women of the fur generation also


experienced an unconventional upbringing. The fur trade engendered a shift from subsistence gathering to a labor intensive production of robes, furs, and skins. This activity came at the expense of traditional female labor patterns of food gathering and processing, and suggests that the wealth and power gained from the fur trade allowed Shoshones to acquire food through trade or through plunder.\textsuperscript{72}

By the winter of 1842, the measures adopted by Cache Valley Shoshones to cope with the end of the fur trade demonstrated signs of failure. Russell wrote that a principal chief, possibly Pee-Eye-Em (whom Russell thought had lost prestige), the chief of the Shoshones encountered by Ogden in Cache Valley in 1825, "died in an appoplectic fit."\textsuperscript{73} His brother died the next year. Russell recounted that "immediately after the death of the latter the tribe scattered in smaller villages over the country in consequence of having no chief who could control and keep them together."\textsuperscript{74} Shoshones then seemed to lose their "warlike spirit" and fell "into degradation."\textsuperscript{75} Possibly, this stemmed from the initial

\textsuperscript{72}Ferris, Life in the Rocky Mountains, 125.

\textsuperscript{73}Russell, Journal of a Trapper, 115, 145.

\textsuperscript{74}Ibid., 145.

\textsuperscript{75}Ibid.
problems they faced as they adapted to the post fur trade era. Their lack of faith in a leader to help them secure food caused them to split into smaller, traditional groups. This split marked the beginning of a period of retrenchment that occurred in the interim between the fur trade and settlement eras. The decline of warrior-like tendencies could have resulted from a sense of insecurity Shoshones associated with smaller groups, coupled with a lack of ammunition, wealth, and a hunger pang that forced them to devote increased energy to survival.

In August of 1842, Frémont encountered a "large" mounted Shoshone band in Cache Valley. He described them as "poor and hungry," subsisting on "yampah, tobacco root, and a large root of a species of thistle."

Clearly, Shoshones in the Cache Valley region felt the depression of the fur trade. Frémont's observation suggests further evidence of a return to more traditional subsistence cycles. While these traditional patterns had at one time been sufficient to provide subsistence for Shoshones of Cache Valley during the ante-fur trade era, the increased population and dependence on white goods and technology, coupled with debased subsistence resources, left them in a desperate situation.76

Cache Valley Shoshones, initially cautious during

the first encounters with European Americans, seized opportunities that the fur trade offered. They quickly acquired firearms and incorporated them into their subsistence patterns. The increased efficiency provided by these weapons allowed them to devote more energy to the production of furs. The European-American demand for processed Shoshone pelts and horses allowed these shrewd bargainers to significantly increase their wealth, prestige, and power. This prosperity altered Shoshone society by allowing for an increase in population, and encouraging the further adoption of the Great Plains warrior culture. These factors coupled with strategic alliances made with European-American trappers helped the Cache Valley Shoshones, and their relations, reemerge as a dominant cultural group on the Great Plains.

This golden era for the Cache Valley Shoshones lasted only as long as the fur trade remained strong in the Central Rocky Mountains. The fall of the fur trade caused trappers to move on to other vocations. The remainder of the fur trade supply network shifted to facilitating the movement of settlers to the Oregon and California territories. This shift forced Shoshones to respond to the boom and bust elements of capitalism. The initial power and progress that trade brought to Cache Valley Shoshones suddenly left them with inflated numbers
in an ecosystem that had been taxed to its limits many times over. Cache Valley Shoshones still had their land to fall back on, but their larger numbers made traditional subsistence patterns difficult. Additionally, an entire generation grew to maturity in an era of relative wealth and abundance, coupled with a dependence on white technology. Adaptation to life in the post fur trade era allowed these Shoshones to carve out a hungry existence until the Mormons moved their cattle into Cache Valley in 1855. This marked the beginning of a new relationship with whites, the introduction of a different mode of production—which forced Cache Valley Shoshones off their traditional lands—and new opportunities for further adaptation in Shoshone subsistence patterns and culture.\textsuperscript{77}

CHAPTER III

DRIVEN FROM THE GARDEN

As darkness fell upon the camp a large fire was seen at a distance and a voice was heard to say, "If there are any more survivors, come over to my campfire and get dry and warm. The Indians that were able to walk hurriedly went to the raging fire."

In the late 1850s and early 1860s, traffic increased along trails that crossed Shoshone territory in the Great Basin. This activity provided opportunities for Shoshones to replace traditional food sources lost because of the increased presence of European Americans, with new food sources that the intruders brought to Shoshone lands. As it became necessary for Shoshones to resort increasingly to violent measures to obtain food, concern for the lives and property of Americans prompted the government to bring troops to Utah Territory from California. When violence along the road from Cache Valley to the mines of Montana erupted again in January 1863, Colonel Patrick E. Connor decided to take action.²

¹This quotation is taken from Shoshone Oral history of the Battle of Bear River. Parry, "Massacre at Boa Ogoi," 236.
  ²See Madsen, Shoshoni Frontier, 177-200.
During the early morning light of 29 January 1863, Connor and his California Volunteers violently served an arrest warrant for Cache Valley Shoshone chiefs Bear Hunter, Sagwitch, and Sanpitch near the Cache Valley town of Franklin, Washington Territory. The troops had marched in the bitter cold a few days earlier from Salt Lake City under the cover of darkness. Connor ordered some of his men to cross Bear River prior to the attack to surround his quarry. Without warning, Connor's men attacked the Shoshone encampment of around 450 men, women, and children. At first the Shoshones held their ground, but a flanking movement by Connor's men scattered them.3

The Shoshones lost an estimated 250 lives.4

3Chief Justice John F. Kinney of Utah Territory issued the arrest warrant for a series of deaths occurring on the Cache Valley road to the Montana mines. Madsen, Chief Pocatello, 54; see also Madsen, Shoshoni Frontier, 178-91; Edward W. Tullidge, Tullidge's Histories, Containing the History of All the Northern, Eastern, and Western Counties of Utah; Also the Counties of Southern Idaho v. II (Salt Lake City: Juvenile Instructor Press, 1889), 367-68; for official correspondence of the Superintendency of Indian Affairs and the Territory of Utah Indian Agents leading up to the Battle of Bear River see Dale E. Morgan, ed., "Washakie and the Shoshoni: A Selection of Documents from the Records of the Utah Superintendency of Indian Affairs," Annals of Wyoming 28 (October 1956): 82-91; for Colonel Connor's official report of the Battle of Bear River see U.S. Congress, House, The War of the Rebellion v. L, part I, p. 185-87.

4Madsen, Shoshoni Frontier, 200.
According to Shoshone oral historian Mae T. Parry, "The Indians were being slaughtered like wild rabbits . . . . Shoshones were jumping into the river and trying to escape. The massacre . . . lasted all day."\(^5\) The Shoshone survivors, cold and wounded, gathered in the evening around a campfire to regroup.

This bloody episode signaled the beginning of the end of a nearly three decade long struggle by the Shoshones to protect their lands, subsistence, culture, and autonomy from the encroachment of overlanders, Mormon settlers, miners, the United States Army, and government bureaucrats. By the year of the Bear River action, Cache Valley Shoshones found themselves outcasts from much of their traditional territory. However, according to Indian superintendent James Doty, their Bear River camp on the day of the engagement with Connor "was filled with provisions, bacon, sugar, coffee, and various other articles."\(^6\) Clearly, Cache Valley Shoshones continued to make adjustments to their subsistence patterns. These

---

\(^5\) Parry, "Massacre at Boa Ogoi," 233-34.

\(^6\) James Duane Doty, Indian Superintendent, to William P. Dole, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 16 February 1863, National Archives Microfilm Publications, Microcopy no. 234, Letters Received by the Office of Indian Affairs 1824-81, Roll 901, Washington, DC, 1957, Utah Superintendency, 1849-1880, Utah Reel, 83 Pt. 5, 1863-1865, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT.
innovations allowed them to remain autonomous until the 1870s.

This chapter examines the strategies used by Cache Valley Shoshones to adjust to altered subsistence opportunities during the era of dispossession from their traditional homeland. The social interaction between Mormon and Shoshone cultures--tempered by complex perceptions held by Mormons--contributed to both the problems and solutions of the subsistence crisis. Although dispossessed of their land by the 1860s, Cache Valley Shoshones actively resisted removal, attempted to maintain cultural and political autonomy, and clung tenaciously to their migratory subsistence patterns. Indeed, the Cache Valley Shoshones continually demonstrated a determination to survive and hold to their traditional ways.

During the interim years between the demise of the fur trade in the late 1830s and the arrival of Mormon settlers in Salt Lake Valley in 1847, the Cache Valley Shoshones infrequently encountered European Americans. These contacts generally occurred with overlanders such as the Bartleson-Bidwell wagon train, and a trickle of other settlers passing just north of Cache Valley. In 1847, the Mormons arrived in Salt Lake Valley and began to establish communities. The spread of Mormon
settlements marked the beginning of a new era of change for the Cache Valley Shoshones. For the next twenty years, continual waves of people—argonauts, overlanders, and especially Mormon settlers—eroded the dwindling resource base and homeland of the Shoshones, and led to a deterioration of Indian/white relations. 7

Although, in 1856, Peter Maughan led the first Mormons settlers into fertile Cache Valley, subsequent attempts at settlement became necessary to gain a foothold in this Shoshone territory. 8 By 1860, Mormon settlers, while forcing the Shoshones from the southern end of the valley up to present Franklin, Idaho, found themselves acting on the defensive to maintain a tenuous

7John C. Frémont's government exploration of the Great Basin was a notable exception to this. Frémont mapped and assessed the Great Basin for future exploitation. His contact with the Shoshones in Cache Valley resembled the trading relationship that existed between fur traders and Indians in the fur trade era. See U. S. Congress, House, Report of the Exploring Expedition, 134-35, 140, 143; Young did send an exploring party into Cache Valley in 1847, and although "they spoke glowingly" of the valley's potential, the Mormons did not attempt to make use of its resources until 1855, Hovey, "Before Settlement," 28-29; in addition to the deterioration of the resource base, the settlers brought diseases which further weakened the Shoshones in the Great Basin. Mormon settler David Moore "reported, in 1850, that the Northwestern Shoshoni along the Weber River were dying of measles . . . ." Madsen, Shoshoni Frontier, 12-13.

8Kate B. Carter, compiler, "Journal Of Mary Ann Weston Maughan," TMs, D265, no. 203, p. 383, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT.
control of Cache Valley. Meanwhile, Cache Valley Shoshones found themselves in dire straits. Their ability to continue their traditional hunting-gathering subsistence in a shrinking homeland limited, the Shoshones initiated new strategies for survival. They apparently viewed the settlers as a new source of subsistence for they incorporated what the settlers called "thieving," "stealing," "begging," "depredation," and "tribute" from settlers, tithing houses, grain fields, and Indian superintendents, into traditional subsistence and migratory patterns. ⁹

This "tax" on Mormons who occupied Indian lands—the federal government did not extinguish Indian title to Utah territorial lands until 30 July 1863—became a burden in the eyes of the settlers and fomented hostile relations with the Shoshones. Uneven policies, poorly informed policy makers, and eastern politicians

---

⁹In 1855, the Mormons drove cattle herds into Cache Valley to take advantage of the grass resources. The severe winter that year killed much of the herd. Despite the losses, the Elkhorn Ranch stayed in operation. The following year, Maughan led his small contingent of settlers and founded Maughan's Fort. However, Maughan's company was recalled in 1857 because of the Utah War. In 1859, Maughan returned, and led a successful migration into Cache Valley. By 1860, six settlements had been founded. Hovey, "Before Settlement," 28-43; for a personal account of the Elkhorn Ranch see John Clark Dowdle's Journal, 1844-1908, Tms, 979.2, R426, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT.
preoccupied with the Civil War help explain the treatment of the Cache Valley Shoshones. In light of these factors, the results seem less than surprising.

The culminating influence of these different forces occurred at the engagement between Connor and the Shoshones at Bear River 29 January 1863. According to Shoshone oral history, during the evening that followed the day of bloodletting, a voice in the dark could be heard urging survivors to gather around a fire to "get dry and warm." The pathos of that scene as the injured and exhausted remnants of a nearly defeated people gathered to console and help one another must have been overwhelming. Perhaps, as the shock began to wear off, the Shoshone men and women took stock of the events that led to the carnage of that day and contemplated the wisest future course to chart for their people.

Sagwitch, wounded in the hand, and some of his warriors joined a Northwestern Shoshone band led by Pocatello in nearby Malad Valley. Others regrouped and sought to exact a measure of revenge. In Cache Valley, the violence continued, in spite of the Treaty of Box Elder, 30 June 1863, which granted government annuities of $5,000 per year to the Northwestern Shoshones. While this treaty provided the basis for Pocatello's claims for

---

10 Parry, "Massacre at Boa Ogoi," 236.
a reservation, realized in 1869, it did little to alleviate the immediate problems of hunger as annuity payments rarely arrived on time, if at all. The Cache Valley Shoshones found themselves unwelcome in the land of their ancestors and scrambling to scrape out an existence.  

During 1868, the government set aside land near Fort Hall on the confluence of the Port Neuf and Snake Rivers for the Shoshones and Bannocks of Idaho. This became a haven—although by no means a safe and secure one—for many Cache Valley Shoshones. Others camped and "begged" around the railroad town of Corinne northwest of Brigham City. 

11 Madsen, Chief Pocatello, 55; Madsen, Shoshoni Frontier, 201; Kappler, Indian Affairs. 2: 850-51; see also the Treaty with the Eastern Shoshoni, ibid., 848-50; the Indian agents in Utah constantly complained about late or non-existent annuity payments, for examples of this see James Duane Doty, Governor and late Commissioner, to O. H. Irish, Superintendent of Indian Affairs, in Dale E. Morgan, ed., "Washakie and the Shoshoni: A Selection of Documents from the Records of the Utah Superintendency of Indian Affairs," Annals of Wyoming 29 (October 1957): 196, O. H. Irish, Superintendent of Indian Affairs, to D. N. Cooley, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 9 September 1865, in ibid., 211, and F. H. Head, Superintendent of Indian Affairs, to E. S. Parker, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 29 April 1869, in Dale E. Morgan, ed., "Washakie and the Shoshoni: A Selection of Documents from the Records of the Utah Superintendency of Indian Affairs," Annals of Wyoming 30 (April 1958): 87-88.

12 See the Treaty of Ft. Bridger, 1868, Kappler, Indian Affairs, 1020-24; Madsen, Northern Shoshoni, 90.
Corinne, the "gentile city," underscored another important shift in the relationship between Shoshones and European Americans in the post fur trade years. Settlements, in addition to dispossessing Shoshones of their lands, also provided a means of distributing large amounts of alcohol. The combination of losing their land and the availability of liquor eventually contributed to the demoralization and capitulation of the Shoshones. Corinne, unlike Mormon communities, did not use social pressure to limit the presence of alcohol. To be sure, Mormon settlements in Cache Valley and the surrounding region had problems with alcohol, but the availability was greater in non-Mormon areas.¹³

To help combat problems of alcohol abuse and hunger in the early 1870s, the Mormons established a farm near present Franklin, Idaho, for the Shoshones. The Shoshones, baptized by Mormon missionaries, abandoned the farm, possibly because its nearness to the battle site of 1863, an outbreak of smallpox in the area a few years earlier, and bad farming conditions combined to create a bad impression of the area in their minds. They wintered

¹³Madsen, Northern Shoshoni, 92; Mary Ann Weston Maughan stated that during 1864, some Shoshones "got drunk" in Franklin. In addition to trampling gardens and crops, one of the Shoshones "tried to ride his horse over a woman and beat her with a club." Carter, "Journal of Mary Ann Weston Maughan, 389.
in the Promontory Mountains north of Great Salt Lake. A year later, Shoshones made another attempt to farm—this time at Bear River City, Utah. The citizens of nearby Corinne did not appreciate the nearness of this farm and drove the Shoshone farmers off. Finally, at Washakie Town just west of Cache Valley, the Mormons founded a permanent church farm for the Shoshones. However, Washakie Town could furnish an existence for only a small number of Shoshones, forcing many to go to Fort Hall. Few Shoshones remained in Cache Valley by the 1880s.14

Traditionally, historians have explained the Mormon response to the presence of Shoshones in simplistic terms. The most common interpretation suggested that Mormons felt it was cheaper "to feed the Indians than to fight them."15 However, this statement does not

14 Kenneth Dean Hunsaker, "Indian Town, Utah: A Pre-Washakie Settlement," unpublished paper, PAM C, 194, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT; Madsen, "The Northwestern Shoshonis," 37; By the mid-twentieth century, the Cache Valley Shoshones had either assimilated into the other bands of Shoshones at Fort Hall, or into the mainstream American society, as they lived isolated in Utah cities, worked in these communities, and attended public schools. Madsen, Northern Shoshoni, 90-105.

15 This maxim is repeated frequently in Mormon literature and history; see Brigham Young, Superintendent of Indian Affairs, to George W. Maypenny, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 30 June 1855, in Dale E. Morgan, ed., "Washakie and the Shoshoni: A Selection of Documents from the Utah Superintendency of Indian Affairs," Annals of Wyoming 26 (July 1954): 169; Madsen, "The Northwestern
adequately explain the complex relationship between Cache Valley Shoshones and Mormons. Shoshone/Mormon interaction occurred on various levels: the official level between major chiefs and Mormon general authorities, and locally between bishops and band leaders; the unofficial level between individual Shoshones and settlers; and the free-for-all level between raiding warriors or raiding settlers bent on plunder or revenge. Somewhere in between these levels were varying combinations or degrees of the above. Sometimes the mixture proved too volatile, at other times harmonious. Unfortunately for both Shoshones and Mormons, official policies did not always remedy situations that arose.

Madsen argued that Mormons, despite their benign philosophy, did not hesitate to abandon it for violence when the situation dictated.\(^{16}\) However, Madsen saw the interaction as generally benevolent and stated that although Mormons took Shoshone lands, their treatment of the Indians--attempts to pacify and assimilate, proselytize and baptize, and teach self-sufficiency through farming--"demonstrated that, with patience and

\(^{16}\)Madsen, *Shoshoni Frontier*, 155.
much help, an Indian group could learn to 'live like
white men.' This statement echoed the goals originally
presented in Brigham Young's plans to build a Zion on
Indian lands and convert the Indians in the process.
Yet, for the Cache Valley Shoshones, assimilation into
Zion would come at the cost of their traditional cultural
heritage. Mormon policy added to the death knell of the
Cache Valley Shoshone cultural existence because
destruction of aboriginal custom and assimilation fueled
its purpose.

Over twenty years prior to the forced removal of
Shoshones from Cache Valley, the Mormons--also driven
from their homes in Missouri--began to straggle into the
Great Basin. They brought with them definite notions
about the land and its inhabitants. These notions were
steeped in their theology, unique scriptures, and in the
psyche of church leaders. The complex nature of the
relationship between the Shoshones and their intruding
European-American neighbors was grounded in
preconceptions that settlers held concerning the land and
its native inhabitants.

In 1847, Heber C. Kimball delivered a fiery and
defiant sermon that revealed the determination of the
Mormons to take possession of "the promised land" in the

17 Madsen, The Northern Shoshoni, 106.
Great Basin. He rebelled against "the idea of paying the Indians for the lands, for if the Shoshones should thus be considered," other native groups would seek the same treatment. Indeed, Kimball maintained that "the land belongs to our father in heaven, and we calculate to plow and plant it."19

Cultivating the desert represented a challenge from God by which Mormons proved their worthiness to be called His children. The first settlers of Cache Valley constantly drew on biblical references and looked on Cache Valley as an "Eden."20 Of all the areas in the region, Brigham Young claimed that Cache Valley had more to offer the saints than any other.21 He also added a few warnings and admonitions that if the saints "are slack and neglectful of your duties, if you forsake your covenants and wander into darkness, the power of satan can reign here."22 Furthermore, the saints were to

---

18 The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Journal History, Reel 200, no. 8, p. 2, 1 August 1847, Archives and Special Collections, Utah State University, Merrill Library, Logan, UT.

19 Ibid.


21 Brigham Young, "Remarks by President Brigham Young," Deseret News 1 August 1860, 169.

22 Ibid.
conquer and subdue the frontier, "improve this valley," and "bring the silent wild into cultivation." All of this emerged as part of the overall Mormon purpose in the Great Basin: to "build up their 'Kingdom of Heaven.'"

Promises of wealth to those who worked hard and obeyed the council of church leaders acted as an incentive for those who served the Lord. In the Mormon newspaper, the Deseret News, reports from Cache Valley in 1859 and 1860 elaborated on the extensive farming land, abundance of water for irrigation and machinery, the excellent grazing lands, and the plentitude of timber for fuel and building. The newspaper also speculated on the future business to be contracted along the roads to the mines in Montana by stating that "should the people of Cache Valley wish to carry on trade" with those miners, "they are better suited than any others in Deseret." Furthermore, "those seeking homes there, . . . may soon

---


24Ricks, "First Settlements," 55.


26"From Cache County," Deseret News, 12 November 1862, p. 156.
become wealthy by proper industry and economy . . . ."27
"Proper industry" included paying a ten percent tithe on all profits and following the counsel of church leadership in all matters temporal and spiritual.

Among the temporal matters of settlement, an Indian policy emerged as a crucial consideration for the church leaders and their flock. Mormon religious views informed Mormon Indian policies. During the early years of Mormon settlement in the Great Basin, the fear of native hostility in the new settlements was reflected in Indian policy of the church leaders.

During 1850, Parley P. Pratt addressed the saints at a bi-annual gathering of the Mormon Church membership known as General Conference. He "compared their [the Indians] low situation with those who were cleanly and industrious."28 Mormon concepts of their innate racial superiority to the Indians became the means of reducing the Shoshones to inferiority. In 1853, Young stressed his lack of trust for Indians. This came at a time when the Mormon position in the Great Basin remained insecure. Young feared that the Shoshones would perceive this weakness and take advantage of it. According to Young, Indians represented a "seed of Israel" who had been given

---


a "curse" for turning against God.29 He was "suspicious" of the Indians for this, and "calculate[d] to carry with me proper weapons of defence."30 Any Indians that "aim[ed] a blow" at Young, the same would be "numbered with the dead."31

As Young spoke in this bellicose tone, he equated the Indians with evil and added that faith and prayers would "do a great deal of good to these wretched remnants of Abraham," but to do so they [the saints] must "have the faith to bind satan."32 Young also used the Indian problem to promote obedience among the saints to his counsel. In 1853, he bore his testimony on the subject of Indian difficulties and claimed that "like all other providences of the Lord," these problems had been "calculated" to "chasten this people until they are willing to take counsel."33 In fact, Young maintained that:

There will always be Indians or somebody else to chastise you, until you come to that spot; so amen to the present Indian trouble, for it


30Ibid.

31Ibid.

32Ibid.

33Ibid., 162.
is all right. I am just as willing the rebellious of this people should be kicked, and cuffed, and mobbed, and hunted by Indians, as not, for I have preached to them until I am tired. 34

Young claimed that the Mormons "need[ed] a devil" to "purify the saints." 35 By portraying the Shoshones as evil, he provided an outlet for superstition, intolerance, fear, and the sense of dislocation many felt in their new environment. Additionally, Young martialled the support of the saints to his rule by portraying the Shoshones as a common enemy to unite his followers. Shoshones would "either bow down" to Mormon will "or be slain." 36

By 1855, two years after their victory over the Utes led by Walker, Young and other church leaders began to tone down their Indian policy. Possibly, this reflected a growing sense of security felt by Mormons in their mountain stronghold just prior to the Utah War of 1857-58 (during which the federal government challenged the right of Young to govern the territory of Utah). In 1855, Joseph Young, a church leader, spoke to the members about a vision he had received in which the Indians "were

34 Ibid., 169.
35 Ibid., 170.
36 Ibid., 171.
all passive and filled with the Holy Spirit."  

Joseph Young spoke of his desire to see the Indians "learn the arts and habits of civilization . . . learn the truth . . ." and become "a white and delightful people."  

Orson Pratt, another church leader, preached that rather than driving the Indians from them, the saints should "cultivate their friendship."  

Pratt continued by stating that the saints should "instruct them" so that they could "learn what God intends to do for them," and "bring them to a knowledge of the truth."  

Indeed, Pratt also alluded to the magnitude of further Mormon expansion by suggesting that after the Shoshones learned the Gospel, "then will be the time to go and convert those [Indians] in South America."  

The tone of church policy makers changed so much that by 1857 Brigham Young claimed that as a result of the Mormon influence in the Great Basin, "there is not a tribe so enlightened, nor one that has so good a knowledge of its . . . standing with the Lord as have

---


38 Ibid., 231.

39 Ibid., 177.

40 Ibid., 176.

41 Ibid., 178.
some of these Utah Indians."\(^2\)

Church leader Daniel Spencer echoed Young's sentiments when he stated to a congregation that the "Indians are beginning to learn that it is best to make some little sacrifice to get clothing and food; and they are improving in this day by day."\(^3\)

The articulated Mormon Indian policy changed again, however, in the wake of the Utah War. The federal government began making its presence known as a new governor and superintendent of Indian affairs entered Salt Lake City. Additionally, settlers began moving into isolated Cache Valley. The uncertainty of the new political situation, along with the hostile reaction of Cache Valley Shoshones to Mormon encroachment on their lands, partially explains a return to harsh policy.

Cache Valley during the early settlement era of 1859 to 1863 became the stage for nearly constant hostile relations between the Shoshones and Mormon settlers.\(^4\) On 9 June 1860, Young addressed the town of Richmond, a few


\(^3\) Brigham Young et al., Journal of Discourses, vol VI, reported by G. D. Watt, J. V. Long et al. (London: Latter-day Saints Book Depot, 1859), 216.

\(^4\) For an excellent narrative of the Cache Valley Shoshones during the years of Mormon settlement see Madsen, "The Northwestern Shoshone," 28-44.
miles north of present Logan, Utah. In his address, Young stated that "the Indians are wicked and ignorant; they are taught to steal, and to kill each other and the whites . . ." Speaking at Franklin, just north of Richmond, that same day, Young added that the Indians' fathers "before [them] taught their children to steal—it is in their blood, bone and flesh." He further advised the settlers to "stop the stealing" in Cache Valley, presumably by whatever methods were deemed necessary and appropriate.

On 23 July 1860, about a month and a half after Young's speaking tour of the valley, the Shoshones forced the settlers to act. The settlers caught a Shoshone chief stealing a horse, arrested him, and placed him under armed guard in a Smithfield house. Shortly after, several Shoshones rode up and convinced their chief to attempt an escape. This proved fatal for the prisoner as the settlers shot him dead when he tried to run. A skirmish ensued and the settlers pursued the fleeing Shoshones. In the end, the Shoshones killed two settlers and wounded three others. This incident heightened the
already building tensions in Cache Valley between the Shoshones and settlers.48

By 1866, Cache Valley Shoshones continued, albeit to a lesser degree and effect, to initiate hostile actions. Meanwhile, Mormons strengthened their control of Cache Valley and other areas in the intermountain West. Ezra T. Benson reorganized the Cache Militia in 1866. The officers of each settlement were "instructed to cause every white male resident between 18 and 45 years of age to be immediately enrolled in some company . . . ."49 These companies drilled once a week and participated in several general musters of the Cache Valley Militia to practice maneuvers and engage in war games. In addition to these units, Benson organized "companies of Silver-Greys" comprised of men over the age of forty-five.50 The militia also built a military corral in Millville in the southern end of the valley for the protection of the


settler's herds. Other military preparations included a warning system using color-coded flags, and a mounted guard to "patrol and watch" day and night. 51

The tone of Mormon policy makers again shifted to reflect the exigencies of the present situation. In reaction to the weakening Shoshone resistance, Young pleaded with his people to "treat the Indians with kindness, and refrain from harboring that revengeful, vindictive feeling that many indulge in." 52 He referred to the Indians as "that poor, down-trodden branch of the house of Israel," 53 and condemned a man who confessed to killing an innocent Indian, as being "as much a murderer . . . as he would have been had he shot down a white man." 54 He continued by instructing the saints that they were "not intruders" on Indian lands, but were there "by

51 E. T. Benson, Brigadier General, Cache Military District, Order no. 6, 10 July 1866, Territorial Militia Records; 14 July 1866, Journal of Cache Military District; Judging by the Journal of the Cache Military District, the leaders took the formation and drilling of the militia very seriously. The male settlers, according to Peter Maughan, "without regard to age are in duty bound to help defend the Kingdom of God and perform military duty, and such as will not, let them be disfellowshipped and fined." 23 June 1866 Journal of Cache Military District.

52 Young, Journal of Discourses, vol. IX, 263.

53 Ibid.

54 Ibid.
the providence of God."\textsuperscript{55} One of the reasons for coming to Utah was to "win their [Indian] hearts" and convert them; "it is not our duty to kill them; but it is our duty to save their lives ...."\textsuperscript{56}

In 1871, Young addressed the saints in Salt Lake City and put a capstone on Mormon Indian policy when he desired to give the federal government advice on how to handle the Indian question in the West.

I will say to our government if they could hear me, "You need never fight the Indians, but if you want to get rid of them try to civilize them." We brought their children into our families, and nursed and did everything for them it was possible to do for human beings, but die they would. Do not fight them, but treat them kindly. There will then be no stain on the Government, and it will get rid of them much quicker than by fighting them. They have got to be civilized, and there will be a remnant of them saved. I have said enough on this subject.\textsuperscript{57}

The Cache Valley Shoshones, still adapting to the end of the fur trade era, found themselves confronted by a large, well-organized, and loyal religious group. These European-American settlers wanted not only Shoshone land, but souls as well, for the glory of an alien God. Unlike the transient fur trappers--who sought only

\textsuperscript{55}Ibid., 264.

\textsuperscript{56}Ibid.

\textsuperscript{57}Brigham Young et al., \textit{Journal of Discourses}, vol. XIV, reported by D. W. Evans et al. (London: Latter-day Saints Book Depot, 1872), 87.
specific resources of the valley rather than the land itself and were ambivalent about Shoshone beliefs, culture, and lifestyle--the Mormons desired the land for permanent settlement, and looked with distaste at the way the "degraded" Indians lived. The conflict that arose between the two groups centered not only on the land, but also on the differences in cultures. Of course, for the Shoshones, their culture was strongly tied to their hunter-gatherer mode of subsistence.

The Cache Valley Shoshones concerned themselves primarily with the maintenance of their hunting-gathering lifestyle, and adopted any means necessary to do so. One of the most basic measures incorporated by the Shoshones was to remain flexible and opportunistic. This included commandeering unguarded property of the settlers, attempts at diplomacy to engender peaceful trade relations, outright demands of tribute from emigrants and settlers, and the use of threats, intimidation, and violence.

During the emigration of 1849, a wagon train of gold-seekers travelling through Shoshone country on their way to California shot two Shoshone women for no apparent reason. The Shoshones, from that time, "manifested a very different disposition from what they had heretofore
done." According to a September 1850 report, the Cache Valley Shoshones began committing depredations—"pasturing horses in grain fields, abstracting from melon patches, running off cattle and horses"—along the northern settlements from Salt Lake City to Brigham City. These offensives probably represented some of the first occurrences of Cache Valley Shoshones integrating new resources, available as a result of the Mormon presence, into their hunting and gathering pattern. Possibly, they raided the northern Mormon settlements prior to their return to the fall fishing grounds on the Salmon River of present Idaho.

The Cache Valley Shoshones demonstrated that they would take advantage of new resources while in their winter camps as well. On 6 January 1850, Lieutenant Stephen Russell, of Fort Hall, reported that "hostile" Shoshones "are killing cattle" pastured for the winter in Cache Valley. The Cache Valley Shoshones again made a winter encampment cattle hunt in 1856, when they benefitted from the Mormon herds pastured on the Elkhorn Ranch in southern Cache Valley. In March, two winters

58 LDS, Journal History, reel 200, no. 10.
59 Ibid.
60 Madsen, Exploring the Great Salt Lake, 264.
61 Arrington, Great Basin Kingdom, 151.
later, the Shoshones requisitioned 1,500 bushels of wheat left behind by Cache Valley settlers hastening back to Salt Lake City in the face of federal troops.62

These "notorious" actions taken by the Shoshones during the early years of Mormon settlement in the Great Basin tend to obscure the full spectrum of the relationship between the two groups. The complex interaction between the Shoshones and Mormons went beyond hostile encounters. As with the relationship the Shoshones had with the fur trappers a few decades earlier, trade emerged as an important bridge across the cultural gap.

In 1852, five Shoshone chiefs, accompanied by twenty-six lodges, travelled to Salt Lake City to inquire about possible trade relations with the Mormons. Led by the powerful Washakie—who had influence among the Northwestern bands—this delegation probably included representatives of the Cache Valley Shoshones, or other Northwestern bands. This suggests that Shoshones actively sought a connection to the Mormons and their trade potential. Shoshones desired the same kind of goods from the Mormons as they had from the trappers a

62Mary Maughan states this number to be 15,000 but Ricks' number of 1,500 seems more likely. Carter, "Journal of Mary Ann Weston Maughan," 386; Ricks, "First Settlements," 37.
few decades earlier. Items such as blankets, buttons, beads, mirrors, and guns and ammunition remained the staple items. However, the settlers produced and therefore could supply certain items that fur traders could only occasionally offer. Foodstuffs, especially flour and corn, emerged as an important supplement to traditional Shoshone diets. These dietary supplements of agriculture did not require Shoshones to give up their migratory patterns. Indeed, Shoshones of Cache Valley actually incorporated the "gathering" of these supplies from settlers into their seasonal cycle.63

According to Emma Liljenquist, a Cache Valley settler, when Shoshones were present in the valley, they "would wander from door to door trading or swapping as they would say, their beads for flour, sugar, bread, or molasses which they liked very much."64 Shoshones also hunted and gathered traditional items, such as fish, furs, or chokecherries to trade for nontraditional food


items such as corn. They also, according to Cache Valley settler Laurine Liljenquist "tame[d] wild horses for the White people, then they took some wheat or corn for pay."\(^5\) As late as 1869, when Cache Valley Shoshones had been all but removed from the valley, they continued on a smaller scale to supply the demand for furs and skins that the settlers used "for manufacturing."\(^6\) These Shoshone hunters produced an estimated "nine thousand dollars" in furs during 1869, and received "much higher prices for them than in any other part of the country . . . ."\(^7\)

Perhaps these high prices received by Shoshones came from the traditional trade abilities of this group. The emigrants on the overland trail echoed the sentiments of the fur traders when they stated that the "Indians were not easy marks in the bargaining process."\(^8\) Overlander Finley McDiarmid "found the snake Indians to be 'very sharp traders not easily cheated.'"\(^9\)

\(^5\)Ibid., 37, 41-42.

\(^6\)Head, Superintendent of Indian Affairs, to Parker, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 1 August 1869, in Morgan, "Washakie and the Shoshoni," \textit{Annals of Wyoming} 30 (April 1958): 89.

\(^7\)Ibid.

\(^8\)Unruh, \textit{The Plains Across}, 162.

\(^9\)Ibid.
Although trade relations provided Cache Valley Shoshones with an opportunity to actively participate in the European-American market economy, often to their benefit, their trade with settlers caused some friction. The army, an arm of federal authority in Utah Territory, suspected the Mormons of inciting the Shoshones to depredation on the overland trails and then trading and trafficking in the stolen goods. According to Henry Ballard, an early settler of Logan, Utah, the army issued an ultimatum in 1860 by "declaring vengeance against any person trading with or feeding any Indian in Cache Valley." 70

Cache Valley Shoshones seemed to rub the settlers the wrong way occasionally as well. For years Shoshones had demanded tribute from the emigrants passing through their territory for the fodder, meat, water, and timber emigrants used as they travelled. 71 Jacob Holeman offered an explanation in 1854 for the Shoshone reasoning for the demand of tribute. He wrote that "having resided in the territory, of Utah, as Indian Agent, since 1851 . . . I have no hesitation in stating, that within the boundary

70 Joel E. Ricks, "Some recollections relating to the early pioneer life of Logan City and Cache County," TMs, File MS no. 389, p. 26, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT.

of the territory . . . the Indians claim all the land."\(^{72}\) As resources grew scarce, Cache Valley Shoshones began to demand tribute from the settlers of the valley for occupation and use of Shoshone land and resources, because the settlers had "not paid them for these things."\(^{73}\) As a result, the Shoshones of Cache Valley began "annoying" the settlers who viewed these tribute payments as a one-sided agreement.\(^{74}\) However much the settlers resented the Shoshone demands, they usually consented to them to avoid violence.

Shoshones expected and grew accustomed to receiving presents from the travelers and settlers in the region. Young wrote that this practice had "emboldened" the Shoshones.\(^{75}\) Mary Ann Weston Maughan, one of the first

\(^{72}\) Jacob Holeman to Maypenny, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 7 March 1854, in Morgan, "Washakie and the Shoshoni," Annals of Wyoming 26 (July 1954): 152.

\(^{73}\) Madsen, Chief Pocatello, 34; see also Holeman, Indian Agent, to Lea, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 29 March 1852, in Dale E. Morgan, ed., Washakie and the Shoshoni: A Selection of Documents from the Records of the Utah Superintendency of Indian Affairs," Annals of Wyoming 25 (July 1953): 183.


\(^{75}\) Young, Superintendent of Indian Affairs, to James W. Denver, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, in Dale E. Morgan, ed., "Washakie and the Shoshoni: A Selection of
settlers in Cache Valley, wrote that in the first years of settlement, they lived "in constant dread of the Indians."\textsuperscript{76} John F. Wright, another early settler, echoed Maughan's sentiments when he wrote, "we were in danger from the Indians nearly all of the time. . . ."\textsuperscript{77}

Early Cache Valley journals reveal a pattern of fear amongst the settlers concerning the Shoshones. The following episode from Joseph Campbell helps explain the tactics of intimidation used by many Cache Valley Shoshones to obtain food:

During the Summer of 1863, an Indian came to our house and demanded something to eat, Mother gave him a piece of bread, but he wanted meat. Mother told him she had no meat, but gave him a pitcher of milk, he flew into a rage threw the pitcher of milk on the floor, and acted like he would murder all of us. All of the men were away in the fields, and there was no one near that we could call to for help. I think the Indian knew that, Mother was badly frightened and grabbed sister and rushed out of the house screaming for help.\textsuperscript{78}

According to the territorial Indian officials, Shoshones felt their actions not only "justifiable[,] but their

\textsuperscript{76}Carter, "Journal of Mary Ann Weston Maughan," 385.

\textsuperscript{77}Ricks, "Some recollections," 13.

\textsuperscript{78}Ibid., 61.
only alternative." This judgment stemmed from the commissioner's observations that there "is very little game in this territory," and Shoshones "have been, in great numbers, in a starving and destitute condition." F. Book, an Overland Mail agent in Salt Lake City, underscored the commissioner's opinion, adding a sense of urgency and concern for employees, when he sent a telegram stating that "Indians by hundreds at several stations, clamoring for food and threatening, they will steal or starve, will they starve?"

Cache Valley Shoshones, hungry and forced from their land, took the offensive and practically besieged the Mormon intruders. This action taken by Shoshones,

---

79 Governor A. Cumming et al., to Greenwood, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 1 November 1860, in Morgan, "Washakie and the Shoshoni," Annals of Wyoming 27 (October 1955): 208.


81 Book's telegram was reproduced in a letter from A. J. [Benton], Office of the Overland Mail Company, to William Latham, U. S. Senate, 19 December 1861 National Archives Microfilm Publications, Microcopy no. 234, Letters Received by the Office of Indian Affairs 1824-81, Roll 900, Utah Superintendency, 1849-1880, Washington, DC, 1957, Utah Reel 83, Pt. 4, 1860-1862, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT.
according to the historian Leonard Arrington, became the "most immediate economic problem of the Cache Valley settlers."\(^{82}\) The success of the Shoshone offensive can be measured in the official response of European-American leaders in Utah Territory, and in the local efforts of Cache Valley settlers to avoid conflict. Governor Alfred Cumming called for the relief of the settlers "from the burden of feeding the Indians."\(^{83}\) Young ordered the formation of a militia in the valley, and told the settlers to "be firm in protecting their rights."\(^{84}\)

The first few years of settlement in Cache Valley provided many opportunities for the Shoshones to benefit from the Mormons' time of weakness. Although the Shoshones could not force the intruders from the valley, they demonstrated that they would harass the settlers and demand tribute whenever they held the advantage. The Deseret News on 6 February 1861 recounted the provisioning of "a large number of "Shoshones with "two


\(^{83}\) LDS, *Journal History*, reel 200, no. 18.

\(^{84}\) Olson, *The History of Smithfield*, 16.
beeeves and a quantity of flour."\textsuperscript{85} Apparently, this food did not satisfy the hungry Shoshones and "another demand was made."\textsuperscript{86} The writer bluntly stated that "what they [the Shoshones] wanted had to be forthcoming, or they would help themselves."\textsuperscript{87}

Margaret Ballard, an early settler, stated that in the summer of 1862, they "had a great deal of trouble with the Indians."\textsuperscript{88} She lamented the treatment they received from these natives who would "ride their horses into the houses, and tramp the gardens to pieces."\textsuperscript{89} The Shoshones also damaged the fields, stole horses and cattle, but the most interesting item from Ballard's reminiscence was her account of how "we would always keep a good supply of bread on hand so that we could feed the

\textsuperscript{85}"Late From Cache County," Deseret News, 6 February 1861, 385; On Sunday, 28 September 1862, the Shoshones stole thirty horses from the settlers in Logan. The militia pursued and retrieved eighteen horses, but not until after a grueling four days pursuit without food. The Shoshones were kept apprised of the militia's movements by Chief Bear Hunter, who remained in Hyde Park, north of Logan, during the pursuit. J. H. Martineau, "The Military History of Cache Valley," Territorial Militia Records, 1849-1877, Series 2210, Reel 28, Box 1, Fld. 93, pp. 3-4, Utah State Archives, Salt Lake City, UT.

\textsuperscript{86}Ibid.

\textsuperscript{87}Ibid.

\textsuperscript{88}Ricks, "Some recollections," 17.

\textsuperscript{89}Ibid.
Indians and they would be more friendly to us."  

Peaceful or hostile, Cache Valley Shoshones took advantage of every opportunity the settlers gave them to obtain food, horses, or goods. This adaptation to the encroachment of settlers fit in nicely to the traditional Shoshone hunter-gatherer migratory patterns that exploited local seasonal abundance over a wide-ranging territory.  

Shoshones migrated to wherever they could obtain food, locating their campsites—with the exception

---

90 Ibid.  

91 According to Shoshone oral history the Annual Cache Valley Shoshone migration patterns were as follows: "In the early fall the Northwesterns moved into the general area of Salmon, Idaho, to fish. After the fishing was over and the fish had been prepared for winter use, they moved into Wyoming to hunt buffalo, elk, moose and antelope. It was very important to get the big game for it meant food, clothing and shelter to them. In the spring and summer most of their time was spent traveling about Utah. Here they gathered seeds, berries, roots and also hunted smaller game. In late October a move was made into western Utah and parts of Nevada for the gathering of pine nuts. Most of the food was gathered and dried for their winter camping site, an area near Franklin, Idaho." In, Parry, "Massacre at Boa Ogol," 231; In 1841, Father De Smet encountered a group of Shoshones on their way to Bear River, presumably for winter camp, he described the following: "Represent to yourself a band of wretched horses, disproportionate in all their outlines, loaded with bags and boxes to a height equal their own...and you will have an idea of the scene we witnessed. One of these animals, scarcely four feet high, had for its load four large sacks of dried meat, two on each side, above which were tied several other objects, terminating in a kind of platform on the back of the living beast; and on the summit of the whole construction, at a dangerous elevation, was seated cross-legged on a bear skin a very old person smoking his calumet." In, Chittenden, Life, Letters, and Travels, 301-02.
of semi-permanent winter camps—in areas of plenty. They continued this mobile lifestyle—to the chagrin of Mormons, gentiles, and government officials—until by the early 1870s it proved to provide adequate subsistence no longer.92

The settlers continually yielded to Shoshone demands, but apparently their donations did not assuage the hunger of the Shoshones. The Indian superintendent's reports during the 1860s repeatedly stated that the Indians "have been, in great numbers, in a starving and destitute condition."93 Perhaps this is why the Shoshones of Cache Valley began making "regular visits" to the settlements of the valley.94 John F. Wright, an early settler of Paradise, Utah, wrote that they "were in constant danger . . . as the trail by which they travelled from the east to the west, passed through the canyon" near the town of Paradise.95 Again, this suggests that Shoshones continued to travel their regular routes

94Arrington, "Life and Labor among the Pioneers," 144.
and kept to their seasonal migration patterns.

Further evidence of continued seasonal patterns can be seen in the following examples. During April 1862, the Shoshones began entering the northern settlements "demanding food and clothing." After re-provisioning, "most" of the Shoshones left "for their summer hunting grounds" by July. However, before they left, they informed their Mormon "friends" that they would "see us again at harvest." Sagwitch, a Cache Valley Shoshone leader, actually stored sacks of gathered food, such as dried chokecherries and dried serviceberries, in the cellar of the Liljenquist home. Sagwitch would bring the sacks in each autumn, and return in the spring when the winter supplies began to dwindle.

The Cache Valley settlers sought ways to alleviate and spread the burden forced on them by the Shoshones. In addition to the protection offered by the militia, the settlers turned inward to their church institution, the tithing house, to organize their efforts. The bishops of

96 Frank Fuller, acting Governor of Utah, to Edwin M. Stanton, Secretary of War, 11 April 1862, House Documents, 3rd session, 37th congress no. 1, Report of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs in, Report of the Secretary of the Interior, 356.

97 "From Cache County," Deseret News, 16 July 1862, 24; Madsen, Shoshone Frontier, 153.

98 Allen, Home in the Hills of Bridgerland, 41.
Cache Valley became the local Indian agents in charge of disbursement in their respective communities. For the men of the Cache Valley settlements to feel secure when they went to their fields or to the canyons, "it was necessary to pacify the Indians while they were away." It became the bishops' duty "to wait upon the Indians at their pleasure" while the men of the settlements were absent. When "large" numbers of Indians came into Logan in the spring of 1861, "the Bishop [of Logan] called upon the Bishops of the wards, to collect provisions" to supply the Shoshones.

Shoshones incorporated this new means of subsistence into their migratory pattern. They began to make regular "pilgrimages" to "obtain food from the tithing office." The tithing office in Cache Valley expended an average of over $600 annually, between 1863 and 1888, to the Shoshones. The settlers located the tithing offices in the center of town, with "a few head of cattle" in the

---

99 Ibid., 25.
100 Ibid.
101 Ricks, "Some recollections," 29.
103 Ibid., 44.
tithing yard "for emergency."  

Surviving tithing records, although incomplete, offer more evidence that Shoshones actively adapted to the exigencies of Mormon settlement on their lands. The Logan tithing office records for 1864-65 provide the most complete look at Shoshone use of these disbursements. In April 1864, Sagwitch received 104 pounds of flour from the Logan office. He returned in October and November 1864, and received 116 pounds of beef, five bushels of wheat, six bushels of corn, fifteen bushels of potatoes, and fifteen bushels of carrots. The following year, 1865, Sagwitch repeated his cyclical pattern. Once again he came in during the spring, receiving flour, potatoes, bacon, and corn. The records of the fall of 1865, which end on 7 November, are not as complete because they lack names of some recipients of disbursements. Consequently, whether Sagwitch returned that fall remains unclear.  

In addition, the Cache Valley tithing records revealed that other Northwestern Shoshone groups from outside of Cache Valley, and even eastern Shoshone groups from the Fort Bridger area, began making "regular visits

---

104 Allen, Home in the Hills Of Bridgerland, 38.

to the tithing office in Logan. Weber Jack, based in the Weber Valley southwest of Cache Valley, came to the Logan tithing office in April of 1864, and returned in May of 1865. Indian George, possibly from Malad or Weber Valleys, showed up at the Logan office in May 1864 and 1865. Washakie, of the eastern bands, came to Logan in the fall of 1864, to take advantage of the tithing office food source.

The constant concern of the settlers that they have food on hand for disbursement must, as Arrington hinted at, have been burdensome financially. The Richmond Indian Donation book offers a rough estimate of the partial cost of peace in Cache Valley. During 1861, the citizens of Richmond donated 82.5 bushels of wheat to the Shoshones. While records for the 1861 harvest totals do not exist, the 1860 agriculture census can be used to suggest possible numbers. The total wheat production for Richmond during 1860 is listed at 2,217 bushels. Using the 1860 and 1861 totals, the Indian donation for Richmond represented roughly four percent of their total wheat production. Theoretically, Mormons paid a ten percent tithe on all that they produced. The additional

106 Ibid.
cost of approximately four percent given to the Shoshones represented a significant financial strain.\textsuperscript{108}

Cache Valley Shoshones were more than willing to play the role of an economic burden. They continued to supplement their traditional subsistence base with several adaptations at the settlers' cost. They also persistently balked at attempts to make them abandon their culturally based migratory patterns. Despite the defeat by Connor and the efforts of a revitalized militia, the Shoshones continued to harass the settlements. In February 1867, the residents of the northern settlements of Cache Valley, Clarkston, Weston, and Oxford, "abandoned those places, seeking temporary homes in Franklin, Richmond and Smithfield."\textsuperscript{109}

Although the Shoshones remained defiant, the Bear River engagement accomplished two things. First, it took a great toll on Cache Valley Shoshones. Bear Hunter died

\textsuperscript{108}Using the same documents and numbers on an individual basis reveals even higher donation/production percentages in the case of Jno. Bair (.095\% of total wheat production donated) and Thos. Tidwell (.066\% of total wheat production donated). Richmond Indian Donation Book, pp. 1-2, James Hendricks Daughters of the Utah Pioneers Relic Hall, Richmond, UT; 8th United States Census, Utah, 1860 Agriculture Schedule 4, Productions of Agriculture (microfilm), Charles M. Hatch transcription, 1860 Utah Agricultural Schedule, pp. 16-18, in possession of author.

in the battle and only seven of his group survived. Sagwitch escaped, but "his band was nearly exterminated." In the years following the deaths of most of the Cache Valley Shoshones, more settlers entered the valley. As the Shoshones grew weaker, the European-American settlements grew stronger. The formation of the Cache Valley militia, which swelled with reinforcements taken from the ranks of newly arrived settlers, began to have an impact on the ability of the Shoshones to exact tribute from the settlers.

Second, the Bear River engagement signaled the beginning of a larger involvement of the federal government in the affairs of the Cache Valley Shoshones. Once again, the relationship between the Shoshones and the government demonstrated the active approach taken by the Shoshones to maintain their traditional lifestyle.

Brigham Young controlled the Utah Office of Indian Affairs prior to the Utah War. Until that time, the policies of the Utah Office of Indian Affairs tended to accommodate the building of Zion rather than address the needs of the territory's native population. At first appearance, a change of Indian office personnel to non-

---

Mormon agents would be an improvement for Shoshones. However, with the 1858 ascension of non-Mormons--Governor Alfred Cumming and his new Indian Superintendent, Jacob Forney--Cache Valley Shoshones did not notice an appreciable change in their favor.

Although the federal government placed its own agents in office in Utah Territory, these appointees lacked any meaningful authority. They could only report on the situation and make requests through proper channels of the federal bureaucracy. All their suggestions hinged on the politics of Washington, D.C. The executive and legislative branches of government did little "to contribute to the betterment of Indian relations." During the mid-1850s, the government--forced to action as a result of the rapid emigration in the West--negotiated fifty-three treaties to extinguish Indian title to lands. Despite the clear need for intervention as a result of heavy emigration through the Great Basin, none of these treaties involved the native groups in Utah Territory.

Charges of corruption and mismanagement of Indian affairs nationwide were rampant, and civil strife in the

---


112 Ibid., 44.
East caused further disorganization. Even the cessation of hostilities between the Union and the Confederacy did not remedy the terrible inadequacies in the agency. In Utah, the Indian agents played a game of words with Brigham Young, each accusing the other of ignorance and incompetence. The agents accused the Mormons of "tampering with the Indians," while Young claimed that the settlers had been left with the burden of feeding the Indians. Both the agents and Young repeatedly pleaded with Washington to make a treaty and extinguish title to Indian lands.

Finally in 1863, the Treaty of Box Elder provided annuities for Cache Valley Shoshones. Yet, the treaty did not set aside land for Cache Valley Shoshones, who once again adapted to a new situation by incorporating change into their traditional migratory patterns. During the years following the treaty, Northwestern Shoshone bands began to add Brigham City, cite of the annual government disbursement in the late fall, to their regular migration pattern.¹¹³ Cache Valley Shoshones continued to make use of the Logan tithing house and

settlers for subsistence, as well as Brigham City.\textsuperscript{114} J. C. Wright of Brigham City wrote this description of the Shoshone migration to Brigham City for annuities:

About twenty-five or thirty days previous to pay day the Indians get the word that the agent would be on hand in Brigham City in 20 or 30 sleeps to issue presents. In a few days 500 or 600 arrive, pitch their lodges as near the fields of grain, potatoes and melon patches as they can, and then commence their business of begging and stealing.\textsuperscript{115}

Wright lamented that it would be cheaper "for the people of this county to pay the Indians $5000 out of our own pockets," than to put up with the annoyance of the Shoshones at disbursement time.\textsuperscript{116}

Shoshones continued their hunting-gathering existence spending seven to eight months a year "scattered along the Bear River and through Cache and Bear Lake Valleys . . . and the balance of their time in Southern Idaho."\textsuperscript{117} However, by 1869, Cache Valley Shoshones, along with other groups of Northwestern Shoshones, began to demonstrate a willingness to "till

\textsuperscript{114}Arrington, "The Mormon Tithing House," 42.

\textsuperscript{115}LDS, Journal History, Reel 200, no. 24.

\textsuperscript{116}Ibid.

\textsuperscript{117}Head, Superintendent of Indian Affairs, to N. G. Taylor, Commissioner of Indian Affairs, 25 July 1867, in Morgan, "Washakie and the Shoshoni," Annals of Wyoming 30 (April 1958): 56.
the soil if assisted by the government."\textsuperscript{118} Clearly, this willingness to farm, which further eroded their traditional lifestyle, indicated that they could no longer survive in the region due to the loss of their resource base to European-American encroachment.\textsuperscript{119}

The remnants of Sagwitch's band after the first attempts to farm at Franklin and Bear River City, eventually retreated to the Mormon church farm in Washakie Town, just west of Cache Valley. Other Northwestern groups such as Pocatello's, who migrated between Fort Hall, the railroad town of Corinne, and Brigham City, ended up permanently on the Fort Hall Reservation. Occasionally, small groups of Shoshones still asked for assistance from the bishops of Cache Valley, but with the removal of Northwestern Shoshones to Fort Hall or the Mormon Church farms, the majority of Cache Valley Shoshones no longer lived or migrated through their traditional home.\textsuperscript{120}


\textsuperscript{119}Additionally, a smallpox outbreak in the northern end of Cache Valley during 1870, further weakened the Shoshone ability to remain independent. Madsen, "The Northwestern Shoshoni," 36-37.

\textsuperscript{120}A few Northwestern Shoshones, with the assistance of George Hill filed for homesteads near the Bear River City farm. See Hunsaker, "Indian Town," and Kenneth Dean
Cache Valley Shoshones resisted change to their traditional migratory patterns for as long as they could. In the face of European-American ethnocentrism manifested in efforts to subdue both the land and culture, Cache Valley Shoshones adopted strategies to take advantage of every opportunity given them. They took government and Mormon cattle pastured in the valley on the years before settlement. They used diplomacy to effect peace and trade relations. When the Mormon settlers began to encroach on Shoshone land in Cache Valley, Shoshones demanded compensation in the form of tribute. The use of intimidation emerged as a tool of negotiation that the Shoshones felt justified in incorporating. They used the fear that they engendered to aid them in their trade relations. They traded goods taken from the Overland emigrants as well as traditional goods they hunted and gathered.

An important aspect of their adaptation concerned the incorporation of tithing house disbursements into their hunting-gathering migratory patterns. Clearly, from the Cache Valley settlers' point of view, the individual and collective economic drain of the Shoshones

Hunsaker, "Feeding the Indians of Northern Utah," unpublished paper, PAM C, 245, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University of Utah, Logan, UT.
meant that it was no longer "cheaper to feed than fight" the Shoshones. The financial burden and hostile actions of the Shoshones in Cache Valley led finally to the grim action at Bear River. Yet even after this defeat, the Shoshones continued to extract a large percentage of the settlers' production. Additionally, the Treaty of Box Elder provided Shoshones with another opportunity to adapt. They added yet another "stop" in their subsistence cycle to receive annuities.

In the last years before settlement on the church farm or Fort Hall Reservation, Cache Valley Shoshones continued to hunt-gather and receive annuities. Finally, their homelands and resource base failed. Many were reduced to rummaging in the refuse of towns like Corinne for food. Despair led to increased abuse of alcohol and the further erosion of their resolve to resist. The Shoshones found themselves forced to accept that they could no longer adapt, and they submitted to European-American oversight. ¹²¹

¹²¹ Madsen, Northern Shoshoni, 90.
. . . the government should paying Indians so much each year. Well we haven't pay for yet. But our people was looking for this payments. I was understande in the treaty when my people coming country of yours we must play your game and so on. It seem to me the government done some crook work among our American Indians so on.'

During the decades following the dispossession of the Cache Valley Shoshones from their traditional lands, they continued to fight the European Americans. These skirmishes, which took place in the local newspapers and courts of Utah, revealed an unbroken path of Shoshone activism as they struggled to maintain their culture, hunting rights, and just compensation for broken treaties. The above quote from Washakie Town Shoshone Willie Ottogary demonstrated that this band understood the workings of the federal bureaucracy and would not cease struggling for their culture.

The battle that Washakie Town Shoshones initiated concerned the fact that the Treaty of Box Elder of 1863

---

failed to create a reservation for Northwestern Shoshones. The government granted reservations to the northern, western, and eastern Shoshone bands. On 10 May 1877, the government set aside 521 acres of land in northern Nevada to address this problem. However, this small allotment failed to appease the Northwestern Shoshones, who refused to accept it. President Hayes "withdrew" the executive order on 16 January 1879.²

Willie Ottogary renewed the fight for redress of the government neglect of Northwestern Shoshone rights. During 1919, Ottogary and other Shoshones hired an attorney in Washington, D.C. to "beat the Government [by using] our treaties and claim[s] here in northern Utah."³ Nearly ten years later, "the House Committee on Indian Affairs recommended that the Court of Claims be granted jurisdiction in the case."⁴ By 1931, the Northwestern Shoshone lands claim case grew to include the claims of other Shoshone bands.⁵ Ottogary, who died in 1929, never saw the results of the case he helped initiate. The

²Madsen, Northern Shoshoni, 102.
³Edlefsen, Willie Ottogary's Letters, 8.
⁴Madsen, Northern Shoshoni, 102.
⁵The case involved seventy-three million acres, and the Northwestern Shoshone contention that the government had paid them only $2,000 of the promised 20 year annuity of $5,000. Madsen, Northern Shoshoni, 104.
final settlement did not come until 1971 when the courts awarded a judgment of $15,700,000 to the Shoshones. The Northwestern band received $1,193,268, with the balance divided among the other Shoshone groups. This case also marked the end of the Northwestern Shoshones "as a tribal entity." 6

During the early twentieth-century struggle for land, the former Cache Valley Shoshones maintained as much of their traditional culture and subsistence patterns as possible. Ottogary's newspaper articles offered a rich—but unfortunately brief—glimpse of life for the first generations living under government supervision. His regularly appearing "Washakie Letter" mentioned several annual rabbit hunts, the organization of a buffalo hunt with the Eastern Shoshones, communal berry gathering excursions, and dances. They also chronicled Ottogary's near constant travels to Shoshone reservations, farms, and towns in Idaho, Wyoming, Utah, Oregon, and Nevada, as he attempted to maintain an alliance and organization among the greater Shoshone cultural group. 7

Cache Valley Shoshones remained a source of friction for the European-American dominated mainstream society.

6 Ibid., 105.

7 Edlefsen, Willie Ottogary's Letters.
During 1926, a Shoshone trapper, Fern Elk, "... kill some deer. And he was under arrested by Game Warden Mr. Grover."\(^8\) The Shoshones contested this arrest, arguing that under the Treaty of 1863, "... the Indians can hunt any time the year. Because the game is belong to the Indians."\(^9\) According to Ottogary, the "judge say the [treaty] was pretty hard to beat. And the [judge] turn him loose."\(^10\) However, Madsen recounted an episode in 1922 when Ottogary and a partner were arrested for hunting out of season. Their claim to hunting privileges under the 1868 Fort Bridger Treaty apparently did not stand in court as "the commissioner instructed the two hunters to obey the game regulations of the State of Utah."\(^11\)

The remnants of the Cache Valley Shoshones continued to evolve and adapt as they entered the twentieth century. They persisted in their cultural tradition of initiating change and resisting European-American domination of their lives. This tradition began in the late seventeenth century when they acquired horses from the Spanish. When the fur trappers came, Cache Valley

---

\(^8\) Ibid., 64.
\(^9\) Ibid.
\(^10\) Ibid.
Shoshones took advantage of European-American markets and trade to increase their wealth, power, and numbers. The sudden demise of the fur trade followed by the advent of white emigration and settlement, though a severe blow, did not cause the Shoshones to submit to domination by another culture. During the process of dispossession from their lands, Cache Valley Shoshones went on the offensive, wreaking havoc on the farms, minds, and pocketbooks of Mormon settlers, church leaders, overlanders, and government officials. Finally, their lands taken and the environment taxed by European-American modes of production, Cache Valley Shoshones could no longer subsist as their ancestors had. They agreed to live under white rule on the Fort Hall Reservation or at Washakie Town, but refused to give up the spirit of their culture.

During the 1930s, the Shoshones, having endured decades of despair under forced acculturation programs, finally received a measured (federally supervised) autonomy. Indian Commissioner John Collier's Indian Reorganization Act of 1934 sought to "revitalize tribal organizations and community life among the Indians of the United States."\(^{12}\) This act provided for the establishment of a formal Shoshone council to govern affairs at Fort

\(^{12}\)Madsen, Northern Shoshoni, 226.
Hall. This signaled the beginning of a new era for Northwestern Shoshones as Fort Hall became increasingly important as a focus for Shoshone culture. During this era, Washakie Town's population began to shrink in numbers as it became a place of less importance for the descendants of the Cache Valley Shoshones.
Carter, Kate B., compiler. "Journal of Mary Ann Weston Maughan," TMs., D265, no. 203, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT.

Dowdle, John Clark. Journal, 1844-1908. TMs., 979.2, R426, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT.

Logan General Tithing Office Account Book, 1860-1870. Microfilm, CR 100 300, Reel 122, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints Archives, Salt Lake City, UT.


Richmond Indian Donation Book, John Hendricks Daughters of the Utah Pioneers Relic Hall, Richmond, UT.

Ricks, Joel E. "Some recollections relating to the early pioneer life of Logan City and Cache County." TMs., File MS no. 389, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT.


The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. Journal History. Reel 200, nos. 8-10, 18, 24, Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT.


Saints Book Depot, 1861.


Government Publications


8th United States Census, Utah, 1860 Agriculture Schedule 4, Productions of Agriculture (microfilm), Charles M. Hatch transcription, 1860 Utah Agricultural Schedule, in possession of author.

Newspapers


"From Cache County." *Deseret News*, XII, 16 July 1862, 24.

"From Cache County." *Deseret News*, XII, 12 November 1862, 156.

"Late From Cache County." *Deseret News*, X, 6 February 1861, 385.

"Late Indian Murders in Cache," *Deseret News*, X, 1 August 1860, 173.


Young, Brigham, "Remarks by President Brigham Young." *Deseret News*, X, 1 August 1860, 169-70.

SECONDARY

Books


______. "Hogup Cave." in *Anthropological Papers*, no 93, ed. Jesse D. Jennings, Charline G. Smith, and Norma


———. The Northern Shoshoni. With an Introduction by


Ricks, Joel E. "The First Settlements," in The History of


Tullidge, Edward W. Tullidge's Histories, Containing the History of All the Northern, Eastern, and Western Counties of Utah; Also the Counties of Southern Idaho. Vol. II. Salt Lake City: Juvenile Instructor Press, 1889.


Walker, Deward E., Jr. Indians of Idaho. Moscow:
University of Idaho Press, 1982.


Journals


Hardin, Garrett. "The Tragedy of the Commons." Science 13


---


---


---

**Theses**

Delisio, Mario P.. "The Natural and Cultural Stratigraphy of the Weston Canyon Rockshelter, Southeastern


Unpublished Papers

Hunsaker, Kenneth Dean. "Feeding the Indians of Northern Utah," PAM C, 245. Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT.

________. "Indian Town, Utah: A Pre-Washakie Settlement." PAM C, 194. Special Collections and Archives, Milton R. Merrill Library, Utah State University, Logan, UT.